MINUTES
HAMILTON LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee)
Thursday, November 22, 2007
12:00 p.m., Room 207
Hamilton Convention Centre
One Summer’s Lane

Present: A. Charlton (Chair), A. French (Vice-Chair), D. Dent (Past Chair) Councillors B. Bratina and M. Pearson, M. Adkins, P. Hartnett, M. Kirk, B. Manson, F. Thorp Neufeld, K. Wakeman, and S. Wray

Absent with Regrets: Councillor B. McHattie, vacation
L. Brown and A. Denham, work commitment
M. Stark

Also Present: D. Cuming, Acting Manager, Community Planning & Design
S. Vattay, Cultural Heritage Planner, Community Planning & Design
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner, Community Planning & Design
M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner, Community Planning & Design
C. Biggs, Legislative Assistant, Clerk’s Office

The meeting was called to order.

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

The Clerk noted the following changes to the agenda:

(a) Communication and Education Sub-Committee Minutes of November 4, 2007 added as Item 9.3. Copies have been distributed.
(b) Correspondence from Susan Ramsay, President of the Hamilton-Wentworth Heritage Association, dated October 26, 2007, seeking to increase membership added as Item 9.6(a). (Copies have been distributed.)

Bill Manson advised that Item 9.1 should read “Policy Sub-Committee”, not “Policy and Design Sub-Committee”.

(Manson/Wray)
That the agenda be approved, as amended. CARRIED

Chair Charlton advised the Committee that this was Michelle Stark’s last meeting, and publicly thanked her for her contributions to LACAC over the last 3 years, including her service on the various sub-committees of LACAC.

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None declared.

3. DELEGATION REQUESTS

None

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

Item 6(d) – Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton

Bill Manson advised that the Minutes be amended to indicate that the plaque is being replaced on the pole, not the exterior wall of the building.

Sylvia Wray requested that the October Minutes be amended to reflect her absence from the meeting as “Vacation”, not “Personal Business”. She also indicated that she did not receive the September Minutes of LACAC, and requested that they be sent to her.

(Manson/Hartnett)
That the Minutes of the October 25, 2007 meeting of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) be approved, as amended. CARRIED
5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)

(a) Communications Review Ad-hoc Sub-Committee (B. Manson – verbal, no copy)

Bill Manson advised the Committee that he sent an e-mail to all members of LACAC requesting volunteers to sit on the ad hoc Communications Review Committee. Responses have been received from all areas, with a representative from each. Response has not been received from staff as to staff representation. It is his intention to call a meeting of this committee as soon as possible in order to do some strategic planning; may be recommending SWOT analysis.

(Adkins/Dent)
That the verbal update be received. CARRIED

(b) Business Arising

With respect to Item 6(l), Diane Dent requested an update with respect to the establishment of a Visioning Committee. In the absence of Councillor McHattie, staff advised that they will check into this matter and report back.

With respect to Item 10(b), Minimum Property Standards for Designated Heritage Properties, Chair Charlton provided information from an e-mail sent from Councillor McHattie with the status of this issue.

6. Buildings and Landscapes:

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) Victoria Hall, 68 King Street East, Hamilton (NHS, D) – A. Denham
Sharon Vattay advised the Committee that applications for heritage permits for Victoria Hall have been received; however, did not receive all information required for the permits. The Heritage Review Sub-Committee has approved plans for a new shop front; waiting for information to proceed with heritage permit for windows, which are to be repaired rather than replaced. The last Heritage Permit will be for repairs to the metal façade. The owner has yet to submit application for that permit. Building Permit has been issued to work on the interior of the building.
Councillor Bratina advised that the building proponents met with a possible tenant for the ground floor.

Staff will possibly be arranging a tour of the building for the Heritage Permit Sub-Committee members with respect to the permit for the window repair.

(ii) **Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – Councillor B. McHattie**

Bill Manson inquired as to the security of the end portion of the building (at the alley end) which is boarded up. Staff advised that this would be under the jurisdiction of Property Standards.

(iii) **Lister Block, 28-40 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie**

Councillor Bratina provided an update to the Committee with respect to the status of the Lister Block and the term of the lease which the Province is seeking with the City, and the resulting additional cost.

(iv) **Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – B. Manson**

Bill Manson advised that the missing plaque was recovered in Fenlon Falls and has been returned and will be remounted.

Sharon Vattay reported that various technical and engineering studies have been undertaken to determine what course of action is required for the repairs that were identified by staff. A scope of work will then be prepared by a heritage architect, looking at early Spring to get repairs done.

Bill Manson asked if a harsh winter will affect repairs planned for the spring. Staff responded that details indicate that the foundation is not in peril; therefore, weather conditions over the winter will not be an issue.

(v) **Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L) – M. Stark**

Diane Dent offered to continue monitoring the Auchmar Gate House for future meetings.
(vi) **Smart-Turner Building, 191 Barton Street E., Hamilton (ND, L) – Councillor M. Pearson**

Councilor Brantina advised that he was in attendance for a cheque presentation in the amount of $40,000, which was donated from a hockey tournament involving 700 physicians.

**Dent/Adkins**  
That Councillor B. Bratina be authorized and directed to resume discussions with Hamilton Health Sciences Corporation respecting the designation of the Smart-Turner Building at 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton.  
CARRIED

(vii) **St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – P. Hartnett**

Staff advised that the Zoning By-law for St. Mark’s is being drafted to allow for uses on the site that would support retention and reuse of the building while allowing for redevelopment on site. Meetings have been arranged with the planner to discuss this matter and public consultation will follow. The Durand Neighbourhood Association has expressed interest in having a presentation done at their meeting. Staff will advise of the date.

(viii) **Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie**

No updates

(ix) **Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton**

No updates

(x) **The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins**

The Committee expressed their concern that the future of this building is not looking good.

Councillor Bratina updated the Committee on the financial situation, advising that at $250 per room, the hotel would have to be at 80% occupancy for the project to be successful. The immediate concern is that the building will be allowed to go into disrepair, and a situation similar to that of the Lister Block will develop. Councillor Bratina also reported that there is graffiti on the front window; a notice has been sent to the owners to have this cleaned up; have until December 1 to respond.
Following a lengthy discussion on the future of this building, the following recommendation was approved:

(Bratina/Neufeld)
That the Chair, on behalf of LACAC, send a letter to Council expressing the Committee’s concern with respect to the condition and future of the Royal Connaught Hotel. CARRIED

(xi) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton
No updates

(xii) 225 James Street South, Hamilton (R) – Councillor B. McHattie
(Wakeman/Wray)
That due to its demolition, this property be removed from the list of Endangered Buildings and Landscapes.

(xiii) 795 Old Highway 8, the former Rockton Hotel Livery Stable – P. Hartnett
Sharon Vattay provided an update, advising that discussions are ongoing and staff are working with the Real Estate Division; ready to have meeting with interested party to discuss possibilities. Staff will provide update at next meeting.

The Committee inquired as to whether it would be possible to have the building redesignated; staff responded that this will be considered as the project moves forward. There is also the possibility of placing a heritage easement on the property prior to its sale.

David Cuming advised that he will circulate the recommendation recently approved by the Economic Development and Planning Committee with respect to this property.

(b) Updates or Concerns on Watched Buildings or Areas
(c) (Adkins/Manson)
That the title of this section be changed to “Buildings and Landscapes of Concern”. CARRIED
New listing – Federal Building, Caroline and Main Streets

The Committee inquired as to the status of the Federal Building located at Caroline and Main Streets. Councillor Bratina advised that the owners of the building have been approached over the past year. In the interim, there is someone on site once a week and there is no entry into the building. With respect to the graffiti, the owners have been asked to attend to this matter. Because the building is closed and the mechanical system is turned off, some of the windows are left open so that the air does not become toxic.

(Adkins/Manson)
That the Smart-Turner Building, 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, be moved from the Endangered Buildings and Landscapes to the Buildings and Landscapes of Concern. CARRIED

The Committee agreed that the following buildings be added to this section:

(a) 2 Hatt Street – Frances Thorp Neufeld
(b) Dundas Post office – Frances Thorp Newfeld
(c) Old Lyric Theatre – staff provided an update, advising that the development would only save the façade; status of the project is unknown; development planner is waiting for information on the site plan.

The Chair requested that in future, information as to reasons for concern be sent to staff for inclusion in the agenda.

7. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 7)

(a) Delegated Approvals:

   (i) Heritage Permit Application, 777 York Boulevard, Hamilton (Hamilton Cemetery Gatehouse) (Ward 1) (Item 7.1.1)

   Sharon Vattay advised that the Heritage Permit Subcommittee has given approval for Phase 2 of the project. Site visit to be done in the first week of December.

(b) Staff Reports/Recommendations:

   None

(Wray/Adkins)
That Item 7(a)(i) be received for information. CARRIED
8. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS

None

9. DISCUSSION ITEMS

(a) Policy Sub-Committee Minutes (B. Manson) (Item 9.1)

Bill Manson outlined the Third Party Initiated Designation as proposed in the Minutes of the Policy Sub-Committee Minutes.

Bill Manson outlined the process to formulate the policy.

Sylvia Wray indicated that the language in Statement 3 be rewritten as the intent is for LACAC to ask staff to investigate more designations.

Art French advised that he had compiled a list of properties in Glanbrook for review and consideration.

The Committee agreed that Anne Charlton, Art French and Bill Manson meet to review all heritage organizations, look at representation from LACAC, and request relevant members to follow up.

(Manson/Wakeman)
That Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) develop and implement the designation pilot project as follows:

Each LACAC liaison would:

- approach his/her community’s heritage organization asking that, within the next year or less, the organization recommend for designation between 5 and 15 properties in its community;
- work closely with his/her heritage organization in the “education” of its membership and community around the rationale for, the process of, and the implications of, designation;
- develop a common “education package and process” in collaboration with Staff;
- work with the heritage society to implement a community-based “grass roots” process involving the Ward Councilor(s), whereby the heritage society could identify and recommend properties in the community for designation;
- monitor and report on the progress of the pilot project in each community.

CARRIED
(b) Proposed wording from the Joint Plaquing Sub-committee to complete the remaining post amalgamation Designated Property Plaques (K. Wakeman) (Item 9.2)

Kathy Wakeman provided an overview of the proposed wording from the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee to complete the remaining post amalgamation designated property plaques.

Sylvia Wray advised that there were statements contained in the “Statements of Cultural Heritage Value” that were inaccurate; however, Bill Manson responded that these statements were taken directly from the City’s by-laws.

The Committee reviewed only that portion of print which is to appear on the plaques, and made the following change:

(a) 5 Brock Street North – should read 1-1/2 storey stone; Worker’s Cottage

(Wray/Manson)
That the proposed wording, as amended, to complete the remaining post amalgamation designated property plaques as outlined in the attached Appendix A be approved. CARRIED

(c) Communication and Education Sub-Committee Minutes, November 4, 2007/Heritage Certificates (A. French) (Item 9.3)

Art French provided an overview of the Minutes including the Heritage Certificates which he has prepared.

(French/Akins)
(a) That the Communication and Education Sub-Committee Minutes of November 4, 2007 be received;

(b) That the design of the heritage certificates be approved as presented. CARRIED

(d) Year End Report (A. Charlton - no copy) (Item 9.4)

Chair Charlton reminded the Committee, specifically Sub-Committee chairs, that the written report is due January 31, 2008, and that each should be submitting their summary reports.
(e) Overview of Planning and Economic Development Department organizational structure and staff function (D. Cuming - no copy) (Item 9.5)

This presentation as deferred to the December meeting of the Committee.

(f) Hamilton-Wentworth Heritage Association:

(i) Heritage Volunteer Recognition Award (Item 9.6)
   (1) Heritage Volunteer Recognition Award
   (2) Volunteer Service Award

(ii) Correspondence from Susan Ramsay, President of the Hamilton-Wentworth Heritage Association, dated October 26, 2007, seeking to increase membership (Added Item 9.6(a))

(French/Hartnet)
That Items (f)(i) and (ii) be received for information. CARRIED

(g) 447 RCAF Association building at Mount Hope (S. Vattay – verbal, no copy) (Item 9.6)

Art French reported that correspondence had been received from the Royal Canadian Air Force Association requesting that the RCAF 447 (Hamilton) Wing building located at 9300 Airport Road, Unit 350, be designated.

(French/Adkins)
That staff be requested to investigate the possibility of a heritage designation for the RCAF 447 (Hamilton) Wing building located at 9300 Airport Road, Unit 350. CARRIED

10. GENERAL INFORMATION

(a) Distribution of Hamilton’s Heritage Volume 7a - Inventory of Places of Worship: Ancaster, Beverly, Binbrook, Dundas, East Flamborough, Glanford, Saltfleet, and West Flamborough (S. Wray - copies to be distributed (Item 10.1)

The Committee was circulated with Volume 7A, Part A – Inventory of Places of Worship: Ancaster, Beverly, Binbrook, Dundas, East Flamborough, Glanford, Saltfleet and West Flamborough.
On behalf of the Committee, Chair Charlton thanked Sylvia Wray for all of her time and efforts to compile this information and putting it together. Sylvia Wray thanked David Cuming for his support and encouragement of this project, and also extended thanks to all who contributed, including Anne Charlton, Art French, Meghan House, Sharon Vattay and the summer students. She also thanked her husband, Robert, for his time in taking the photographs.

(b) OMB Hearing - Heritage Permit for 31 Cross Street, Dundas (D. Cuming - verbal update – no copy) (Item 10.2)

David Cuming reported that the OMB Hearing started last year and concluded on November 8, 2007. The OMB Chair has reserved his decision until some time in January, 2008.

12. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Anne Charlton, Chair
Hamilton LACAC
(Municipal Heritage Committee)

Carolyn Biggs,
Legislative Assistant
Hamilton LACAC
(Municipal Heritage Committee)
November 22, 2007
From: The Joint Plaquing Sub-committee                 Date: November, 2007
To: The Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee)

Proposed wording to complete the remaining post amalgamation Designated Property Plaques

1. 2006 By-law 0711 – 9 Kinnell Street

   1909
   9 Kinnell Street
   Ontario Vernacular
   Centre-Gabled Style
   Worker’s Cottage

   Statement of Cultural Heritage Value
   The 1909 brick residence located at 9 Kinnell Street possesses cultural heritage value due to its association with the residential development of the City of Hamilton, specifically lands subdivided in the mid-nineteenth century by Sir Allan Napier MacNab. This worker’s cottage is representative of the housing stock built for the burgeoning working class in the Strathcona Neighbourhood in the early twentieth century. It is an example of vernacular Ontario centre-gabled cottage style architecture and contributes to the historic quality and pedestrian scale of the Kinnell streetscape.

   Description of Heritage Attributes
   All four elevations and the hipped roof with centre gable, together with all construction materials and all component features and detailing.

2. 2006 By-law 06-270 – 5 Brock Street (Dundas)

   1857
   5 Brock Street North
   1½ Storey Stone**
   Worker’s Cottage**
   An example of local stone workmanship
   Vernacular Late-Georgian Style

   Statement of Cultural Heritage Value
   The 1857 stone cottage located at 5 Brock Street North, Dundas, possesses cultural heritage value due to its association with the economic and industrial development of the Town of Dundas. This workers’ cottage is representative of the housing stock built in the town for the burgeoning working class in the mid-nineteenth century. The vernacular late-Georgian style, stone residence is a well-designed example of a one and one-half storey cottage and is also a good example of local stone workmanship. The building retains its residential character and contributes to the historic quality of the streetscape.

**as amended by LACAC on November 22, 2007
Description of Heritage Attributes
All four elevations and the gable roof of the main building together with all construction materials and all component features and detailing. All three elevations and the gable roof of the one-storey kitchen wing attached to the east/rear of the building, and all building component features and detailing thereon.

3. 2006 By-law 06-271 – 140 Erie Avenue

1900
140 Erie Avenue
2½ storey Brick
Queen Anne Style
Residential Building

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value
140 Erie Avenue, containing a two and one-half storey brick residential building, possesses cultural heritage value due to its architectural and historical associations. Built in 1900, the building with hipped roof and decorative brick detailing is a well-preserved example of Queen Anne style architecture, retaining virtually all of its original architectural features, including windows and transom lights. Historically, the building is a reminder of the residential growth patterns in the City of Hamilton at the end of the nineteenth and early of the twentieth centuries. It continues to contribute to the overall residential streetscape on Erie Avenue.

Description of Heritage Attributes
All four elevations and the hipped roof, including all four brick facades, the window and door openings, the wood eaves on all sides, together with all construction materials and all component features and detailing.

4. 2006 By-law 06-036

1919
Bank of Hamilton
Architect: Gordon J. Hutton
1-storey Brick Commercial Building
Edwardian Classical Style

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value
281 Herkimer Street, containing the former Bank of Hamilton branch building, possesses cultural heritage value due to its connection with the financial growth of the City of Hamilton. The Bank of Hamilton was one of the most prominent and influential enterprises in Hamilton from 1872 until 1923, at which time the bank was amalgamated with the Canadian Bank of Commerce. The Bank of Hamilton branch buildings were erected not only in this city, but across the country, carrying the Hamilton name as far west as Vancouver. Designed by Hamilton architect, Gordon J. Hutton, in association with Paul Domville, in 1919 to 1920,
the building at 281 Herkimer Street remains a prominent landmark at the corner of Locke and Herkimer Streets in a well-established residential neighbourhood. The one-storey brick building with hipped roof and classical detailing is a well-preserved example of Edwardian Classicism and retains almost all of its original architectural features.

5. 2006 By-law 07-010 – 317 Dundas St. East (Waterdown)

1922
Waterdown Memorial Hall
to memorialize local citizens involved in World War 1
1-storey brick
Edwardian Classical Style

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value
The 1922 Waterdown Memorial Hall located at 317 Dundas Street East, Waterdown, possesses cultural heritage value due to its associations with military commemoration. The one-storey brick building was constructed to memorialize local citizens who were involved in World War I and it continues to play a prominent role in the social and cultural life of the community. The building is a good example of the Edwardian Classicist Style of architecture and contributes to the historic quality of the streetscape in the former Village of Waterdown.

Description of Heritage Attributes
All four elevations and the flat roof of the one-storey brick building, together with all construction materials and all building component features and detailing.

6. 2005 By-law 05-296 – 276-278 King St. West

1906
276-278 King Street West
An example of Edwardian Vernacular Commercial Style
with decorative brick features

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value
The 1906 commercial brick building located at 276-278 King Street West, Hamilton, possesses cultural heritage value expressed in its historical associations with the economic growth of the City of Hamilton and the continual commercial development of King Street. The subject building, within its historical setting, is of architectural value as an example of Edwardian, vernacular commercial architecture with decorative brick features and an intact storefront. The Reasons for Designation apply to all elevations and the flat roof, including all
facades, entranceways and windows, together with construction materials of brick, stone, wood, metal, and building techniques as follows:

**South (Front) Elevation**
Ground/lower level storefront comprising recessed entrances together with trim, base panels, window openings and plate glass. Stone beltcourse between the first and second floors. Four symmetrically arranged bays on the second floor level. Brick facade with decorative brickwork, corbelling, and pilasters on the second floor level. Round-arched window openings on the second floor together with stone keystone, wood trim and double-hung sash glazing. Elaborate, decorative wood cornice together with corbels, brackets, and dentils. Pediment with date stone and stone coping.

**East and West (Side) Elevations**
Exterior walls constructed of brick.

**South (Rear) Elevation**
Exterior wall constructed of brick, excluding the elevated wood-frame addition.

7. **2005 By-law 06-011 – 71 Main St. West**

1960
Hamilton City Hall
Architect: Stanley Roscoe
Built by: Pigott Construction
Intact example of Modern Civic Architecture

**Statement of Cultural Heritage Value**
The civic complex located at 71 Main Street West, comprising Hamilton City Hall and surrounding landscaped grounds, possesses cultural heritage value, expressed in historical associations with the development of municipal administration, the 1950s urban renewal movement, evolution of city hall architecture in the City of Hamilton, as well as its association with notable individuals including elected representatives of all levels of municipal, provincial and federal government, visiting dignitaries and celebrities. Hamilton City Hall was built in 1960 by Pigott Construction Co. to a design by Stanley Roscoe, Canada’s first municipally-employed architect and was Roscoe’s most significant work during his tenure as a city architect. City Hall is one of the few intact examples of modern civic architecture in Canada. The entire civic complex has value as a cultural heritage landscape.

The Reasons for Designation apply to the City Hall complex together with all elevations and the roof of the main administration building including all facades, entranceways and windows, together with construction materials of steel, aluminium, marble, Italian glass tile, wood, building techniques.
Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The commercial brick building (1892) located at 320 King Street East possesses cultural heritage value expressed in its historical associations with the economic growth of the City of Hamilton and the nineteenth century commercial development of King Street. The subject building, within its historical setting, is of architectural value as an example of Italianate commercial architecture with decorative features and an intact storefront.

The Reasons for Designation apply to all elevations and the flat roof, including all facades, entranceways and windows, together with construction materials of brick, stone, wood, metal, and building techniques as follows:

**North (Front) Elevation**

Two symmetrically arranged bays. Recessed storefront together with wood trim, wood base panels, window openings and plate glass, transoms above the store windows with wood frames and trim, entrance opening with existing door, walls and ceiling. Brick facade with decorative brickwork, corbelling, brick pilasters on the main floor. Rectangular window openings on the second floor together with stone lintels, wood trim and one-over-one sash glazing. Stone beltcourse between the first and second floors. Elaborate, decorative pressed metal cornice together with finials, corbels, upper pedestal, brackets, “buttons” and consoles with acanthus leaf details.

**West (Side) Elevation**

Exterior wall constructed of brick laid in Common bond.

**South (Rear) Elevation**

Exterior wall constructed of brick laid in Common bond, but excluding the elevated pressure-treated wood deck.

**East (Side) Elevation**

Exterior wall constructed of brick laid in Common bond. First floor entrance with segmentally arched opening, brick voussoirs and original decorative wood rail and transom.