MINUTES
HAMILTON LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee)

Thursday, October 27, 2005
12:00 noon – Committee Room 110
Hamilton City Hall, 71 Main Street West, Hamilton

Present:
D. Dent (Chair), A. Charlton (Vice-Chair), Councillor M. Pearson, A. French, D. Reid, A. Denham, P. Shaker, M. Stark, L. Toews, K. Wakeman, S. Wray and W. Buchko

Absent with Regrets:
Councillor B. McHattie – Committee of the Whole

Also Present:
T. McCabe, Director, Development & Real Estate
B. Farkas, Manager and Property Coordinator
B. Janssen, Manager, Community Planning & Design, Real Estate
D. Cuming, Sr. Project Manager, Community Planning & Design
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner, Community Planning & Design
S. Vattay, Cultural Heritage Planner, Community Planning & Design
C. Pimental, Intern, Community Planning & Design
S. Paparella, Legislative Assistant, Clerk’s Office

The meeting was called to order.

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 1)

There were none declared.

2. CHANGES TO AGENDA (Item 2)

The Clerk noted the following changes, which were approved:

1. Item 6.1 – the Delegation of Elaine Scrivener and Dennis Wilson of the Hospital Family Houses of Ontario will be heard after Item 8.2.

2. Added as Item 7.5 – Bill Farkas, Manager and Property Coordinator, respecting St. Mark’s Church.

3. Added as Item 8.11 – Recommendation to Designate 281 Herkimer Street, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 1)
4. Item 11.7 – Policy Sub-committee minutes, has been distributed under separate cover and is on the table before you.

5. Item 8.11 – Recommendation to Designate 281 Herikimer Street, ON

6. Item 8.12 – Hamilton City Hall – Verbal Update

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)

S. Wray requested that the following amendment be made to the September 22, 2005 minutes of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee):

Special thanks be given to the students working for the Flamborough Heritage Society, Zachary Horn for his research and production of the Inventory of Hamilton cemeteries, Aaron Pingree for the accompanying photograph collection and to the Chairmanship of the Inventory and Research Sub-Committee for the accompanying text. The City’s Heritage staff will provide the introduction and cover design for the volume.

(Reid/French)
That the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) meeting minutes, dated September 22, 2005, be approved, as amended.

AMENDMENT CARRIED
MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED

6. DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

6.1 Elaine Scrivener and Dennis Wilson, Hospital Family Houses of Ontario and Hamilton Health Sciences respecting 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, Ontario: the proposed site of the Mark Preece Family House

The delegation was heard after Item 8.2 – Recommendation to Designate 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 2) in order that they could hear staff’s recommendations, prior to commenting.

It was the recommendation, of Hospital Family Houses of Ontario, that the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) defer the issue of the cultural heritage designation of the Smart Turner building, at 191 Barton Street East, until April 2006. This recommendation was put forward to enable Hospital Family Houses of Ontario to develop a plan for the building, for its use as the Mark Preece Family House, and report back to the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) in April 2006.

(Buchko/Charlton)
That the presentation be received.

CARRIED
7. STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 7)

7.1 Tim McCabe, Director of Development and Real Estate respecting Carnegie Gallery, 10 King Street West, former Town of Dundas, Ontario

For the Committee's information, T. McCabe supplied a copy of staff Report (PED05090) – Declaration of Surplus Lands/Sale, Carnegie Gallery – 10 King Street West, Dundas, Ontario (Ward 13), and provided a verbal overview of the report.

(Toews/Wakeman)
That a letter of thanks be forwarded to T. McCabe and his staff with respect to their assistance with this matter.

CARRIED

7.2 Tim McCabe, Director of Development and Real Estate respecting the Auchmar Estate, 88 Fennel Avenue West, Hamilton, Ontario

T. McCabe updated the Committee on the current status of the property and advised that there had been some interest by several parties in the acquisition and re-use of the Auchmar Estate. T. McCabe also advised that a preliminary structural report had been carried out on the main house and that some structural deterioration had occurred in the basement and foundation walls.

Committee members expressed concern about the structural condition of Auchmar.

(Reid/Wakeman)
That the Committee advise Council that in the forthcoming budget deliberations a source of funding be found in order to undertake repair work at Auchmar and that such funding not exceed $100,000.

CARRIED

7.3 Tim McCabe, Director of Development and Real Estate respecting the Marketing of Heritage Properties

Marketing of heritage properties is currently on the Development and Real Estate Division's 2006 work plan (fourth quarter) and will require additional staff in order to implement.

Mr. McCabe explained the process that was used in the City of Kitchener noting that there was an Adaptive Reuse Committee that was a separate Committee from the Kitchener LACAC, but was Chaired by the LACAC Chair.

The Adaptive Reuse Committee reviewed obstacles and gateway properties, which were being neglected. They looked at issues such as how to change
by-laws and standards, and how to make the system easier for people to develop and own heritage properties.

The Adaptive Reuse Committee not only assessed heritage properties, but also vacant properties; both City owned and private, with the consent of the property owners.

Some sites were pre-approved for certain types of development projects, and a prospectus was developed to market those properties. Properties were zoned and rezoned and a loan program was put into place offering up to half the value of the required studies up to a maximum of $20,000. Park dedication and development charges were waived to attract builders, and the Building Department would walk through a building with a prospective buyer, in an advisory capacity, to point out what would be required to bring the building up to code.

CDs were also produced for twenty (20) sites and sent to all area real estate agents, builders and developers to market the properties.

(Toews/Stark)
That Items 7.1 to 7.3 be received.

CARRIED

7.4  Bill Farkas, Manager and Property Coordinator, respecting Tweedside Church, Mud Road, Hamilton, Ontario

Council has identified Tweedside Church as surplus property; therefore, the property was put on the market six (6) months ago through advertisements on the HALP (Historic Architecture Linking Program) web site, through 2005 Doors Open, and to-date there has been no interest in the property.

As the City is unable to sell the property, due to its size, the adjacent cemetery and the green belt, the City is moving forward with a tender for contracts to demolish the church. Staff is; however, trying to determine what artefacts can be removed, preserved and made available for the public, prior to demolition.

7.5  Bill Farkas, Manager and Property Coordinator, respecting St. Mark’s Church, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton, Ontario

Staff is trying to determine an adaptive reuse, and has obtained a structural report by an engineer. Staff will be meeting in the next few weeks to determine if the building can be reused and what costs would be associated in order to bring the building into compliance with the Building Code.
Once the report and analysis are complete, the City is considering marketing the property for sale, and is estimating that it will be put on the market in Spring of 2006.

(Wakeman/Buchko)
That Items 7.4 and 7.5 be received.

CARRIED

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)

8.1 Memo respecting 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, Smart-Turner Building Designation

Staff provided an information memo informing the Committee that following a meeting with the Executive Director and the Project Manager for the Mark Preece Family House (potential future owners of the property being considered for designation), staff is amending the Staff Report of August 2005 regarding the designation of 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, to include the following:

As the building is currently being considered for adaptive reuse that will necessitate the conversion of the former industrial building into a living space (short-term stay residence), it is anticipated that physical changes to the building fabric will be undertaken. It is important to note that alterations to designated buildings under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act are allowed. These changes are assessed through the Heritage Permit process. Changes that will most likely be required by the potential future owners include additional openings for light to penetrate the internal space. Also required would be a new entrance which will result in an addition or additions to the existing structure.

This proposed adaptive reuse of this former industrial building would allow for the preservation of the past while building for the future. Recycling of buildings has become a common occurrence in communities which strive for environmental sustainability. The most successful built heritage adaptive reuse projects are those that best respect and retain the building’s heritage significance and add a contemporary layer that provides value for the future. Adaptive reuse is sometimes the only way for a buildings’ fabric to be properly cared for where a building can no longer function with its original use (as is the case with the Smart-Turner Building).

For these reasons, it is acknowledged that alterations and additions will be considered in the future.

(Charlton/Toews)
That this item be received.

CARRIED
8.2 Recommendation to Designate 191 Barton Street East, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 2)

Staff presented an overview of a staff report and associated cultural heritage assessment, together with a power point presentation.

(Wray/Reid)
That the City of Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) advise Council:

(a) That the designation of 191 Barton Street East, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, 1990, be approved.

(b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of the Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix A, be approved.

(c) That Corporate Counsel be directed to take appropriate action to designate 191 Barton Street East under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix B.

CARRIED

8.3 National Recognition of the Auchmar Estate (88 Fennel Avenue West, Hamilton) by the Historical Sites and Monuments Board of Canada (Ward 8)

The Committee was in receipt of a staff report addressing the Auchmar Estate and its recognition as a national historic site.

(Charlton/Toews)
That Council direct staff to request that the Historic Sites and Monuments Board of Canada re-evaluate the heritage status of the Auchmar Estate, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton, with respect to its potential cultural heritage value as a property of national interest.

CARRIED

It was noted by D. Cuming that staff would reference the “walled garden” in the final staff report to the Planning and Economic Development Committee.

8.4 Request to Designate 4 Forest Avenue and 207, 209 and 211 James Street South, Hamilton

Staff provided a memo and a brief overview of the subject property and the property owner’s request to designate 4 Forest Avenue and 207, 209 and 211 James Street South, Hamilton.
(Charlton/Reid)
It is recommended that staff be directed to carry out a cultural heritage assessment of 4 Forest Avenue and 207, 209, 211 James Street South, Hamilton, to determine whether the property is worthy of designation and further that if the property is determined to be of cultural heritage value or interest that staff prepare a Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of Heritage Attributes for consideration by the City of Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) through its appropriate subcommittee.

CARRIED

8.5 Delegation of Council Consent to Staff for Alterations to Designated Property Under the Ontario Heritage Act (PED05096) (City Wide)

The Committee was in receipt of staff report PED0596 that had been referred back to the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) from the Planning and Economic Development Committee for further comment and review. Following a presentation from T. McCabe and D. Cuming, Committee members discussed the addition of a further condition in the staff recommendation that would assist in clarifying the delegation process.

(Shaker/Buchko)

a) That, pursuant to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act, the power to consent to alterations to property designated under the Ontario Heritage Act be delegated to the Director of Development and Real Estate, Planning and Economic Development Department, as per the draft By-law attached as Appendix A to Report PED05096(a), subject to prior consultation with the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee), or, in the case of Heritage Conservation Districts, the Cross-Melville District Advisory Committee or the Mill Street District Advisory Committee as applicable.

b) That this delegation authority does not apply nor is it extended to any proposed decision by the Director of Development and Real Estate that is not in accordance with the recommendation of the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee), the Heritage Permit Subcommittee or any of the Conservation District Advisory Committees.

c) That the draft By-law, attached as Appendix A to Report PED05096(a), which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to Corporate Counsel, be enacted by Council.

AMENDMENT CARRIED
MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED
8.6 Pigott Building Poster – Funding of Posters

(Reid/Buchko)
That up to $3,500 be made available, from the designated “Poster Account”, for the design, proofing and printing of one (1) set (250 posters per set) of each of the two (2) posters for the Pigott Windows Series.

CARRIED

8.6.1 Pigott Building Poster – Price of Posters

(French/Wakeman)
That posters for the Pigott Windows series be sold at a price of $10.00 to $15.00 per poster; with all funds raised being returned to the designated “poster account” for future Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) initiatives.

CARRIED

8.6.2 Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) Brochure

The Committee requested several amendments be made to the brochure, as follows:

• That a telephone extension be provided with the telephone number in the “For more information contact” section;
• That the City of Hamilton logo be moved from the top to the bottom, centre of the front section;
• That the Committee name read “Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee)” in full and be made to fit on two lines – Hamilton LACAC on the first, and “(Municipal Heritage Committee)” to be made to fit on the second line (may need smaller font).
• That the second paragraph under the header “Funding Opportunities” be full justified to match the others; and,
• That this print be limited to 100 copies, as a pilot print to determine interest and usage.

(Reid/Toews)
That the 2005 Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) brochure be approved, as amended.

AMENDMENT CARRIED
MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED

8.7 Hamilton-Wentworth Heritage Association Heritage Volunteer Service Awards

This item was provided to Committee members for review and interest. Members who wish to provide a nomination submission, for the Hamilton-
Wentworth Heritage Association Heritage Volunteer Services Awards, were
directed to forward their submissions directly to Art French or Michael
Gemmell (as noted on form). Deadline for submissions is November 15,
2005.

8.8 Lighthouse and Keeper’s Cottage – Proposed Replacement Plaque Text

This item was deferred to the November 24, 2005 meeting of the Hamilton
LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee).

8.9 CHO 2006 Special Conference Notice

This item was deferred to the December 15, 2005 meeting of the Hamilton
LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee), in order that any new members may
be provided the opportunity should they wish to be considered.

8.10 Queen’s Park Report, dated October 7, 2005

D. Cuming advised the Committee that he had spoken with the City of
Guelph and was informed that the land owner was requesting a demolition
permit under the Planning Act, and the owner had appealed to the OMB.

This property is not designated; however, the OMB had allowed the
Committee the choice to designate or not. It was the choice of the City of
Guelph Council not to act upon this decision.

8.11 Recommendation to Designate 281 Herkimer Street, Hamilton, Under
Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 1)

Staff presented an overview of a staff report and associated cultural heritage
assessment, together with a power point presentation.

(Shaker/Wray)
That the City of Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) advise
Council:

(a) That the designation of 281 Herkimer Street, as a property of cultural
heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario
Heritage Act, 1990, be approved.

(b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of the
Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix A to this report, be
approved.

(c) That Corporate Counsel be directed to take appropriate action to
designate 281 Herkimer Street under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage
Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix B to this report.

CARRIED

8.12 Hamilton City Hall – Verbal Update

Staff presented an overview of the current repairs as a follow up to Item 7.3 of the August Agenda. The deteriorated marble slabs along the front of the Council Chamber will be replaced with new marble slabs taken from the marble that is currently cladding the loading dock piers at the rear of the building. While the proposal in August was to demolish the glass Italian mosaic tiles on the underside of the Council Chamber (a designated feature), further assessment has shown these to be stable and they will, for the most part, be preserved.

Staff confirmed that a heritage specialist will be employed as part of the team undertaking the City Hall renovations and that a heritage permit would be submitted to the Heritage Permit Subcommittee once the overall design of the renovation is prepared.

(Wray/Charlton)
That the update be received.

CARRIED

11. GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)

11.1 St. Mark’s Church Structural Report – Update

11.2 Prospective Strathcona Heritage Conservation District Study – Update

11.3 Joint Plaquing Sub-committee Minutes (no copy)

11.4 Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee

No update.

11.5 Education Sub-committee

(a) Minutes of the Education Sub-committee, dated October 4, 2005

(b) Minutes of the Education Sub-committee, dated October 13, 2005

11.6 Inventory and Research Sub-committee

No update.
11.7 Policy and Design Review Sub-committee

Minutes of the Policy Sub-committee, dated October 6, 2005

11.8 Plaquing Priority Sub-committee

This sub-committee has not met as of yet; therefore, there was no update provided. It was also noted that D. Reid’s membership with the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) was ending at the end of November 2005, and that she would not be reapplying, at this time; therefore, another member will be required to join the Plaquing Priority Sub-committee, should the sub-committee still be necessary.

11.9 City Housing Hamilton Report respecting the Proposed Residential/Commercial Development: 87-89 King Street East, Hamilton, Ontario

(Reid/Shaker)
That Items 11.1, 11.2, 11.5(a) and (b), 11.7 and 11.9 be received. CARRIED

11.10 Endangered Buildings:

(a) Victoria Hall (NHS, D) – P. Shaker
No update.

(b) Treble Hall, John Street North, Hamilton (L) – D. Reid
No update.

(c) Red Hill Creek Valley, Hamilton (L, ND) – Councillor M. Pearson
No update.

(d) Lister Block, James Street North, Hamilton (D) – D. Dent
LIUNA and Hi Rise will be reviewing the Heritage Impact Assessment report prepared by their consulting architect on October 31, 2005. Tim McCabe’s office will have copies of the report for the end of next week. Should someone require a copy, contact T. McCabe’s office at 905-546-2424 ext. 4258.

(e) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue, Hamilton (D) – D. Dent
No further update.

(f) Hamilton City Hall, 71 Main Street West, Hamilton (ND) – W. Buchko
No further update.
(g) Smart-Turner Building, 191 Barton Street E. (ND, L) – D. Dent
No update.

(h) Carnegie Gallery, Dundas (D) – M. Stark
No further update.

(i) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – D. Dent
No further update.

(j) Tweedside Church (L) – K. Wakeman
No further update.

(k) Former CIBC Building, 281 Herkimer Street, Hamilton (L) – P. Shaker
No update.

(l) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton – D. Reid
No update.

(m) Book House (remaining) – A. Charlton
No update.

11.11 CHO News – Quarterly Publication, October 2005 (to be distributed)

11.12 Heritage Matters Publication, September 2005 (to be circulated)

11.13 Correspondence from the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation, dated October 7, 2005, respecting 71 Main Street West, Hamilton City Hall Complex – Objection to Designation Withdrawn

11.14 Community Heritage Ontario – Dealing with Conflict in Heritage Workshop – October 29, 2005

11.15 Community Heritage Ontario – Building a Heritage Landscape Guide for Your Community Workshop – November 19, 2005

11.16 Ontario Heritage Tree Alliance

(Reid/Shaker)
That Items 11.10 through 11.16 be received for information. 

CARRIED

13. ADJOURNMENT

(Wakeman/Wray)
There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 2:10 p.m.