Committee of the Whole
MINUTES

9:30 a.m.
November 14, 2008
Webster Rooms
Hamilton Convention Centre

Present:
Mayor F. Eisenberger
Councilors B. Bratina, B. Clark, C. Collins, S. Duvall,
L. Ferguson, T. Jackson, M. McCarthy, B. McHattie,
D. Mitchell, B. Morelli, M. Pearson, S. Merulla, R.
Pasuta, R. Powers, T. Whitehead

Also Present:
J. Rinaldo, Acting City Manager
S. Stewart, General Manager, Public Works
J.A. Priel, General Manager, Community Services
M. Gallagher, Co-ordinator, COW

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REPORTED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

(Collins/Clark)
That the agenda be adopted as amended. CARRIED.

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

3. ADOPTION OF MINUTES

None
4. CONSENT ITEMS

None

5. DELEGATION REQUESTS

(Clark/Jackson)
That the delegation requests be approved. CARRIED.

5.1 Request to address Committee by Sally Palmer, Social Action Committee

5.2 Request to address Committee by Lynn Aquin, Campaign for Adequate Welfare

5.3 Request to address Committee by Cori Aquin

5.4 Rosemarie Chapman

5.5 Peter Hutton

5.6 Don McLean

5.7 Tom Cooper

6. STAFF PRESENTATIONS

New 6.1 Master Plans Overview

Jill Stephen provided an overview of the Master Plan.

Highlighted in the presentation were the following:
1. Existing Policies and Plans
2. Strategic Directions
3. Accomplishments to Date
4. Future Plans

That the presentation be received.

Comments from members of council:
- Addressed two way conversion
- transit operators not in favour of two way streets
- costs for two way conversion
6.2 Presentation on the 2009 Transit Operating Budget (PW08128) (formerly 6.1)

Don Hull provided an overview of the 2009 transit Operating Budget

Highlights
1. Review of Recommendations
2. 2008 Accomplishments
3. 2009 Objectives/Initiatives
4. Executive Summary
   (a) annual incremental implementation of Master Plans
   (b) new investment in public transit
   (c) recommended fare increase
   (d) Expenditure Mitigation Plan
   (e) Transit Operational Review
   (f) Hamilton Street Railway Bus Advertising Contract Renewal 2009-2014
   (g) Recommended Fare Increase
   (h) Service Requests as Recommended by the Transit Steering Committee
   (i) 2009 Recommended Service Enhancements
   (j) Route 20 A-Line Phase I
   (k) Route 44 Rymal Phase II
   (l) Benchmarking

New 6.3 Rapid Transit Update

Jill Stephen provided an overview of the Rapid Transit Update.

Highlights included:
- Hamilton Transportation Master Plan Recommendations
- Metrolinx and MoveOntario 2020
- Work to Date
- Current status
- Next steps
7. PUBLIC DELEGATIONS

5.1 Sally Palmer, Social Action Committee

Presentation submitted – see attached
Requested that council vote against increase
and Approve the Transit subsidy for social assistance recipients

5.2 Lynn Aquin, Campaign for Adequate Welfare

Impressed with work of city staff on various issues
affordable bus pass
Requests council not to approve the transit fare increase
Duty to most vulnerable citizens
Haven’t recovered from last increase
Lower fares means increased ridership
Additional monies could be used for other necessities
Cannot afford another transit increase

5.3 Cori Aquin

Presentation submitted – see attached
Requested that fares not be increased
Takes bus to school
Cost is a great hardship for the family
Few times a month cannot attend school because of no bus tickets

5.4 Rosemarie Chapman

Ms. Chapman addressed the following in her presentation:
- deficiencies of affordable bus program
- daughter does not qualify for affordable bus pass
- bus pass program should be expanded because rules are too limit for those working poor

copy requested of presenter’s presentation

5.5 Peter Hutton

See attached presentation

Mr. Hutton addressed the following in his presentation:
- Affordable Transit Pass
- Transit and People Solely on OW/ODSP
- Service Enhancements
- Further subsidies
Committee of the Whole
Minutes

5 November 14, 2008

5.6 Don McLean

Mr. McLean addressed the following in his presentation:
- conference last week by the province
- committed to in their presentations of the importance in improving transit
- get the sense that there is no vision in Hamilton for improving transit
- don't see our transit as useful and part of the vision and direction of our community
- where are we going, direction we are heading
- other progressive communities – transit and improved services are critical to economic development and the community as a whole

5.7 Tom Cooper, Poverty Round Table

Mr. Cooper addressed the following in his presentation:
- complement previous speakers
- 89,000 people remain below the low income cutoff
- poverty round table is interested in working with the city
- important that the city provide those supports so they can continue to work
- ability to pay for public transit – Hamilton remains near the bottom of the list for residents ability to pay for transit
- Encourage council to expand the affordable transit pass to include ODSP and Ontario Works recipients who work part time

Mayor Eisenberger thanked all the presenters today.

(Powers/Pearson) That the presentations be received. CARRIED.

Recessed to 12:45 P.M.

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS

8.1 Employer Commuter Pass Program (PW08133) (formerly 6.2)

(Merulla/Pearson)

(a) That the General Manager, Public Works be authorized and directed to expand the Employer Commuter Pass Program for City of Hamilton employees to include full-time contract
employees and interns on work terms greater than or equal to one year;

(b) That the General Manager, Public Works be authorized and directed to expand the Employer Commuter Pass Program for City of Hamilton employees to include 50% reimbursement of Burlington Transit and GO Transit passes for eligible employees who live outside of the City of Hamilton;

(c) That the General Manager, Public Works be authorized and directed to offer a pilot Employer Commuter Pass Program to other employers within the City of Hamilton as outlined in this report, funded on a one-time basis to a maximum of $40,000 from Ontario Provincial Gas Tax Reserve, and to report back within nine months on the uptake and financial impacts of the pilot program.

(d) That the General Manager, Public Works be authorized and directed to increase promotion of the Employer Commuter Pass Program.

Councillor Clark Opposed to subsection (b)

8.2 Affordable Transit Pass Pilot Program – Six Month Program Evaluation Results (ECS08051) (City Wide) (formerly 8.1)

(Whitehead/Merulla)

(a) That the Affordable Transit Pass Pilot Program Six Month Evaluation Report attached as Appendix A to Report ECS08051, be received.

(b) That the quarterly reports for the Affordable Transit Pass Pilot Program covering March 1, 2008 to June 30, 2008, attached as Appendix B to Report ECS08051 and July 1, 2008, to September 30, 2008, attached as Appendix C to Report ECS08051, be received.

(c) That the Affordable Transit Pass Program be extended from April 1, 2009, until December 31, 2009.

(d) That funds remaining from the $500,000 allocated to the Affordable Transit Pass Pilot Program from the Social Services Initiatives Reserve be used to extend the program from April 1, 2009, until December 31, 2009.
(e) That the subsidy level of the 2009 Affordable Transit Pass Program monthly pass continue to be 50% of the adult monthly pass rate as approved by Council.

(f) That, if additional administrative support is required during the remainder of the pilot project, the Community Services Department (Special Supports Section) and/or the Public Works Department (Transit Division) be authorized to increase their staff complements by one full-time contract position, each for a total of up to $112,600 accommodated from the $500,000 one-time funding for the Affordable Transit Pass Program.

(g) That the issue of affordable transit be directed to the Hamilton Roundtable for Poverty Reduction for further response.

(Jackson/Merulla)
That subsection (f) be amended as follows:
That staff be directed to report back to Committee of the Whole with reasons needed for the increase to staff complement prior to any action taken on additional administrative support.

AMENDMENT CARRIED.

(McHattie/Merulla)
That staff be directed to report back to Emergency and Community Services in January on the options, costs and impacts of expanding the Affordable Transit Pass Pilot Program to include the ODSP and Ontario Works recipients.

CARRIED.

8.3 2009 Transit Operating Budget (PW08128) (formerly 6.1)

(McHattie/Merulla)

(a) That there be a 0% fare increase in 2009

(b) That the $1.3 million be referred to the overall budget process.

(Merulla/McHattie)
That the question be put.  DEFEATED

(Duvall/Clark)
That the question be put.  CARRIED.
Councillors Ferguson and Whitehead Opposed to putting the question.

The Motion was DEFEATED on Standing Recorded Vote:

Yeas: Whitehead, Merulla, McHattie, Collins, Duvall, Clark
Total: 6
Nays: Powers, Pearson, Mitchell, Jackson, Ferguson, Eisenberger
Total: 6
Absent: Pasuta, McCarthy, Morelli, Bratina
Total: 4

(a) That Council receive the 2009 Transit Division Operating Budget and refer it to City-wide budget deliberations that represents a 0.5% or $213,140 year-over-year increase and an overall 5.6% or $2,313,140 increase inclusive of funding for the transfer of HSR Pension to OMERS as detailed in the Financial section of this report, that includes a fare increase, service level enhancements and an aggressive expenditure mitigation plan as follows:

(i) That the General Manager of Public Works be authorized and directed to implement a Transit fare increase effective January 1, 2009, as described in Table 1 of this report and inclusive of increases across all fare types, such that an increase of 5% in the average HSR fare, or $0.10 per trip across major fare types, is achieved;

(ii) That the General Manager of Public Works be authorized to direct DARTS to implement a $0.10 increase in the price of its ticket fare, effective January 1, 2009;

(iii) Introduction of Phase II and Phase III HSR Route #44 Rymal Road extension to operate between the Ancaster Industrial Park and the Eastgate transit terminal, via Garner Road, Rymal Road and Centennial Parkway during Weekday peak periods, requiring an increase in the Transit approved complement of three (3) Bus Operators from 402.5 to 405.5, at a gross annual operating cost of $503,000, of which $475,000 is to be fully funded from the remaining Provincial Gas Tax;

(iv) Increase DARTS service duration on weekends and statutory holidays to align more closely with HSR service duration at a cost of $59,000;
(v) Introduction of an HSR Summer Youth Pass to allow unlimited HSR trips for all elementary/secondary students aged 19 years and under from Canada Day to Labour Day, offering a 50% discount from the regular cost of $126.00 (2008), with the discount to be fully offset with the additional new ridership that is generated;

(vi) Introduction of a Golden Age Pass to provide free HSR trips for those 80 years of age or older at a projected annual revenue loss of $41,000, with offset funding from the 2009 recommended fare increase;

(vii) Mitigation measures that include restructuring of the 10-year transit fleet capital plan and a corporate diesel fuel rate of $1.13 per litre.

(b) That Council direct staff to include consideration of the following Transit service enhancements in the 2010 budget submission, taking into consideration the outcome of the HSR operational review, as follows:

- Harmonization of DARTS fare structure with HSR fare structure;
- Additional annual DARTS service hours to address latent demand;
- Additional HSR Route 5C West Hamilton trips to Meadowlands;
- Increase in the Taxi Scrip Program coupon purchase cap and subsidy;
- Extension of Waterfront Shuttle to provide increased route coverage;
- Fare-optional transit service on Smog days;
- Expansion of transit service to special events programs;
- Additional HSR service coverage to Dundas;
- Expansion of B Line service duration;
- Extension of Route #2 Barton east of Grays Road;
- Realignment of HSR Routes 11 Parkdale and Route 43 Stone Church.

(Pearson/Powers)
That subsection (a) be amended by: deleting the word “receive” and inserting the word “approve” in the first line

And

Deleting the words “and refer it to City-wide budget deliberations” to read as follows:

(a) That Council approve the 2009 Transit Division Operating Budget which represents a 0.5% or $213,140 year-over-year increase and
an overall 5.6% or $2,313,140 increase inclusive of funding for the transfer of HSR Pension to OMERS as detailed in the Financial section of this report, that includes a fare increase, service level enhancements and an aggressive expenditure mitigation plan as follows:

(i) That the General Manager of Public Works be authorized and directed to implement a Transit fare increase effective January 1, 2009, as described in Table 1 of this report and inclusive of increases across all fare types, such that an increase of 5% in the average HSR fare, or $0.10 per trip across major fare types, is achieved;

(ii) That the General Manager of Public Works be authorized to direct DARTS to implement a $0.10 increase in the price of its ticket fare, effective January 1, 2009;

(iii) Introduction of Phase II and Phase III HSR Route #44 Rymal Road extension to operate between the Ancaster Industrial Park and the Eastgate transit terminal, via Garner Road, Rymal Road and Centennial Parkway during Weekday peak periods, requiring an increase in the Transit approved complement of three (3) Bus Operators from 402.5 to 405.5, at a gross annual operating cost of $503,000, of which $475,000 is to be fully funded from the remaining Provincial Gas Tax;

(iv) Increase DARTS service duration on weekends and statutory holidays to align more closely with HSR service duration at a cost of $59,000;

(v) Introduction of an HSR Summer Youth Pass to allow unlimited HSR trips for all elementary/secondary students aged 19 years and under from Canada Day to Labour Day, offering a 50% discount from the regular cost of $126.00 (2008), with the discount to be fully offset with the additional new ridership that is generated;

(vi) Introduction of a Golden Age Pass to provide free HSR trips for those 80 years of age or older at a projected annual revenue loss of $41,000, with offset funding from the 2009 recommended fare increase;

(vii) Mitigation measures that include restructuring of the 10-year transit fleet capital plan and a corporate diesel fuel rate of $1.13 per litre.

(b) That Council direct staff to include consideration of the following Transit service enhancements in the 2010 budget submission, taking into consideration the outcome of the HSR operational review, as follows:
Committee of the Whole 11 November 14, 2008

Minutes

• Harmonization of DARTS fare structure with HSR fare structure;
• Additional annual DARTS service hours to address latent demand;
• Additional HSR Route 5C West Hamilton trips to Meadowlands;
• Increase in the Taxi Scrip Program coupon purchase cap and subsidy;
• Extension of Waterfront Shuttle to provide increased route coverage;
• Fare-optional transit service on Smog days;
• Expansion of transit service to special events programs;
• Additional HSR service coverage to Dundas;
• Expansion of B Line service duration;
• Extension of Route #2 Barton east of Grays Road;
• Realignment of HSR Routes 11 Parkdale and Route 43 Stone Church.

Motion as amended WAS DEFEATED on a Standing Recorded Vote as follows:

YEAS: Powers, Pearson, Mitchell, Jackson, Ferguson
Total: 5

Nays: Merulla, Whitehead, McHattie, Duvall, Collins, Clark, Eisenberger
Total: 7

Absent: Pasuta, McCarthy, Morelli, Bratina
Total: 4

(Powers/Jackson)

That subsection (a) (i) be amended from .5% to 2.5% and 10 cents per trip to 5 cents per trip

Amendment Defeated on a Standing Recorded vote:

YEAS: Powers, Jackson, Eisenberger
Total: 3

Nays: Pearson, Mitchell, Merulla, Whitehead, McHattie, Ferguson, Duvall, Collins, Clark
Total: 9

Absent: Pasuta, McCarthy, Morelli, Bratina
Total: 4
Committee of the Whole

Minutes

November 14, 2008

(Jackson/Powers)
That matter respecting the 2009 Transit Operating Budget be referred to City Council for disposition.

CARRED.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 2:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayor F. Eisenberger

M. Gallagher, Co-ordinator
Committee of the Whole
November 14, 2008