SUBJECT: Bus Bench Furniture Program Review and Street Furniture RFP (PW09033) - (City Wide)

RECOMMENDATION:

(a) That as a result of the scheduled expiry of the current bus bench furniture agreement with Hamilton Bench Advertising Ltd. on October 31, 2009, for the supply, installation, maintenance and removal of bus bench and associated litter containers, a Request for Proposals (RFP) be developed and issued in a manner that provides for improved service levels, new street furniture amenities and optional items, and improved revenues for consideration in a broader street furniture program as set out in Table “A” of Report PW09033 and that staff report back to Committee on RFP results in Q1 2010;

(b) That site selection criteria be developed for street furniture amenities identified in the scope of the RFP and be submitted to Committee for consideration in Q1 2010.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The expiry of the City’s bus bench furniture contract in 2009 presents the City with an opportunity to make significant improvements to the look, feel and image of our streetscapes through an expanded and more co-ordinated furniture contract. Image is a strategic theme in the City’s Strategic Plan around “changing the perceptions of
Hamilton and promoting the City as a great place to live, work and play” and is therefore a Council priority.

Based on the results of a staff lead program review, a single RFP for an expanded and co-ordinated furniture contract for street benches, litter containers and other amenities set out in Table “A” is being recommended for issue. Information respecting each item identified in Table “A” is noted in the Analysis/Rationale section of this report.

Staff will report back to Committee with the results of the RFP as well as a recommendation on site selection criteria to be used in determining amenity locations.

**BACKGROUND:**

The information/recommendations contained within this report have City wide implications.

**Existing Bus Bench Furniture Program and Authority for Program Review**

The bus bench furniture program is currently delivered by Hamilton Bench Advertising Limited (“HBA”), providing for the supply, installation and maintenance of benches and associated litter containers, as well as litter collection and disposal, at approximately 360 bus stop locations. Under the terms of the existing agreement, the benches and litter containers are managed by HBA at its cost, while providing a share of its related advertising revenue to the City resulting in approximately $40,000 annual revenues. Units serve primarily as seating and litter containers for transit customers but could be located anywhere on the urban streetscape. Under the current agreement, consent is required to place units in BIA areas or in the area deemed as the “Hamilton Downtown Improvement Area”. Benches with and without litter containers are currently located within some of the BIA areas as well as within the Hamilton Downtown Improvement Area.

Bench units usually have built in single stream litter containers and are located almost exclusively at bus stop “pick up points” (stops where more riders get on than get off), as determined by the Transit Division. Current bench designs vary in terms of style, configuration and number of seats while litter containers are of standard size. Advertising panels are affixed to the litter container element of a combined bench/litter container unit or on the bench if there is no litter container element. There are 1,000 benches permitted divided equally between advertising faces and those without advertising faces. There is a contract provision that stipulates 5% of the benches to be made available to “local service organizations” which will be responsible for the cost of the artwork only. This contract provision is not actively promoted but has been used in the past, most recently by the Hamilton Brain Injury Association. Other provisions respecting matters of approval of works, sight lines, clearances, maintenance, condition of works, remedies for non compliance, and contract management items are set out in the agreement. Bus bench furniture amenities on the streetscape today represent approximately 7.5% of an estimated 7,434 total street furniture amenity inventory.

The original ten (10) year agreement with HBA expired on October 31, 2007 and was extended to October 31, 2009 through Report PW08005 to ensure continued service while the program is reviewed and a new contract established through a competitive bid process. Program improvement recommendations identified during the course of the review would be provided to Council for consideration in advance of the bid process.
As set out in Information Update BBFPRA08-01 issued on June 10, 2008, potential recommendations could include enhanced revenue generation, expanded area of service, expanded scope of service, site selection criteria and program service level, and would include the input from consultation with external groups.

A City wide staff working group was assembled in June 2008 and lead by the Public Works Department, Operations & Maintenance Division to undertake the review process. Composition of the staff working group is set out in the Relevant Consultation section of this report.

Program review approach

The program review was undertaken by the staff working group throughout the period June 2008 to January 2009 inclusive and is described further in this report. In addition to conducting a program review on bus bench furniture elements, staff was encouraged to consider other street furniture amenities in addition to traditional bus bench furniture elements as possible RFP opportunities. As such, all program improvement opportunities on street furniture amenities that arose during the course of the review either internally or through consultation with external groups have been identified in this report. Each opportunity was considered and categorized as an included item, optional item or an item not to be included in the RFP recommendations, with supporting rationale.

What is street furniture?

Street furniture consists of a wide variety of elements and amenities installed in the public right of way for the use and convenience of the public. Examples include but are not limited to benches, waste/recycling bins, transit shelters, telephone booths, publication boxes, bike racks and cigarette receptacles. Over time, numerous street furniture amenities have been introduced to Hamilton’s streetscape and demand for amenities continues to grow.

Program Scan - Observations and Challenges

The following program observations and challenges were identified during the course of the program review respecting bus bench and other street furniture amenities. This information was considered during the formulation of report recommendations without judgment or fault on any item.

- **Observation:** multiple departments and divisions play various roles in the administration and management of bus bench, litter container and other street furniture amenities
  **Challenge:** create a clear goal statement that acts as a check for all future management decisions

- **Observation:** furniture amenities appear on the streetscape through many processes
  **Challenge:** create a single street furniture selection and placement process

- **Observation:** there are many furniture amenity types, looks, conditions and in various quantities on the streetscape
  **Challenge:** create guidelines that provide a unified look to the streetscape
• **Observation**: there are a variety of program delivery methods for each amenity including use of in-house staff or contracted service or mixture of both for the same amenity, or as provided by private business or government agency  
  **Challenge**: rationalize delivery methods to take advantage of built in efficiencies. Eliminate overlap and non sustainable methods

• **Observation**: some amenities are funded through commercial advertising contracts  
  **Challenge**: identify additional street furniture amenities that can be funded from commercial advertising revenue

• **Observation**: furniture contracts are issued amenity specific and stand alone  
  **Challenge**: bring all contracts into one group to increase coherence of look and ease of administration by City staff

• **Observation**: there are design, operational and financial aspects to furniture programs  
  **Challenge**: create a program that recognizes and builds on these linkages

• **Observation**: there are a number of in progress and contemplated initiatives underway respecting street furniture  
  **Challenge**: look at potential to unify initiatives through a single program

• **Observation**: placement of public art on the streetscape and furniture design itself as public art needs consideration  
  **Challenge**: provide terms of reference that lead to higher visual quality for street furniture

• **Observation**: elements do not seem to be on the streetscape in a recognizable, cohesive fashion. Guidelines on furniture placement and standards for each amenity vary, are absent or are unknown  
  **Challenge**: formulate clear and workable placement guidelines for street furniture

• **Observation**: poor furniture condition, overflowing litter, who does what respecting furniture and numerous points of staff contact based on amenity type are known sources of complaint from staff, residents and Councillors  
  **Challenge**: rationalize the responsibility for service to those groups (private or public) that are best equipped to handle the tasks. Minimize service overlap and improve efficiency

• **Observation**: a complete inventory of all street furniture amenities does not exist  
  **Challenge**: create a data base of all furniture locations

• **Observation**: program operating impacts associated with the installation of new amenities or additional quantities of existing amenities are not always considered before installation  
  **Challenge**: development of site selection criteria and other matrices to recognize and eliminate negative operating impacts

• **Observation**: a majority of the trash receptacles are single stream  
  **Challenge**: upgrading to multi stream litter containers and replacing City owned single stream litter containers under an improved bus bench contract is an immediate opportunity to be explored
Research/data collection
The following data was used by the working group as resource material throughout the program review process:

- Existing agreement with Hamilton Bench Advertising Limited
- Bus bench furniture inventory
- Report PW08005 and Information Update BBFPRRA08-01
- Site photographs taken on June 23, 2008 of bus bench furniture and other furniture amenities located on some City streets on that date
- 5 street furniture RFPs of varying scopes issued by other municipalities - Barrie, Greater Sudbury, Thunder Bay, Ottawa, Toronto
- HABIA committee member summary and supporting BIA maps
- Record of input from external stakeholders - HABIA, Clean City Liaison Committee, Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities (Built Environment Sub Committee)
- Municipal comparator survey including copies of furniture contracts and other reference material
- Copies of existing street furniture contracts
- Urban Streetscape Conference summary and presentation respecting Streetscape Urban Design, City of Toronto co-ordinated street furniture program and City of Toronto Clean and Beautiful program

Working group “walk about”
The working group conducted a walk about on July 25, 2008 on sidewalks located in downtown Hamilton, bounding York to Main, James to Mary. The purpose of the walk about was to look first hand at any street furniture located along the route, to discuss any information known about this furniture including its origin, function, appearance and management, and to consider the furniture in its own right and in the context of the entire streetscape. Observation summary:

- diverse range of furniture types, styles, functions, colours, owners, histories
- varying condition of works ranging from clean to dirty; new to old, contemporary to traditional
- absence of bus bench furniture style in BIA area
- variations in furniture placement within the sidewalk area, within proximity to other furniture, or whether it was present at all
- few multi stream litter containers; many single stream litter containers
- sidewalk busy with many objects and obstacles, both stationary and moving, abutting roadways that are busy with moving objects
- design principles behind layout of street furniture in the context of overall streetscape was not apparent
- some sidewalk segments were not appealing places to walk

Engagement of external stakeholder groups
Presentations were made August through November 2008 to three external stakeholder groups, HABIA, Clean City Liaison Committee, the Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities (Built Environment Sub Committee), and the Downtown Clean & Safe Taskforce respecting the current bus bench program and the intent of the program
review. Input received at these meetings was formally documented and returned to the stakeholder groups in writing as “Records of Input”. Stakeholder input is summarized as follows:

a) Hamilton Association of Business Improvement Areas (“HABIA”)
HABIA expressed interest in the bus bench furniture program so long as their needs were met and they were regularly consulted. Concerns expressed over the current program included poor maintenance including overflowing litter, unattractive design, placement issues including “furniture clutter” in some areas, and competitor advertising. BIA members acknowledged the difficulty in balancing a possible City wide standard with BIA design preferences that vary between BIA areas. Good contract management was emphasized.

b) Clean City Liaison Committee (“CCLC”)
CCLC expressed interest in the bus bench furniture program and requested to be consulted throughout the program review and recommendation process. CCLC also had concerns around overflowing litter containers and general cleanliness of units, and would like to see multi stream litter containers placed at transit locations and near schools. Benches at transit stops were questioned at locations where a bench was already located in the transit shelter. CCLC also raised concerns over advertising clutter particularly respecting size of ad but indicated that they do like the current contract provision that makes 5% of the benches with advertising available to local service organizations while only having to pay for the cost of the artwork. Public service messaging respecting CCLC mandate (i.e. litter and graffiti prevention) was requested. Good contract management was emphasized.

c) Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities Built Environment Subcommittee (“ACPD”)
ACPD also expressed interest in the bus bench furniture program and requested to be consulted on an ongoing basis. Members would like to see more furniture not less to serve as resting points for persons with disabilities. In particular, they would like to see more furniture placed in the BIA areas, at all bus stops, at DARTS pick up/transfer points and around entrances to malls. Accessible design, large letter signage, colour, appropriate clearances for wheelchairs and walkers, shade and consistent layout on the streetscape were reported as important factors to persons of age and with disabilities. They do like the current contract provision that makes 5% of the benches with advertising available to local service organizations while only having to pay for the cost of the artwork. Good contract management was emphasized.

d) Downtown Clean & Safe Taskforce (“the Taskforce”)
The Taskforce’s main concern was around graffiti and its removal. In particular, they would like to see RFP specifications written that addresses graffiti prevention and removal in terms of unit design (i.e. use of graffiti block) and in terms of maintenance standards respecting removal response times. It was requested that inspections include graffiti removal as part of contractor’s routine schedule. In addition, it was requested that response times on complaints be at least equal to and preferably exceed City standards. The other concern raised was that BIAs located in the downtown core do not want any additional units in their BIAs than is the case
presently. They would like to continue to see a provision in a new agreement requiring BIA permission to install units.

Municipal comparator survey
Consulting firm, Janet Rosenberg and Associates (“JRA”), was hired to conduct a municipal comparator survey respecting bus bench and street furniture amenity programs delivered by various municipalities in Canada. The cities chosen were selected for comparability and known divergence with Hamilton’s programs to provide the working group with a broad spectrum of current or contemplated programming in other municipalities. Hamilton was also “surveyed” for a structured comparison with other municipalities. Information contained in the survey includes data respecting furniture specifications and numbers by amenity name, as well as information respecting roles and responsibilities for furniture management, contract management, advertising, BIA involvement, and revenue generated. Copies of existing contracts, municipal policy and procedures, furniture photographs, and relevant bylaws were included in the survey where supplied by the municipality. No municipality surveyed had developed site selection criteria for street furniture, although all had some level of placement criteria in place.

Municipalities surveyed:
1. Brampton (ON)
2. Halifax Regional Municipality (NS)
3. Hamilton (ON) - note: required for comparability results
4. London (ON)
5. Ottawa (ON)
6. Toronto (ON)
7. Vancouver (BC)
8. Waterloo Regional Municipality (ON)

A great deal of information was provided and the report highlights many of the nuanced differences between municipalities such as the details of revenue sharing, waste collection and the involvement of business improvement areas in making design and placement decisions. The greatest contrast was found to exist between the municipalities holding contracts with multiple vendors versus those who participate in a coordinated street furniture program under a single provider.

Coordinated programs provide cities with a greater variety of sophisticated and aesthetically unified amenities. Additionally, having all advertising-funded amenities under a single provider allows for increased regulation of the placement of advertising panels. This allows for benches and waste receptacles, among other small amenities that are not well suited to advertising, to be free of awkward panels, while still being funded by the programs as a whole. It is also been determined that coordinated programs generate greater revenue to their host City. The completed comparator survey is a 267 page document and is available for review in both electronic and hard copy versions.
Urban Streetscape Workshop

Beautiful streetscape design and the City of Toronto’s co-ordinated street furniture program were topics at this workshop hosted by the Ontario Traffic Conference on November 20, 2008. Key messages included:

- streets and sidewalks are our largest shared community public space and should be about moving people not just cars to increase the quality of community. Quality of community is about the number of people exchanges along the route. Street furniture properly designed and placed within the sidewalk through the application of sidewalk “zones” curb to property line attracts walkers, increasing the number of people exchanges and this contributes to the quality of the community through the quality of the walk.

- City of Toronto’s co-ordinated street furniture program was implemented in 2007 through an RFP process resulting in a 20 year contract award to Astral Media based on 25,640 pieces of street furniture consisting of transit shelters, benches, litter containers, publication boxes, information facilities, posterling facilities, bike racks and public washrooms. Planning for this program took three years and included among other aspects, extensive program consultation and agreement on design principles, scope of program, and level of commercial advertising tolerance.

Opportunities

The expiry of the City’s bus bench furniture contract in 2009 presents the City with an opportunity to make significant improvements to the look, feel and image of our streetscapes through an expanded and more co-ordinated furniture contract. Based on the results of a program review conducted June 2008 through January 2009 including program consultation, a scan of current amenities and contracts and the results of the municipal comparator survey, a single RFP for an expanded and co-ordinated furniture contract for street benches, litter containers and other amenities set out in Table “A” is being recommended for issue. Information respecting each item identified in Table “A” is noted in the Analysis/Rationale section of this report.
### TABLE “A”

Street Furniture Request for Proposals (RFP)

**Scope and Area of Service**
Supply, installation, maintenance, removal, advertising administration
With and without litter collection and disposal pricing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amenity</th>
<th>Current Program (quantities fluctuate)</th>
<th>Current Internal Responsibility</th>
<th>Proposed Scope</th>
<th>Proposed Area of Service</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inventory Contractor</td>
<td>Inventory In-house</td>
<td>O&amp;M Business Services (contractor), O&amp;M Roads (in-house)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Bench (street)</td>
<td>360 Hamilton Bench Advertising Ltd.</td>
<td># included in item 8</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Single stream litter container (street and end of line transit stops)</td>
<td>200 Hamilton Bench Advertising Ltd.</td>
<td>600 street + 45 end of line transit stops</td>
<td>Yes (if multi stream cannot be installed)</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Multi stream litter container (street)</td>
<td>0 No contractor</td>
<td>60 O&amp;M Roads Waste</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Publication box – single and multi (street)</td>
<td>340 No contractor Various publishers place own boxes</td>
<td>0 O&amp;M Business Services</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Bike rack (street)</td>
<td>50 Compound Inc. “multi ring” style</td>
<td>150 &quot;single ring&quot; style</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Cigarette receptacle (street)</td>
<td>0 No contractor</td>
<td>60 O&amp;M Roads</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Transit shelter</td>
<td>557 CBS Outdoor Canada</td>
<td>0 Transit Division</td>
<td>Yes (include as deferred item to 2015)</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Traffic signal controller box (street)</td>
<td>0 Not applicable</td>
<td>500 O&amp;M Traffic</td>
<td>Optional – advertising only</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Bench (park, trail, open space)</td>
<td>0 No contractor</td>
<td>2600 O&amp;M Parks &amp; Cemeteries</td>
<td>Optional</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Single stream litter container (park, trail,</td>
<td>0 No contractor</td>
<td>1300 litter barrels + 602 blue barrels twinned with O&amp;M Parks &amp; Cemeteries</td>
<td>Optional (if multi stream cannot be installed)</td>
<td>City wide</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUBJECT: Bus Bench Furniture Program Review and Street Furniture RFP (PW09033) - (City Wide) - Page 10 of 21

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amenity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current Program (quantities fluctuate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open space)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Multi stream litter container (park, trail, open space)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Electronic street banner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Electronic billboard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Billboard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Automated public washroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Information board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Postering board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Telephone booth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Mailbox</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL*: 1,517</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Site Selection Criteria

All municipalities surveyed indicated that they had not developed site selection criteria for street furniture. They reported that requests for street furniture were received from a variety of sources and were considered on a case by case, site by site basis, as is the case in Hamilton currently. Site selection criteria is different from placement criteria. Placement criteria simply considers the location in terms of operational feasibility such as physical space, sight line and clearance issues. Site selection criteria applies a program service standard to determine eligibility for the location. Having established site selection criteria would accelerate approval processes for new installations, save time, and increase efficiency as it would provide an operating framework based on a range of factors and context to dissuade location decisions based on individual opinion or interest. Staff has engaged the services of a consultant to assist in the task of attempting to develop site selection criteria for Committee’s consideration.
ANALYSIS/RATIONALE:

The RFP recommendation is premised on a vision of creating an identifiable streetscape look through the procurement of a family of products that provides for functional, durable and attractive elements to effectively harmonize and mitigate the current clutter and disparate design elements, allow for pedestrian traffic flow, and reduce the overall amount of advertising on the streetscape through the “clustering” and designation of advertising elements within the cluster. Such a program properly designed, managed and under one contract would harmonize the existing “hodge podge” appearance, function and placement of specific existing furniture amenities on the streetscape, through the bundling of amenities. While the intent of the program is to achieve a family of products that maintains a common design, flexibility for some customization in BIA areas or other designated areas would be incorporated into the RFP to facilitate geographical distinctiveness and advertising restrictions to attract usage. In addition, there is no intention to discard existing owned furniture without good reason. The intent of the RFP is to harmonize amenities over time through (a) additional quantities of existing amenities, (b) introduction of new amenities (c) outright replacements in the case of any contracted items and any deliberate change for example from single stream litter container to multi stream containers, as well as (d) replacements of owned furniture based on a condition assessment and lifecycle projection. Owned units could also be added to the contract as advertising only in exchange for maintenance (i.e. cleanliness, graffiti removal) and life cycle replacement. Amenities that are deemed to remain outside of the contract will continue to be managed administratively through any current processes.

Improved program management under a single contract and administrative process would also improve customer satisfaction respecting requests for installation, maintenance and removal of amenities under this contract. Other value added improvements could include an improved civic messaging program through amenity allocation, better value for money and a more favourable financial package. Information respecting these opportunities is set out further in this report.

Contract length is recommended to be long term to attract bids which will position the City for a comprehensive and co-ordinated street furniture program.

Expanded scope and area of service per Table “A”

1. **Street bench (required)** - The existing bus bench program is currently advertising funded and the elements consist solely of a street bench and an associated single stream litter container located primarily at bus stop locations. The contract that provides for this furniture will expire on October 31, 2009, and the street bench element needs to be replaced for program continuity. Replacement of the City owned inventory of street benches will also be included in the RFP. In effect, this initiative would consolidate all existing and future street benches under this contract.

2. **Single stream litter container (required)** - As in item 1. above, the contract that provides for this bus bench furniture will expire on October 31, 2009, and the litter container element needs to be replaced for program continuity. This furniture element is not preferred but is required in instances where a multi
stream container cannot or should not be installed. Bidders will be asked to provide prices with and without litter/recycling collection and disposal so that this activity can be compared to the cost of in-house collection and disposal services. Locations outside of bus stop locations will be considered. Replacement of the City owned inventory of single stream litter containers will also be included in the RFP. Again, this element is not preferred but is required in instances where a multi stream container cannot or should not be installed. In effect, this initiative would consolidate all existing and future streetscape litter containers under this contract and attempt to convert at the same time, existing single stream containers to multi stream design City wide.

3. **Multi stream litter container (required)** - As in item 2. above, the existing associated single stream litter container needs to be replaced in a new contract but with a multi stream litter container to support the City’s waste diversion programs and targets. Replacement of the City owned inventory of single stream litter containers and multi stream containers will also be included in the RFP also in support of the City’s waste diversion programs and targets. Bidders will be asked to provide prices with and without litter/recycling collection and disposal so that this activity can be compared to the cost of in-house collection and disposal services. In effect, this initiative would consolidate all existing and future streetscape litter containers under this contract and attempt to convert at the same time, existing single stream containers to multi stream design City wide.

4. **Publication boxes (required)** - Publication boxes are currently supplied by publishing companies based on their own individual design requirements and they are placed on the streetscape by the companies themselves at locations determined by them. The name of the publishing company name is normally advertised on the exterior of the box. Boxes are of various colours, sizes and conditions and are usually clustered with other publication boxes. They are generally tied to poles or other fixed apparatuses. The existing administrative process behind the management of these boxes on the streetscape is not effective as staff rely on the publishing companies to provide accurate and complete accounts of their inventories. Such inventories are used by the City for invoicing purposes. Since publication box amenities are available in the marketplace for this contract and are in place at other municipalities, including this as a new amenity would improve the look of these units on the streetscape as well improve program management responsibilities around inventory and associated revenue accountability.

5. **Bike racks (required)** - Contractor provided bike racks are currently advertising funded however the contract governing these units has since expired and the City sees no revenue as a result. Steps to correct this through a short term contract are in progress however bike racks remain on the streets for program continuity. These bike racks are of radically different design than those installed through in-house works. They are larger in height, width and depth, have more rings, and more vibrant in colour. Bundling this amenity into a new contract will improve streetscape appearance.

6. **Cigarette receptacles (required)** - Cigarette receptacles are not currently advertising funded and are relatively new amenities on the streetscape. Demand
for them is growing so adding them to the contract as an amenity will create an expenditure avoidance opportunity. Their unique, thin shape will challenge bidders to be creative on how to incorporate this amenity into the program cluster. Bidders will be asked to provide prices with and without butt collection and disposal so that this activity can be compared to the cost of in-house collection and disposal services.

7. Transit shelter (required) - The contract with CBS Outdoor Advertising for this existing amenity expires on December 31, 2015. There are exclusivity rights in the current contract so this amenity would be included as a deferred item to take effect January 1, 2016 in a new contract.

8. Traffic signal controller boxes/advertising only (optional) - Controller boxes are located at signalized intersections throughout the City. Due to their flat side, box shape and their ideal locations at busy intersections, there is a commercial advertising revenue generation opportunity worth exploring in the RFP. The Operations & Maintenance Division has a $10,000 revenue target included in its 2009 operating budget for this item.

9. Park, trail, open space bench (optional) - Benches currently exist in all park locations, and some trail and open space locations delivered through in-house works. Introducing advertising funded programs to these environments is not a traditional approach to park style amenity programs due to the nature of parks, trails and open spaces as peaceful and beautiful places to enjoy, away from the urban bustle, noise and the array of visual distractions. This is an expenditure reduction and avoidance opportunity that should be investigated and bidders again will need to be creative on how to incorporate this amenity into these uniquely attractive environments.

10. Parks, trail, open space single stream litter container (optional) - Single stream litter containers currently exist in all park locations, and some trail and open space locations, delivered through in-house works. Introducing advertising funded programs to these environments is not a traditional approach to park style amenity programs due to the nature of parks, trails and open spaces as peaceful and beautiful places to enjoy, away from the urban bustle, noise and the array of visual distractions. Bidders will need to be creative on how to incorporate this amenity into these uniquely attractive environments. This furniture element would only be needed in instances where a multi stream container cannot or should not be installed. Bidders will be asked to provide prices with and without litter/recycling collection and disposal so that this activity can be compared to the cost of in-house collection and disposal services.

11. Park, trail, open space multi stream litter container (optional) - Multi stream litter containers currently exist in a 2-barrel format in some park locations, but do not currently exist on trails and or in open space locations. Introducing advertising funded programs to these environments is not a traditional approach to park style amenity programs due to the nature of parks, trails and open spaces as peaceful and beautiful places to enjoy, away from the urban bustle, noise and the array of visual distractions. Given the desire to expand recycling programs into parks in particular, this is an expenditure avoidance opportunity that should be investigated and bidders again will need to be creative on how to incorporate this
amenity into these uniquely attractive environments. Units should also be considered in open space and trail locations along the same principles as park locations. High incidence of reported contamination in multi stream litter containers at park locations provides the opportunity to incorporate a community education component requirement into the RFP. Bidders will be asked to provide prices with and without litter/recycling collection and disposal so that this activity can be compared to the cost of in-house collection and disposal services.

12. **Electronic street banner (optional)** - This would be a new streetscape amenity worthy of investigation as a revenue generation opportunity at locations to be identified. It could automate the existing street banner program at the two current locations. Other opportunities respecting improved civic messaging could also be incorporated. The City’s Sign Bylaw provisions would govern the advertising component of this element.

13. **Electronic billboard (optional)** - This would be a new streetscape amenity worthy of investigation as a revenue generation opportunity at locations to be identified. Locations on the LINC and Red Hill Valley Expressways at interchanges could also be considered. Other opportunities respecting improved civic messaging could also be incorporated. The City’s Sign Bylaw provisions would govern the advertising component of this element.

14. **Billboard (optional)** - The contract is currently with Pattison Advertising at 10 locations with 20 faces and is due to expire on August 2011. There are no exclusivity rights in the current contract so new locations can be assigned. Bundling this amenity as a deferred item into a new contract for the current locations and adding new locations are opportunities worthy of investigation.

15. **Automated public washroom (optional)** - This would be a new streetscape amenity worthy of investigation at locations to be identified to make the City more liveable and visitor friendly.

16. **Information board (optional)** - This would be a new streetscape amenity worthy of investigation at locations to be identified which could be used to promote civic events or other information to be determined by the City.

17. **Postering board (optional)** - This amenity is not yet on the streetscape but is an in progress initiative through Downtown Renewal specifically for BIA areas to be maintained by Operations & Maintenance (Roads) once installed. The purpose of this amenity is to contain the posting of flyers normally spattered throughout the streetscape on various pieces of street furniture, telephone poles, streetlights etc., through the designation of space for such postering. Adding this amenity to a new contract will provide an expenditure avoidance opportunity.

18. **Telephone booth (no jurisdiction)** - The City does not have any jurisdiction over the existence of this amenity other than to enforce site specific placement issues governing sight line and clearance type issues through encroachment. This amenity is not in scope for this contract.

19. **Mail box (no jurisdiction)** - The City does not have any jurisdiction over the existence of this amenity other than to enforce site specific placement issues...
governing sight line and clearance type issues through encroachment. This amenity is not in scope for this contract.

Guiding Principles:

The RFP will be developed with the following guiding principles:

**Improved image - streetscape appearance**

The expiry of the City’s bus bench furniture contract in 2009 presents the City with an opportunity to make significant improvements to the look, feel and image of our streetscapes through an expanded and more co-ordinated furniture contract. Image is a strategic theme in the City’s Strategic Plan around “changing the perceptions of Hamilton and promoting the City as a great place to live, work and play” and is therefore a Council priority.

This initiative is based on a vision of creating an identifiable streetscape look through the procurement of a family of products that provides for functional, durable and attractive elements to effectively harmonize and mitigate the current clutter and disparate design elements, allow for pedestrian traffic flow, and reduce the overall amount of advertising on the streetscape through the “clustering” and designation of advertising elements within the cluster. Such a program properly designed, managed and under one contract would harmonize the existing “hodge podge” appearance, function and placement of specific existing furniture amenities on the streetscape, through the bundling of amenities. Geographic distinctiveness considerations, addressing design and advertising concerns in BIA or other designated areas would be included in the RFP. Updated standards for design, maintenance and placement of furniture would reduce clutter and litter and beautify City streetscapes. The intent of the RFP is to harmonize amenities over time. Effects will not be immediate and will be contingent on the number of permitted exceptions. Advertising clutter can be reduced through the designation of amenities within the amenity cluster and possibly reduced significantly through the designation of larger scale amenities such as electronic and regular billboards and street banners in exchange for the provision and maintenance of furniture without advertising at “ground level” on streets or in parks. The RFP will be developed to attract creativity from bidders.

**Improved Civic Messaging**

A provision for a portion of the inventory to be made available for public service announcements will be incorporated into the RFP. Such messaging to be at the discretion of the City and can include support messages for shopping local, litter and graffiti prevention, and civic and community events. A provision for a portion of the inventory to be made available for charitable organizations, actively marketed by the contractor, will also be incorporated into the RFP.

**Better value for money**

The RFP recommendation is premised on achieving better value for money through appropriate service level improvements to the program either through zero net gain to the program (higher service, same cost) or through net gain (higher service, reduced costs and/or increased revenues). Actual bid results will determine extent of value.

**Enhanced revenue generation**
Increased revenue through expanded inventory (scope and area of service) and/or in revenue formula to be determined through competitive bid process, including consideration for guaranteed minimum revenue will be assessed. Of the 19 amenities listed in Table A, only 3 currently attract advertising revenue. The bus bench furniture contract $40,000, transit shelter contract $325,000 and billboard contract $90,000 generate a total of $455,000 annually.

**Expenditure avoidance**

New furniture amenity types or additional quantities of amenities than present which will be required in future at no or less capital or operating cost to the City. Actual bid results will determine extent of expenditure avoidance.

**Expenditure reduction**

A reduction in existing capital and/or operating costs to the City respecting current furniture amenities through alternate service delivery opportunities will be assessed. Actual bid results will determine extent of reduction.

**Improved contract management**

A single administrative and improved customer service process on a family of amenities for more effective program management in the areas of placement, installation, maintenance and removal of amenities is proposed. The programs are currently managed “passively” (i.e. complaint driven) based on current resources. The new program should be “actively” managed with additional resources for contract management and patrol functions which could be funded through enhanced revenues in a new contract or through other means such as expenditure reduction or avoidance. There will be consideration for a guaranteed minimum to finance new staff for this purpose. Actual bid results will determine viability.

**RFP Evaluation Criteria**

RFP evaluation criteria is to be developed but will consider amenities as individual elements and within the total cluster of elements respecting (a) design (b) technical functionality (c) maintenance plan, (d) financial package and other considerations to be determined.

**ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION:**

Bus bench furniture program - bring in-house. This is not recommended as it would result in either the replacement of this furniture at City expense through new sources of capital and operating dollars not budgeted, or alternatively, result in the loss and non replacement of existing seating and litter container amenities for transit customers. There would also be a loss in revenue to the City of approximately $40,000 per annum. Advantages would be a reduction in the amount of commercial advertising on the streetscape.

Status quo - continue to manage existing and future works amenity specific using current practices. This is not recommended as it would ignore a full range of program improvement opportunities available in a co-ordinated street furniture program as set out in this report.

Hybrid - a selection of any combination of amenities (per Table A) through a combination of service delivery methods (contracted vs. in-house) that changes current
practices. This is not recommended as it would ignore a full range of program improvement opportunities available in a co-ordinated street furniture program as set out in this report.

**FINANCIAL/STAFFING/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS:**

**Financial Implications:**

1. **Better value for money**
   The RFP recommendation is premised on achieving better value for money through appropriate service level improvements to the program either through zero net gain to the program (higher service, same cost) or through net gain (higher service, reduced costs and/or increased revenues). Actual bid results will determine extent of value.

2. **Enhanced revenue generation**
   Increased revenue through expanded inventory (scope and area of service) and/or in revenue formula to be determined through competitive bid process, including consideration for guaranteed minimum revenue will be assessed.

3. **Expenditure avoidance**
   New furniture amenity types or additional quantities of amenities than present which will be required in future at no or less capital or operating cost to the City. Actual bid results will determine extent of expenditure avoidance.

4. **Expenditure reduction**
   A reduction in existing capital and/or operating costs to the City respecting current furniture amenities through alternate service delivery opportunities will be assessed. Actual bid results will determine extent of reduction.

**Staffing Implications:**

Contract management - the new program should be “actively” managed with additional resources for contract management and patrol functions which could be funded through enhanced revenues in a new contract or through other means such as expenditure reduction or avoidance. There will be consideration for a guaranteed minimum to finance new staff for this purpose. Actual bid results will determine viability. Staff to report back.

Alternative service delivery – the new program may impact existing staff involved in in-house installation and maintenance activities. Actual bid results will determine extent of impacts if and will be reported by staff.

**Public Works**

1. **Operations & Maintenance Division implications**

   **Business Services** - lead role in the street furniture program review with support from City wide staff working group. RFP, reporting and contract management responsibilities will reside in this unit.

   **Roads** - increased or reduced operating impacts associated with a new program respecting in-house installation and maintenance activities involving quantities of existing amenities or introduction of new amenities. Actual bid results will determine extent.
Parks - increased or reduced operating impacts associated with a new program respecting quantities of existing amenities or introduction of new amenities. Actual bid results will determine extent.

Traffic - there is a $10,000 revenue target included in the 2009 operating budget for commercial advertising on traffic signal controller boxes. Actual bid results will determine viability.

2. Waste Management Division implications - the Waste Management Division presently provides collection service to more than 600 litter containers and public space recycling containers with varying degree of collection frequency. Pending the results of the RFP and decision by Council, collection service could be included as part of the overall package of services under the responsibility of the successful proponent or this work may continue to be provided by the Waste Management Division.

In the event that the City places additional litter/public space recycling containers throughout the City and collection services continue to be provided by City forces, although some efficiencies could be expected by use of existing resources in the present daily operations, additional staffing and equipment resources would be necessary. The requirement for additional resources is dependent on number of containers serviced, frequency of service, type of container (single stream or multi-sort) and style of container (physical aspects of container i.e. top access vs. side access, size, etc.). Benefits of conducting service internally includes better management of material quality (contamination), greater focus on diversion and goal of 65% diversion from landfill, increased recognition of importance of maintaining service level and container appearance/condition. Pending the decision by Council on moving forward with this process, union participation will be solicited for staffing impacts.

3. Transit Division implications - Street furniture at bus stops must meet all present and anticipated requirements under Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act. Cleanliness (litter container emptying, butt removal, sweeping of platforms and raking of abutting sod) is an important maintenance element for bus stop amenities. The design of, and materials used in, street furniture should discourage graffiti. Removal of graffiti from street furniture should be as easy and inexpensive as possible. Street furniture licensees should fall under continuous scrutiny with respect to meeting a satisfactory level of maintenance, with the execution of appropriate penalties for non-compliance.

Transit is of the opinion that the financial penalty for early termination of the current transit shelter agreement as early as January 1, 2011 is not in the City’s best interests and should not be considered. Showing transit shelters as an optional amenity in Table A, for possible inclusion in a future street furniture contract after 2015 is acceptable.

Revenue from the advertising shelter component of any future street furniture agreement must flow to the Transit Division for inclusion in the Division’s budget, since it acts as an important factor in helping to minimize any transit fare or property tax increases.
Planning and Economic Development Department

1. Development and Real Estate Division Implications

There are a number of important planning policies and documents that have bearing on the design and placement of street furniture. In general, Planning Staff support the unified approach of the contract which harmonizes the street furniture yet offers opportunities for customization of the furniture for the purposes of community identity in areas such as BIA’s, historic districts, gateways, other special places with existing themes or trends. The Community Planning and Design Section of the Planning Division has undertaken a number of Streetscape Master Plan Projects in the Downtown and elsewhere. These Streetscape master plans comprise a number of Streetscape issues including street furniture. The Streetscape master plans are undertaken for the City’s important streets such as Downtown Streets and demonstrate the value of public realm improvements for revitalization. Streetscape furniture must be attractive yet functional and must be adaptive to the various urban conditions in the City.

2. Downtown & Community Renewal Implications - The Downtown and Community Renewal Division is in agreement that a coordinated street furniture program under a single provider is required in the City Of Hamilton.

Corporate Services Department:

1. Legal Division implications - Legal will assist in the drafting and evaluation of the RFP and drafting of the contract so that it is in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor.

2. Purchasing Division implications

Purchasing advises that it has no implications.

3. Risk Management Division implications - Risk Management will review the RFP before it is issued to ensure there is adequate protection of City interests.

4. Budgets & Finance Division (Finance & Administration) - Finance & Administration advises that there no implications at this time. Once a new program has been approved, Finance & Administration will work with Business Services to ensure all financial reporting requirements are met.

Community Services Department:

1. Culture Division - The Public Art Master Plan identifies parts of James Street, King William Street and York Boulevard for the installation of public art in the public road allowance. In future it is anticipated that this may also be applied to other pedestrian oriented parts of the City. These streetscapes are often very crowded and any contract to install and maintain street furniture should allow for the possibility that a feature may need to be removed to allow for space for a public art piece without extra cost to the City. In many cases public art is designed as an amenity such as a bike rack or bench. Any contract should also therefore allow contract pieces of street furniture to be replaced with public art pieces at no additional cost or penalty to the City.

It is anticipated that the street furniture contract will generate revenue for the City through advertising in the public realm. The goal of the City public art program is to improve that same public realm. In order to better achieve that goal it is requested that a
portion of the revenue generated from this contract be directed to the public art program.

**POLICIES AFFECTING PROPOSAL:**

City of Hamilton Strategic Plan:

- Strategic Theme - Image “changing the perceptions of Hamilton and promoting the City as a great place to live, work and play”.

- Focus Areas:
  - Skilled, Innovative & Respectful Organization (more innovation, greater teamwork, better client focus)
  - Financial Sustainability (delivery of municipal services and management of capital assets/liabilities in a sustainable, innovative and cost effective manner)
  - Full life cycle costing for capital
  - Address infrastructure deficiencies and unfunded liabilities

- Growing our Economy
  - An improved customer service
  - A visitor and convention destination

- Environmental Stewardship
  - Reduced impact of City activities on the environment

- Healthy Community
  - Plan and manage the built environment

Public Works Strategic Plan:

- Communities – services our communities connect with and trust
  - The leader in the “greening” and stewardship of the City
  - Mutually beneficial charters with external customers
  - Services adapted to differences in communities

- Processes – smart processes to match our needs
  - Business planning processes are defined and aligned

Commercial Advertising & Sponsorship Policy - All advertising generated through the award of this RFP would have to comply with the City of Hamilton’s existing policies.

Purchasing Policy - The award of this RFP is not in contravention of any Purchasing policies.

Barrier-Free Design Standards - Any future street furniture contracts must have a thorough regard for the Barrier-Free Design Standards.

Urban Braille Design - Any future street furniture contracts must have a thorough regard for the Urban Braille Walkway system.

Sign By-law - Any furniture or apparatus installed as a result of this RFP would have to comply with the City of Hamilton’s existing policies.
Solid Waste Management Master Plan (SWMMP) - The recommendations in this report are guided by the Solid Waste Management Master Plan (SWMMP) and support the following recommendations of the SWMMP:

- Recommendation #2 - Contributing to the optimization of the Glanbrook landfill.
- Recommendation #3 - Contributing to the City’s 65% diversion target.
- Recommendation #19 - That the City lead by example.

**RELEVANT CONSULTATION:**

Staff Working Group: Public Works Department - Operations & Maintenance Division; Business Services, Parks & Cemeteries, Roads; Waste Management Division; Transit Division; Capital Planning & Implementation Division; General Manager’s Office; Planning and Economic Development Department - Development and Real Estate Division, Downtown and Community Renewal Division; Corporate Services Department - Legal Division, Purchasing Division.

Other internal consultation: Operations & Maintenance Division (Traffic), Risk Management, Budgets & Finance Division (Finance & Administration), Culture Division

External stakeholders: HABIA, Clean City Liaison Committee, Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities (Built Environment Sub Committee), Downtown Clean & Safe Taskforce

**CITY STRATEGIC COMMITMENT:**

By evaluating the “Triple Bottom Line”, (community, environment, economic implications) we can make choices that create value across all three bottom lines, moving us closer to our vision for a sustainable community, and Provincial interests.

**Community Well-Being is enhanced.** ☑ Yes  ☐ No
Public services and programs are delivered in an equitable manner, coordinated, efficient, effective and easily accessible to all citizens.
Opportunities for physical activity are supported and enhanced.

**Environmental Well-Being is enhanced.** ☑ Yes  ☐ No
Waste is reduced and recycled.
A sustainable transportation network provides many options for people and goods movement; vehicle-dependency is reduced

**Economic Well-Being is enhanced.** ☑ Yes  ☐ No
Hamilton's high-quality environmental amenities are maintained and enhanced.

Does the option you are recommending create value across all three bottom lines?  ☑ Yes  ☐ No

Do the options you are recommending make Hamilton a City of choice for high performance public servants?  ☐ Yes  ☑ No