Present: Deputy Mayor B. Clark (Chair)
Mayor B. Bratina
Councillors C. Collins, S. Duvall, J. Farr, L. Ferguson, T. Jackson,
B. Johnson, S. Merulla, B. Morelli, J. Partridge, R. Pasuta,
M. Pearson, R. Powers, T. Whitehead

Absent with Regrets: Councillor B. McHattie – Illness

Also Present: C. Murray, City Manager
R. Rossini, General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services
G. Davis, General Manager, Public Works
T. McCabe, General Manager, Economic Development & Planning
J. Soldera, A/General Manager, Community Services
R. Hall, A/Medical Officer of Health
C. Biggs, Co-ordinator, Committee Services/Council/Budgets
C. Newman, Legislative Assistant

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REPORTED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. 2011 Property and Liability Insurance Renewal (FCS10094) (City Wide) (Item 4.1)

(Powers/Pearson)
(a) That the Liability and Property Insurance coverage for the term January 1, 2011 to January 1, 2012, be renewed through Jardine Lloyd Thompson Canada Inc (JLT). at a cost of $3,658,415 (net of applicable taxes) in accordance with Appendix “A” to Report FCS 10094;

(b) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed to execute all associated documents on behalf of the City;
(c) That the 2011 Premium Costs in the amount of $3,658,415 (net of Applicable taxes) be funded through the 2011 Risk Management Services Budget.  

CARRIED

2. 2011 Tax Supported User Fees (FCS10093)(City Wide) (Item 5.1(b))

(Powers/Pearson)
(a) That the 2011 User Fees contained in Appendix “A” to Report FCS10093 “2011 Tax Supported User Fees”, be approved and implemented;

(b) That the City Solicitor and Corporate Counsel be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary by-laws, for Council approval, for the purposes of establishing the user fees contained within Appendix “A” to Report FCS10093.

CARRIED

3. Protecting the Taxi Scrip Program – Recommendation from the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities (PW10098) (City Wide) (Item 7.3)

(Moreli/Pearson)
That Report PW10098 respecting Protecting the Taxi Scrip Program - Recommendation from Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities, be received.

CARRIED

FOR THE INFORMATION OF COUNCIL:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised of the following changes:

(i) ADDITIONAL DELEGATION REQUESTS

For Today’s Meeting

(aa) Delegation Request from Peter Hutton on behalf of the Transit Users Group, respecting the 2011 transit budget and service plan, fare setting policy and affordable transit pass (Added as Item 3.6)

(bb) Delegation Request from Maureen Leyland on behalf of Common Campaign Coalition, respecting views on Public Transit 2011 recommendations and Transit Fare Increase Policy (Added as Item 3.7)
(cc) Delegation Request from Tom Cooper on behalf of the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction, respecting HRPR’s partnership with the City on the affordable transit pass, and on accessible, affordable public transit services in Hamilton generally (Added as Item 3.8)

(dd) Delegation Request from William Rosart respecting handi-capped transportation and driver attitudes (Added as Item 3.9)

(ee) Delegation Request from Rose DiGiovanni, More Outreach Program, Saint Thomas More School, respecting students from low-income families who struggle with language and with the cost of bus fare to attend school (Added as Item 3.10)

For Future Meeting(s)

(ff) Delegation Request from Pat Wright on behalf of the Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion (HCCI) respecting funding for 2011 (Added as Item 3.11)

(gg) Delegation Request from Dr. Margaret Denton on behalf of Hamilton Council on Aging, to request that the City of Hamilton become a partner in making Hamilton an Age-Friendly City and consider becoming a member of the World Health Organization's network of age-friendly cities (Added as Item 3.12)

(hh) Delegation Request from Annelisa Pedersen on behalf of the Hamilton Philharmonic Orchestra respecting issues and impacts of rising costs at Hamilton Place (Added as Item 3.13)

(ii) CORRESPONDENCE

(ii) Correspondence from David Hitchcock respecting transit fares

(iii) NOTICE OF MOTION

Request for One-time Funding – Kiwanis Boys and Girls Club

(Pearson/Powers)

That the agenda be approved, as amended. CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

Councillor Ferguson declared a conflict with respect to the User Fees, specifically with respect to the Taxi Licensing component as he is an investor in the taxi industry.
(c) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 4)

(Bratina/Duvall)
That the Rules of order be waived to allow the following delegations to address the Committee at today's meeting:

(i) Delegation Request from Budh Dhillon, ATU Local 107, to present the Union’s views on the Transit budget (Item 3.1)

(ii) Delegation Request from John McIntyre and John McGowan, McMaster Students’ Union, to present the student perspective regarding the HSR and public transit in the City of Hamilton (Item 3.2)

(iii) Delegation Request from Peter Hutton on behalf of the Transit Users Group, respecting the 2011 transit budget and service plan, fare setting policy and affordable transit pass (Added as Item 3.6)

(iv) Delegation Request from Maureen Leyland on behalf of Common Campaign Coalition, respecting views on Public Transit 2011 recommendations and Transit Fare Increase Policy (Added as Item 3.7)

(v) Delegation Request from Tom Cooper on behalf of the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction, respecting HRPR’s partnership with the City on the affordable transit pass, and on accessible, affordable public transit services in Hamilton generally (Added as Item 3.8)

(vi) Delegation Request from William Rosart respecting handicapped transportation and driver attitudes (Added as Item 3.9)

(vii) Delegation Request from Rose DiGiovanni, More Outreach Program, Saint Thomas More School, respecting students from low-income families who struggle with language and with the cost of bus fare to attend school (Added as Item 3.10)

For Future Meeting(s)

On a motion (Pearson/Powers) the following delegation requests were approved to address the General Issues Committee at a future meeting:

(viii) Delegation Request from Peter Hasek respecting propose and support the development of a “How to Guide”, “Q&A Forums” and “workshops” that would help citizens deliver more effective Delegate Presentations at City Committee and Task Force meetings (Item 3.3)

(ix) Delegation Request from Renee Wetselaar, Affordable Housing Flagship, to report on the status of affordable housing from the community perspective (Item 3.4)
(x) Delegation Request from David Speers, General Director, and Stephen Bye, Executive Director, Opera Hamilton, respecting financially debilitating costs at Hamilton Place for Opera Hamilton (Item 3.5)

(xi) Delegation Request from Pat Wright on behalf of the Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion (HCCI) respecting funding for 2011 (Added as Item 3.11)

(xii) Delegation Request from Dr. Margaret Denton on behalf of Hamilton Council on Aging, to request that the City of Hamilton become a partner in making Hamilton an Age-Friendly City and consider becoming a member of the World Health Organization’s network of age-friendly cities (Added as Item 3.12)

(xiii) Delegation Request from Annelisa Pedersen on behalf of the Hamilton Philharmonic Orchestra respecting issues and impacts of rising costs at Hamilton Place (Added as Item 3.13) CARRIED

(d) PRESENTATIONS

(i)(a) 2011 Tax Supported User Fees (Item 5.1)(a)

Rob Rossini introduced the report and advised that this is the first step toward the 2011 budget process. Today’s meeting will deal with budget reports related to transit.

Mike Zegarac provided a power point presentation on the 2011 tax supported user fees which included:

- Guideline approved by Council with respect to user fee increases
- Revenue generated; revenue estimates for 2011 budget based on the proposed fees contained in the staff report
- For the most part, proposed fees will be effective as of January 1, 2011, although some may require an implementation period after approval and therefore, will be effective some time during 2011
- User fees not included, including transit fares, building permit fees, planning/development engineering fees; farmers’ market stall fees
- Fee restructuring – recreation (program fees) and Animal Control proposing changes to their fees in an effort to better streamline the fee structure
- Guideline increases
- Increases less than guideline; increases more than guideline
A copy of the power point presentation was distributed to the Committee and has been retained in the Office of the City Clerk for the public record.

Councillor Whitehead asked if staff has entertained the idea of doing a jurisdictional review relative to subsidies provided by other municipalities and what is the average subsidy level. Staff indicated that this information will be provided.

Councillor Powers noted that there are different fees for identical programs; is there a move to have consistency of fees for programs in all locations. Staff responded that this is the intent.

(Whitehead/Pearson) 
That the presentation provided with respect to the 2011 Tax Supported User Fees be received. CARRIED

(i)(b) 2011 Tax Supported User Fees (FCS10093) (City Wide)

The Motion CARRIED on the following vote:

Yeas:  Bratina, Clark, Collins, Duvall, Farr, Johnson, Merulla, Morelli, Partridge, Pasuta, Pearson, Powers
Total Yeas:  12
Nays:  Whitehead
Total Nays:  1
Absent:  McHattie, Jackson
Total Absent:  2
Abstain:  Ferguson
Total:  1

(ii) Transit Fare Increase Policy (PW10078) (City Wide)

Don Hull provided a power point presentation on the Transit Fare Increase Policy and noted that the user fee revenue is significant and accounts for some 50% of expenditures. The presentation outlined:

- Policy steps and examples using the recommended policy and two alternate examples incorporating different scenarios
- Policy applied to the 2010 Budget
- Benefit/Risk of Policy – Pro’s and Con’s
- Fare Comparison with comparator municipalities in the Province.

A copy of the power point presentation was distributed to the Committee and has been retained in the Office of the City Clerk for the public record.

Councillor Ferguson inquired as to what is being done to assist those who are the most marginalized with respect to transit fares. Staff responded that this would be addressed later in the presentation.
(Powers/Pearson)
That the presentation respecting the Transit Fare Increase Policy be received.  
CARRIED

(iii) 2011 Transit Operating Budget and Annual Service Plan (PW10101)  
(City Wide) (Item 5.2)

Don Hull provided a power point presentation on the 2011 Transit Budget and Service Enhancement Plan which included the following:

- Corporate Priority Plan – Key Activities
- SMT Work Plan – Key Activities
- Corporate Strategic Plan – Key Activities
- Organization Chart and Complement

- Scope, including 2010 approved service level standards; $34 million in revenue (fare box and advertising contracts); 287 vehicles; 2,330 bus stops; 160 fare media vendor outlets; 21 loops and terminals; 557 bus shelters; 170,000 live information requests; 477,000 web information visits; 4,250,000 automated information visits
- 2010 Accomplishments
- 2011 Objectives/Initiatives
- 2011 Operating Budget by Cost Category
- Fleet Reserves – Combined HSR and ATS
- Discount Programs
- 2010/2011 Program Drivers
- Fleet Efficiency – 12-year bus life cycle policy
- Benchmarking – revenue/cost ratio; trips per revenue hour; cost per revenue hour; revenue hours per cycle
- ATS Master Plan - AODA multi-year implementation plan
- Results of HSR User Satisfaction Survey

The presentation concluded with the recommendations contained in the staff report.

A copy of the power point presentation was distributed to the Committee and has been retained in the Office of the City Clerk for the public record.

(Pearson/Johnson)
That the presentation respecting 2011 Transit Operating Budget and Annual Service Plan be received.  
CARRIED
(e) **PUBLIC HEARINGS/DELEGATIONS**

(i) **Delegation Request from Budh Dhillon, ATU Local 107, to present the Union’s views on the Transit budget (Item 6.1)**

Budh Dhillon, President Business Agent, and Eric Tuck, Vice President, ATU Local 107, appeared before the Committee. Mr. Dhillon’s comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Areas of Concern, including unrealistic schedules; inadequate service levels; missed connections; lost revenue opportunity; health and safety of employees; hidden liabilities
- Critical Changes over Time – transit service delivery; transit demand; streets and traffic conditions; transit riders; transit need; HSR schedules; HSR service levels.

Mr. Dhillon provided more detail on the above-noted matters and was not able to complete his presentation in the time permitted in accordance with the Procedural By-law; however, a copy of the presentation was provided to the Clerk for the public record.

In response to how does the Union have a process to deal with drivers where there may be documented behavioural issues respecting riders, citizens, visitors, Eric Tuck responded that all complaints are handled and investigated. The Union sits in on all disciplinary hearings. Customer satisfaction is first and foremost. Customer complaints are taken very seriously from the Union standpoint and discipline is carried out where appropriate. The Union does not support inappropriate behavior.

The Committee requested that the Union provide solutions/suggestions with respect to the six areas of concerns expressed.

*(Jackson/Duvall)*

That the presentation from ATU Local 107 be received. **CARRIED**

(ii) **Delegation Request from John McIntyre and John McGowan, McMaster Students’ Union, to present the student perspective regarding the HSR and public transit in the City of Hamilton**

John McIntyre, Vice President, Administration and John McGowan, General Manager, of the McMaster Students’ Union appeared before the Committee. Mr. McIntyre’s comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- McMaster Students’ Union represents 20,000 students on campus, which is a large constituency in the City of Hamilton
- Will be holding a referendum in February with respect to renewal of the student transit pass
Identified two areas of concern – service levels and costs
- One of the frequently expressed concerns is lack of reliability; require more service in the morning (higher frequency)
- Do not support any higher transit fees; looking for increased stakeholder involvement
- Need to see commitment from HSR for increased service levels
- Want to have larger role in consultation not only at contract renewal time, but during the duration of the contract
- Affordability is severe issue with students
- Requesting freeze of fares until service improvements are visible.

A copy of the power point presentation was submitted to the Clerk for the public record.

(Jackson/Johnson)
That the presentation provided by the McMaster Students’ Union be received. CARRIED

(iii) Delegation Request from Peter Hutton on behalf of the Transit Users Group, respecting the 2011 transit budget and service plan, fare setting policy and affordable transit pass (Added as Item 3.6)

Peter Hutton appeared before the Committee on behalf of the Transit Users Group. His comments included, but were not limited to, the following:
- Expressed thanks to the Chair for the tone and proceedings of the meeting
- Reiterate message from previous presentations; needs more attention and public dialogue; people want involvement and a way to do that needs to be figured out
- TUG supports the ATU and agrees that the crisis is getting worse on all routes
- Need to figure out a way in this affordability crisis to deal with this problem
- Would be able to support a package that is moving forward on all fronts if there was some light at the end of the tunnel
- Service problems need to be addressed and a system set up to communicate better

Mr. Hutton submitted his written submission to the Clerk for the public record.

(Pearson/Ferguson)
That the presentation on behalf of the Transit Users Group be received. CARRIED
(iv) Delegation Request from Maureen Leyland on behalf of Common Campaign Coalition, respecting views on Public Transit 2011 recommendations and Transit Fare Increase Policy (Added as Item 3.7)

Maureen Leyland addressed the Committee on behalf of the Common Campaign Coalition. Her comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Thanked the Committee for the opportunity to speak at this meeting
- During the election, the Coalition campaigned to make poverty the priority issue in the municipal election and as a result, the Nanos poll before the election showed that 80% of Hamiltonians thought that poverty was the most important matter for Council to address
- Recommendations do not go far enough
- Focus to improve the lives of low income people who continue to live in poverty
- Freeze fares for three years; leave the fare box alone; use all funding sources to meet the cost for affordable, safe and accessible public transit in Hamilton

A copy of Ms. Leyland’s comments were provided to the Clerk for the public record.

(Johnson/Pearson)
That the presentation on behalf of the Common Campaign Coalition be received.  
CARRIED

(v) Delegation Request from Tom Cooper on behalf of the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction, respecting HRPR’s partnership with the City on the affordable transit pass, and on accessible, affordable public transit services in Hamilton generally (Added as Item 3.8)

Tom Cooper addressed the Committee. His comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- HRPR has been pleased to partner with the City on the rollout of affordable transit pass and encourage continued success of the pass in coming years
- Staff report outlines proposal to continue the affordable transit pass
- Many citizens in the community are still hurting from the economic climate
- In keeping with comments of the previous speaker, City needs to maintain affordability around transit system; investing in public transit is a best practice and not a risk
- Would like to encourage Council to freeze transit fares for three years.
(Powers/Johnson)  
That the presentation on behalf of the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction be received.  

(CARRIED)

(vi) Delegation Request from William Rosart respecting handicapped transportation and driver attitudes (Added as Item 3.9)

William Rosart appeared before the Committee. His comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Uses HSR because it is more convenient than DARTS; however, on several occasions, he has not been picked up, despite the availability of space on wheelchair accessible buses.
- Also, many drivers load wheelchair passengers using the rear doors of the bus, which requires the driver to get out of his seat; passengers get on the bus without paying their fare.
- Drivers will load bus with riders, leaving no room for wheelchair passengers.
- However, there are a lot of good drivers, despite the small number that are criticized.

(Partridge/Pearson)  
That the presentation provided by William Rosart be received.  

(CARRIED)

(vii) Delegation Request from Rose DiGiovanni, More Outreach Program, Saint Thomas More School, respecting students from low-income families who struggle with language and with the cost of bus fare to attend school (Added as Item 3.10)

Rose DiGiovanni and Jessica Dyment, student success teachers at Saint Thomas More School, appeared before the Committee. Their comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Students are at risk because of financial need; here to advocate for students and to show there is more to the issue than formula and figures.
- Urge Council to adopt affordable pass for City’s young people and take into consideration the poverty of young people; do not reduce youth to market-based formula.
- Affordable bus pass for students required for struggling families.
- Affordable transit pass must be extended to school-age children under 19 years old not only during the school season, but year round.
- Making decisions for the most needy and vulnerable in the City.

A copy of the delegations’ comments have been submitted to the Clerk for the public record.
General Issues Committee Minutes December 14, 2010

Miriam Gonzales, a Grade 12 student at Saint Thomas More School, spoke to the Committee of the necessity that bus passes be affordable to students so that they are able to attend school, participate in various school activities and allow them to secure part-time employment.

Councillor Ferguson asked if the School Board has been approached. The presenters responded that they have met with School Board officials; however, nothing has resulted.

(Ferguson/Partridge)
That the presentation on behalf of Saint Thomas More School be received. CARRIED

(f) CORRESPONDENCE

(Morelli/Farr)
That the correspondence from David Hitchcock respecting transit fares, be received. CARRIED

(g) REPORTS TO BE REFERRED TO THE 2011 BUDGET DELIBERATIONS

(i) 2011 Transit Operating Budget and Annual Service Plan (PW10101) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

(Pearson/Partridge)
That the 2011 Transit Operating Budget submission summarized in Appendix “A” attached to Report PW10101, be received and referred to Council’s City-wide budget deliberations. CARRIED

(Jackson/Collins)
That sub-section (b) of Report PW10101 be referred to Council’s City-wide budget deliberations. CARRIED

(ii) Transit Fare Increase Policy (PW10078) (City Wide) Item 7.2)

(Pearson/Jackson)
(a) That Appendix “A” attached to Report PW10078 respecting the Transit Fare Increase Policy be received and referred to Council’s City-wide budget deliberations;

(b) That the subject matter be identified as completed and removed from the General Issues Committee’s Outstanding Business List CARRIED

(iii) Affordable Transit Pass Pilot Program – Change in Status from Pilot to Permanent Program (CS10071(a)/PW10100) (City Wide) (Item 7.4)
(Powers/Pearson)
(a) That the Affordable Transit Pass (ATP) Program enhancement in the amount of $225,050 for 2011 ($335,268 annualized) be referred to the 2011 Budget deliberations for consideration.

(b) That Item "X", respecting the ATP Program Update, be identified as complete and removed from the Emergency & Community Services Committee’s Outstanding Business List.  

CARRIED

(h) REMOVAL OF OUTSTANDING BUSINESS ITEM

(Morelli/Farr)
That the item “Protecting the Taxi Scrip Program from the Recent Increase in Taxi Fares - Recommendation from the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities” be identified as completed and removed from the General Issues Committee’s Outstanding Business List.  

CARRIED

(i) NOTICES OF MOTION (Item 9)

Councillor S. Merulla put the following Notice of Motion forward:

Request for One-Time Funding – Kiwanis Boys and Girls Club

Whereas the Kiwanis Boys and Girls Club has requested one-time funding of $10,000 to support “On Top of the World for Kids”;

And Whereas a commitment from the City of Hamilton will support current commitments from the Provincial and Federal Governments;

And Whereas the current 2010 Tax-Supported year-end forecast is favourable to the amount of $2.6 million.

Therefore be it resolved that the City of Hamilton provide $10,000 in one-time support, to be funded through the 2010 Corporate financials.

(Merulla/Morelli)
That the Rules of Order be waived to allow for the introduction of a Motion respecting Request for One-Time Funding – Kiwanis Boys and Girls Club.

The Motion CARRIED on the following recorded vote:

Yeas:  Farr, Morelli, Merulla, Collins, Jackson, Duvall, Powers
Councillor Clark relinquished the Chair to speak to this issue.

(Pearson/Ferguson)
Call the question.

CARRIED

The motion respecting Request for One-Time Funding – Kiwanis Boys and Girls Club was DEFEATED on the following recorded vote:

Yeas: Farr, Morelli, Merulla, Collins, Jackson, Duvall
Total Yeas:  6
Nays: Bratina, Clark, Pearson, Johnson, Ferguson, Powers, Pasuta, Partridge
Total Nays:  8
Absent: Whitehead, McHattie
Total Absent: 2

(Pearson/Ferguson)
There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted

Councillor B. Clark, Deputy Mayor
General Issues Committee

Carolyn Biggs, Co-ordinator
Committee Services/Council/Budgets
December 14, 2010