Present: A. French (Chair)  
M. Kirk, R. Simpson, S. Stewart-Greene, F. Thorp-Neufeld,  
K. Wakeman, S. Wray and G. Zajac

Absent with Regrets:  
Councillors B. McHattie and B. Bratina, City business  
Councillor M. Pearson, family commitment  
A. Denham-Robinson (Vice Chair), other commitment  
A. Charlton, heritage seminar  
M. Adkins, vacation

Also Present: B. Khes, Acting Manager Community Planning and Design  
D. Cuming, Senior Project Manager, Heritage and Urban Design  
M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner  
B. Williamson, Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner - Student  
I. Bedioui, Legislative Assistant, City Clerk’s Office

The meeting was called to Order. Chair French reminded Committee members to speak through the Chair and to be mindful of proper meeting decorum.

Chair French introduced Britney Williamson, the new Co-op student and invited her to address Committee.

1. **CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

(a) Frances Thorp-Neufeld is introducing a motion, added as Item 9.1(k), to reconsider Item (k)(a)(xi) of the Minutes respecting the removal of All Saints Church from the endangered buildings list. Copies have been distributed.
(b) The reference in Item 9.1(d) to an attached Report PED09212 is removed as this was an Item on the previous agenda.

(Wakeman/Kirk)
That the agenda be approved as amended.

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

George Zajac declared an interest with respect to Item 7.1 as the owners of the property are clients of one of his co-workers at IBI Group and he left the room during consideration of this item.

3. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 3)

(a) Delegation – Mr. K. Klaver respecting the Demolition of the Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster, Ontario (Approved July 23, 2009) (Item 3.1)

Mr. Klaver was in attendance with, Mr. Bob Wilkins, a retired lawyer from Ancaster and a friend of Mr. Klaver. Mr. Wilkins addressed Committee on his behalf.

Mr. Wilkins indicated that he is very interested in preserving heritage and he has been involved in the restoration of about 19 or 20 buildings in Ancaster and also in the conversion of a former bank located at 1 Main Street West, Hamilton into law offices.

Mr. Wilkins advised that when Mr. Klaver bought the property 30 years ago, the building had already sustained considerable damage because it was not built on a proper foundation. A third of the walls had fallen down. The west wall and the north section had been replaced with concrete block. His daughter lived in the house for a time but moved out because of mould. The estimates for repairs are more than $300,000. The house is situated 23 hundred feet from the street and it cannot be seen from the road. It is not economically practical to repair it where it is located and it is a safety concern.

Mr. Wilkins indicated that he is a member of the Ancaster Village BIA and during the next three months the BIA will be investigating whether the house could be relocated to Main Street, Ancaster where it could
be used for commercial rent. He has a site in mind. The economic feasibility of restoring the building will also be investigated. Perhaps the façade could be saved. They will report back to Committee with their findings and if relocation and repairs are not feasible, at least every effort would have been made and they will then apply for a demolition permit.

Mr. Wilkins distributed photos of the building showing the concrete block which was added in the 1950’s or 1960’s noting that not very much of the building is original.

Staff briefly responded to questions with respect to the process for relocating the building and for applying for a demolition permit and the location of the property was clarified for the Committee.

(Wakeman/Stewart-Greene)
That the delegation from Bob Wilkins on behalf of Klaas Klaver be received.

CARRIED

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(Kirk/Stuart-Greene)
(a) That Item (l)(e) respecting Smith Family Cemetery be amended by changing the word “placing” with the word “place” and the word “replacement” with the word “original” to read as follows:

“K. Wakeman shared some good news with Committee; informing them that a plaque was going to be placed at the Smith Family Cemetery (Garner and Upper James), and that City staff were going to place the seven (7) original headstones back at the cemetery in time for the unveiling of the plaque.”

(b) That the Minutes of the August 27, 2009 meeting, of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)

None
6. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 6)

(a) Delegated Approvals (Item 6.1):

(i) Heritage Permit Application (Turret Siding, Windows and Eaves Repair), 65 Fifth Concession Road East, Flamborough, Ontario (Item 6.1.1)

(ii) Heritage Permit Application (Front Porch and Step Replacement), 228 Saint Clair Boulevard, Hamilton, Ontario (Item 6.1.2)

(iii) Heritage Permit Application (Windows Roof and Entry Alterations), 16 Sydenham Street, Dundas, Ontario (Item 6.1.3)

(iv) Heritage Permit Application (Cladding Test), 314 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, Ontario (Item 6.1.4)

(v) Heritage Permit Application (Fence and Driveway Installation), 50 Mill Street North, Waterdown, Ontario (Item 6.1.5)

(vi) Heritage Permit Application (Removal of the Existing Front Door and Installation of a New Replica Door), 256 MacNab Street North, Hamilton, Ontario (By-law 89-176) (Item 6.1.6)

(vii) Heritage Permit Application (Removal of Existing Wood Windows and Installation of New Aluminium Clad Windows), 29 Markland Street, Hamilton, Ontario (Durand-Markland Heritage Conservation District) (Item 6.1.7)

(viii) Heritage Permit Application (Repairs to the Masonry and Exterior Rendering on the Westerly Bay of the North Elevation of the Main House), 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton, Ontario (Auchmar House By-law 2000-37) (Item 6.1.8)

(ix) Heritage Permit Application (Masonry Repairs to Pilasters and Steps), 51 Stuart Street, Hamilton, Ontario (Hamilton Customs House) (Item 6.1.9)

(x) Heritage Permit Application (Awnings), 398 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, Ontario (Item 6.1.10)

(xi) Heritage Permit Application (Replacement Windows), 81 Mill Street North, Waterdown, Ontario (Item 6.1.11)
(xii) Heritage Permit Application (Repair and Replacement of Components of Four Wooden Columns), 41 Jackson Street West, Hamilton, Ontario (Whitehorn By-law 77-239) (Item 6.1.12)

(xiii) Heritage Permit Application (Replacement of Roofing Materials), 1073 West 5th Street, Hamilton (Item 6.1.13)

(Wray/Kirk)
That Items 6.1(a)(i) to 6.1(a)(xiii) be received.  

CARRIED

(ii) Staff Reports/Recommendations (Item 6.2)

(i) Heritage Permit Application (HP2009-030) Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act to Erect a Building at 1014 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton Beach Heritage Conservation District), Hamilton (Ward 5) (Item 6.2.1)

Meghan House briefly outlined the report and requested that Committee support the staff recommendation.

(Wakeman/Kirk)
That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council:

That Heritage Permit (HP2009-030) be approved for the erection of a new two-storey, single-family dwelling, on the designated property at 1014 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton Beach Heritage Conservation District), Hamilton, subject to the following conditions:

(a) That details are provided for material and colour of entry and garage doors, windows, vents, chimneys, trim, hardware, and lights, to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning Staff.

(b) This approval expires November 30, 2011.  

CARRIED

In response to questions from Committee, Meghan House explained that, as this proposal is to construct a house in a heritage conservation district, the drawings for the proposed building are subject to heritage conservation guidelines.
7. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS

(i) Designation Request – Petition from Wynnstay Heritage Protection respecting the property located at 437 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, Ontario known as the Wynnstay Estate, formerly Dalley Estate, presently Mount Mary Immaculate (Item 7.1)

Meghan House explained that a draft plan of subdivision on the subject lands was initially considered by the Economic Development and Planning Committee last year. Although a heritage impact assessment was prepared by the proponent the item was subsequently tabled early this year while other studies were completed. A proposed staff condition was anticipated which would have included designation of the property by Council. She indicated that staff are supportive of designation based on the report prepared by the heritage consultant indicating both provincial and national value.

(Kirk/Wray)
(a) That the petition from the Wynnstay Heritage Protection be received.

(b) That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee supports the petition from the Wynnstay Heritage Protection and is supportive the Wynnstay Estate, formerly Dalley Estate, presently Mount Mary being designated under the Ontario Heritage Act;

(c) That this matter be considered as part of the Economic Development and Planning Committee’s deliberations and staff report PED08306 and that designation under part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act be included as part of the condition of any Council approval.

CARRIED

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)

(a) Report PED09241 – Request to Designate 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton (known as the Barton Reservoir) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Item 8.1)

Meghan House provided a brief overview of the Report, which was approved by Council on September 16, 2009, and explained that it is
(Wakeman/Kirk)
(i) That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee concurs with Council’s recommendation that 111 Kenilworth Access, Hamilton (known as the Barton Reservoir) be added to the municipal register of property of cultural heritage value or interest;

(ii) That the East End (Barton) Reservoir be removed from the Buildings and Landscapes of Concern List.

CARRIED

(b) Report PED08053 – Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the City’s Heritage Inventory (Item 8.2)

The Chair advised that this report was included on the agenda for the Committee’s review prior to the October meeting when the issues of the Heritage Impact Assessment process and the creation of a designated priority list will be on the agenda as directed at the August meeting.

David Cuming added that this Report should also be considered in conjunction with Item 10.4 regarding the Stoney Creek Historical Society Priority Designation List as it outlines the strategy which Council has approved with respect to adding properties of cultural heritage value or interest onto the City’s register and the City’s heritage inventory.

A short discussion followed with respect to the list in Appendix A of the Report entitled Sample Heritage Inventory Record: Stoney Creek.

(c) Education and Communication Sub-Committee – Bookmark Designs Samples (Item 8.3)

The Chair briefly described the bookmarks and advised that the owners of the private properties whose photos appear on the bookmarks have been contacted and are in full agreement with the proposal. The printing cost is $275.00 for 500 bookmarks and the
printing will take a week to complete. This project is not expected to make any money but the hope is that the costs will be recuperated and the plan is for this to be an annual undertaking.

(Kirk/Wray)
(a) That the bookmark designs for 281 Herkimer Street (now 263 Locke Street – Judy Marsales Real Estate Limited), 88 Fennell Avenue West (Auchmar) and 343 Wilson Street East (the Spas at Ancaster) be approved for printing and distribution;

(b) That Item (e) respecting bookmarks be deleted from the outstanding business list

CARRIED

9. Buildings and Landscapes

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – Councillor B. McHattie
No updates

(ii) Lister Block, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
Meghan House distributed photos of the Lister Block taken from 2008 to 2009 showing the progress of the work undertaken to date.

(iii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – G. Zajac
George Zajac indicated that except for the heritage permit included on today’s agenda (Item 6.1.8), there has been no change.

(iv) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) – M. Adkins
No updates

(v) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
No updates.

(vi) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
No updates

(vii) **Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton**
No changes

(viii) **The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins**
The Chair noted the recent Council approval for the conversion of the hotel into condominiums.

(ix) **Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton**
See Item 3.

(x) **46 - 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene**
No updates

(xi) **Motion to reconsider the removal of All Saints Church from the endangered buildings list. (Added Item 9.1(k))**
Frances Thorp-Neufeld advised Committee that after the last meeting she had a change of heart about removing All Saints Church from the endangered buildings list and is presenting a reconsideration motion regarding the matter.

**Thorp-Neufeld/Wray**
That Item (k)(a)(xi) of the August 27, 2009 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Minutes respecting the removal of All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South from the Endangered Buildings and Landscapes List be reconsidered.

CARRIED

The Committee discussed the importance of keeping this property on the list.

**Thorp-Neufeld/Wray**
That Item (k)(a)(xi) of the August 27, 2009 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Minutes be amended by inserting the word “not” after the word Hamilton and before the word “be” to read as follows:

That All Saints Church, located at 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton **not** be removed from the Endangered Buildings and Landscapes list.
(xii) **New Additions to the Endangered Buildings and Landscapes List:**

Kathy Wakeman proposed that, in light of the new development being undertaken by St. Joseph’s Hospital, the Committee consider adding Grove Hall, Hickory House and Gateview and the Auchmar complex which includes two 1960’s buildings to the endangered buildings and landscapes list.

The Committee discussed the issue and approved the following motion:

(Wakeman/Kirk)

That Grove Hall, Hickory House, Gateview and Century Manor and the surrounding landscape be added to the list of Endangered Buildings and Landscapes.

CARRIED

(b) **Buildings and Landscapes of Concern**

(i) **Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins**

No updates

(ii) **Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton - F. Thorp-Neufeld**

No updates

(iii) **Dundas Post Office, Dundas (L) – F. Thorp-Neufeld**

Frances Thorp-Neufeld advised that the Dundas Post Office is listed as a building of architectural and historical interest and it is being sold and will no longer be owned by the Crown. The residents of Dundas have expressed an interest in designating the façade and the tower and have requested that the necessary paperwork be started prior to the sale being finalized.

David Cuming confirmed that Committee may request designation as per the Council approved process.

(Thorp-Neufeld/Wakeman)

(a) That Council be advised that staff be directed to prepare a cultural heritage assessment of the Dundas Post Office to determine whether the property is worthy of
designation, and present their recommendations to the Economic Development and Planning Committee for consideration;

(b) That Council be advised that the cultural assessment of this property be considered as a high priority in the staff work program.

CARRIED

(iv) Old Lyric Theatre, 14 Mary Street, Hamilton (D) – R. Simpson

No updates

(v) East End (Barton) Reservoir – M. Adkins

Removed – see Item 8(a) above.

10. GENERAL INFORMATION

(a) Cultural Heritage Landscape Workshop (Item 10.1)

There were no volunteers to attend this workshop.

(b) Ontario Heritage Trust Launches Online, Province-Wide Places of Worship Inventory (Item 10.2)

For information.

(c) Heritage Permit Application, 130 Mill Street North, Dundas, Ontario – Information Only (Item 10.3)

For information.

(d) Stoney Creek Historical Society Priority Designation List, July 2009 (Item 10.4)

Kathy Wakeman acknowledged that the City has a Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and the City’s Heritage Inventory and indicated that the purpose for this additional list and the photos is for information and to draw attention to these properties located in the Stoney Creek area as there are concerned citizens who have been trying to have them designated.
(e) Severance Application respecting the Marshall House property

(Art French noted that the severance application for the Marshall House property will be before the Committee of Adjustment again on October 1, 2009.)

(Wakeman/Thorp-Neufeld)
That Items 10 (a) to (e) be received for information.

CARRIED

11. New Business

(Kathy Wakeman advised that a resident of Winona has expressed concerns about saving a stone fence and she distributed photos.)

Staff suggested she provide them with the address to determine the location and whether the fence is on private property or a road right of way.

(Frances Thorp-Neufeld indicated that during her trip to Ireland last year she noticed how fences defined certain areas and added to the cultural landscape.)

12. ADJOURNMENT

(Stewart-Greene/Wakeman)
There being no further business, that the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting be adjourn at 1:15 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Art French, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Ida Bedioui
Legislative Assistant,
City Clerk’s Office
September 24, 2009