RECOMMENDATION:

(a) That the designation of 140 Erie Avenue, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, 1990, be approved.

(b) That the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of the Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix A to Report PED06123, be approved.

(c) That the City Solicitor be directed to take appropriate action to designate 140 Erie Avenue, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix B to Report PED06123.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

Following a request from the property owner, the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) directed staff to prepare a Cultural Heritage Assessment for the building at 140 Erie Avenue. It has been determined that the two and one-half storey, brick residence has heritage value due to its association with the residential growth of the City of Hamilton and due to its contextual value in this residential area. It is also a good
example of Queen Anne style of architecture. The property has been assessed according to the Ontario Heritage Act, Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, and is now being recommended for designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

**BACKGROUND:**

In April 2005, Adele Walcott, property owner of 140 Erie Street, requested the designation of the property under the Ontario Heritage Act (see Location Map attached as Appendix C-1 to Report PED06123). At their meeting of April 18, 2005, the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) directed staff to prepare a Cultural Heritage Assessment for the property to determine whether the property is worthy of designation, and further, that if the property is determined to be of cultural heritage value or interest, that staff prepare the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of the Heritage Attributes for consideration by the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee), through its appropriate Sub-committee.

The property has since been assessed using a number of criteria and is recommended for designation (see Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix A to Report PED06123). The Cultural Heritage Assessment Report is attached as Appendix C to Report PED06123.

**ANALYSIS/RATIONALE:**

The intent in designating property is to enable a process of cultural resource management and conservation of identified, valued heritage features. This is usually undertaken through the consideration of subsequent heritage permit applications for alterations and additions to a property.

Designation is typically guided by the process of cultural heritage evaluation and assessment. The process, as evidenced in the attached Appendix C to this report, attempts to clearly identify those heritage values associated with a property. Those properties with clearly defined and distinctive heritage attributes are considered to be more worthy of designation than those where heritage attributes are poorly demonstrated or non-existent.

Following the completion of the cultural heritage assessment and evaluation of the subject property, it was determined by the Inventory and Research Sub-committee and the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) that there is sufficient cultural heritage value associated with this property to warrant designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

This assessment is also in compliance with the Ontario Heritage Act, Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. According to the Criteria, a property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets one or more of the criteria. The subject property at 140 Erie Avenue satisfies three of the criteria: 1. design value (i); 2. historical value (i); and 3. contextual value (i).
ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION:

Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may consider two alternatives: agree to designate property or decline to designate property.

Decline to Designate

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide protection to this heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate changes and demolition). Without designation, the property would not be eligible for heritage grant and loan programs from all levels of government. Designation does not restrict the use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or affect its resale value. Accordingly, staff does not consider this an appropriate conservation alternative. This alternative would not be in keeping with the “Triple Bottom Line” and would not move the City closer to the vision for a sustainable community.

FINANCIAL/STAFFING/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS:

Financial – Not applicable.

Staffing – Not applicable.

Legal – The designation process will follow the requirements of the Ontario Heritage Act and provide for adequate notice of Council’s intention to designate the property to the owner and the Ontario Heritage Foundation. Formal objections may be made under the Ontario Heritage Act and heard before the Conservation Review Board, prior to Council approving the designating By-law.

POLICIES AFFECTING PROPOSAL:

Official Plan policies of the City of Hamilton support the conservation, protection and management of cultural heritage features. Designation of 140 Erie Avenue will be in accordance with these policies.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION:

Pursuant to Subsection 29(2) of the Ontario Heritage Act, Council is required to consult with its Municipal Heritage Committee respecting designation of property under Subsection (1). At its meeting of March 23, 2006, the Hamilton LACAC (Municipal Heritage Committee) considered the Cultural Heritage Assessment (attached as Appendix C to Report PED06123), together with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and Description of Heritage Attributes (attached as Appendix A to Report PED06123), and recommended that Council designate the property at 140 Erie Avenue,
SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 140 Erie Avenue, Hamilton, Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED06123) (Ward 2) - Page 4 of 4

Hamilton, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, and that staff be directed to take appropriate action in this regard.

CITY STRATEGIC COMMITMENT:

By evaluating the “Triple Bottom Line”, (community, environment, economic implications) we can make choices that create value across all three bottom lines, moving us closer to our vision for a sustainable community, and Provincial interests.

Community Well-Being is enhanced. ☑ Yes ☐ No
Arts, culture, archeological and cultural heritage are supported and enhanced.

Designation helps conserve Ontario's heritage, an irreplaceable resource. Protecting our heritage through designation strengthens a community's identity and distinctiveness. Heritage buildings, districts and landscapes create a unique sense of place and a rooted sense of local identity and continuity.

Environmental Well-Being is enhanced. ☑ Yes ☐ No
Waste is reduced and recycled.

It has been estimated that the rehabilitation of older buildings consumes 23% less energy than new construction, therefore, the drain on renewable and non-renewable resources is significantly lower than for new construction. The conservation of designated properties reduces the strain on dump and landfill sites where up to 60% of available space is currently filled with demolition and construction waste. Conservation of designated properties is more economically and environmentally sustainable than new construction, and the reuse of historic resources utilizes existing infrastructure. Our built heritage is a non-renewable resource.

Economic Well-Being is enhanced. ☑ Yes ☐ No
Hamilton's high-quality environmental amenities are maintained and enhanced.

Designated properties can be recycled to lead useful and economically viable lives. When buildings are rehabilitated, the projects are labour intensive, usually using local trades and materials, thus serving as ideal sources of employment. In addition, statistics show that designation maintains, if not boosts, the value of property. Heritage conservation not only makes older neighbourhoods more attractive, it also increases their desirability and value.

Does the option you are recommending create value across all three bottom lines? ☑ Yes ☐ No
Value is created across all three bottom lines as per comments above.

Do the options you are recommending make Hamilton a City of choice for high performance public servants? ☑ Yes ☐ No
Designation and protection of the City’s cultural heritage resources exhibits Council’s commitment to an ongoing program of heritage management.

:SV
Attachs. (3)
STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE AND DESCRIPTION OF HERITAGE ATTRIBUTES

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

140 Erie Avenue, containing a two and one-half storey brick residential building, possesses cultural heritage value due to its architectural and historical associations. Built in 1900, the building with hipped roof and decorative brick detailing is a well-preserved example of Queen Anne style architecture, retaining virtually all of its original architectural features, including windows and transom lights. Historically, the building is a reminder of the residential growth patterns in the City of Hamilton at the end of the nineteenth and early of the twentieth centuries. It continues to contribute to the overall residential streetscape on Erie Avenue.

Description of Heritage Attributes

All four elevations and the hipped roof, including all four brick facades, the window and door openings, the wood eaves on all sides, together with all construction materials and all component features and detailing.
CITY OF HAMILTON

NOTICE OF INTENTION TO DESIGNATE

140 Erie Avenue, City of Hamilton

IN THE MATTER OF THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT and the property in the City of Hamilton known municipally as 140 Erie Avenue

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that the City of Hamilton intends to designate this property as being a property of cultural heritage value.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

140 Erie Avenue, containing a two and one-half storey brick residential building, possesses cultural heritage value due to its architectural and historical associations. Built in 1900, the building with hipped roof and decorative brick detailing is a well-preserved example of Queen Anne style architecture, retaining virtually all of its original architectural features, including windows and transom lights. Historically, the building is a reminder of the residential growth patterns in the City of Hamilton at the end of the nineteenth and early of the twentieth centuries. It continues to contribute to the overall residential streetscape on Erie Avenue.

Description of Heritage Attributes

All four elevations and the hipped roof, including all four brick facades, the window and door openings, the wood eaves on all sides, together with all construction materials and all component features and detailing.

The complete description of heritage attributes may be viewed in the Office of the City Clerk, 2nd Floor, City Hall, 71 Main Street West, during regular business hours.

Any person may, within 30 days after the date of publication of this Notice, serve written notice of his or her objection to the proposed designation together with a statement for the objection and all relevant facts.

Dated at Hamilton, this day of , 2006.

K. Christenson
City Clerk
Hamilton, Ontario
CULTURAL HERITAGE ASSESSMENT REPORT

140 Erie Avenue, Hamilton

City of Hamilton

Prepared by Sharon Vattay, Cultural Heritage Planner
Community Planning and Design Section
(Heritage and Urban Design)
Development and Real Estate Division
Planning and Economic Development Department

for the City of Hamilton LACAC
(Municipal Heritage Committee)

February, 2005
This cultural heritage assessment report is prepared as part of a standard process that assists in determining the cultural heritage value of properties and their prospective merit for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

This report is divided into eight sections.

Section 1 comprises an introduction.

Section 2, *Property Location*, briefly describes the physical location, legal description and dimensions of the property.

Section 3, *Physiographic Context*, contains a description of the physiographic region in which the subject property is located.

Section 4, *Settlement Context*, contains a description of the broad historical development of the settlement in which the subject property is located as well as the development of the subject property itself. A range of secondary sources such as local histories and a variety of historical and topographical maps are used to describe settlement history the subject property’s key heritage characteristics. Primary sources such as oral histories are sometimes used.

Section 5, *Property Description*, describes the subject property’s key heritage characteristics that provide the base information to be used in Section 6.

Section 6, *Cultural Heritage Evaluation*, comprises a detailed evaluation of the subject property using the three sets of evaluation criteria: archaeology; built heritage; and, cultural heritage landscapes.

Section 7, *Cultural Heritage Value: Conclusions and Recommendations*, comprises a brief summary of the Cultural Heritage Evaluation and provides a list of those criteria that have been satisfied in determining cultural heritage value. It also contains a recommendation as to whether or not the subject property should be designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Section 8, *Bibliography*, comprises a list of sources used in the compilation of the report.
CULTURAL HERITAGE ASSESSMENT REPORT

140 Erie Avenue, Hamilton

City of Hamilton

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.0 Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0 Property Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0 Physiographic Context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0 Settlement Context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.0 Property Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.0 Cultural Heritage Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Archaeology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Built Heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Cultural Heritage Landscapes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.0 Cultural Heritage Value: Conclusions and Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Conclusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Compliance with Ontario Heritage Act Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Recommendation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.0 Bibliography</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.0 INTRODUCTION

This cultural heritage assessment examines the heritage attributes of the property located at 140 Erie Avenue in the City of Hamilton, comprising a two and one-half storey brick residential building constructed in 1900. The building is included on the City of Hamilton’s Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and/or Historical Interest.

The property has been evaluated according to a set of criteria, which was endorsed by the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on June 19, 2003, and is used to identify the cultural heritage values of a property and to assess their significance. This evaluation assists in determining a property’s merit for designation under the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. 0.18.

2.0 PROPERTY LOCATION

The subject property is located on the west side of Erie Avenue, south of Stinson Street and north of Alanson Street (refer to Location Map attached as Appendix C-1, Figure 1). The property has a lot frontage on Erie Avenue of 8.33 meters (27.33 feet) and a lot depth of 38.1 meters (125 feet), for a total lot area of 0.032 hectares (0.08 acres), and contains a two and one-half storey, brick residence, the principal focus of this cultural heritage assessment.

3.0 PHYSIOGRAPHIC CONTEXT

The subject property is located within the physiographic region known as the Iroquois Plain, the lowland bordering Lake Ontario, which extends around the western end of Lake Ontario, from the Niagara River to the Trent River—the earliest and most densely inhabited area in Ontario. The flat Iroquois Plain easily accommodated land transportation routes and was thus a prime area for settlement and development.

4.0 SETTLEMENT CONTEXT

First Nation Settlement

With the favourable physiographic setting and ameliorating climate, the Iroquois Plain has attracted human settlement for over 12,000 years. Prehistoric Native settlement of this area occurs early with Paleo-Indian and Early Archaic Cultures (12,000-7,000 BP). Middle and Late Archaic (7,000-3,000 BP) population sizes increased, more substantially in the following Woodland period (3,000-500 BP), typified by large Native villages interspersed with seasonal cabin and hunting sites.

---

1 City of Hamilton GISNet, Municipal property assessment rolls (as accessed in March 2005).


The intensity of the prehistoric occupation is not fully represented by the density of archaeology in the immediate locale. There are three registered archaeological sites within four kilometres of the subject property, including small campsites spanning Archaic to Woodland cultures, in addition to a historic Euro-Canadian occupation. These registered archaeological sites were identified in archaeological assessments of nearby land-developments. Additional unregistered sites may be present in areas not formally archaeologically assessed. It is likely that most sites within downtown Hamilton, associated with Native and early historic settlement in the area, were removed without being recorded during the historical settlement and modern redevelopment of the City of Hamilton.

**Euro-Canadian Settlement**

*The City of Hamilton*

The first Euro-Canadian settlers reached the Head-of-the-Lake, the future site of Hamilton, in 1786. The area, named Barton Township by Lieutenant-Governor John Graves Simcoe, was declared the judicial centre of the District of Gore in 1816, due in large part to the efforts of George Hamilton, a prominent land-owner in the township.

Hamilton was incorporated as a Town by the Legislative Council of Upper Canada in 1833. The boundaries of the new town were Wellington Street on the east, Queen on the west, Burlington Bay on the north, and present day Aberdeen Avenue on the south—thus the location of the subject property was originally beyond the boundaries of the town. With the opening of the Burlington Canal, Hamilton embarked upon an era of prosperity and expansion. Within a decade, the town of Hamilton had experienced a population explosion and became the “largest and most important centre south and west of Toronto.”

With the prosperity and expansion of the 1840s, Hamilton was in the position for incorporation as a city in 1846, and, as with many towns and cities in Ontario, continued population and commercial growth was fuelled by the arrival of the railway—the Great Western Railway in 1852 and the Hamilton & Lake Erie Railroad in 1872. The city’s physical expansion, as a result of the General Municipal Act of 1849, extended the limits east to Wentworth Street and west to

---

4 Ontario Ministry of Culture. Ontario Archaeological Sites Database.


Paradise Road—thus incorporating the lands where the subject property is now located.  

After suffering through a brief depression in the 1860s, Hamilton again experienced rapid growth during the late Victorian era, accelerating to an unprecedented pace during the industrial expansion of the 1880s and 1890s. As more industries were established, offering permanent employment, there was a rapid increase in population and thus, correspondingly, a great demand for housing. Neighbourhood after neighboured was established and built, with the eastern boundary of the city being extended to Sherman Avenue in 1892. These economic booms established the city in a strong economic position well into the first decades of the twentieth century—the period from which the subject building dates.

Stinson Neighbourhood

Barton Township was laid out in a formal grid of lots and concessions by land surveyor Augustus Jones in 1791. The Crown awarded the first lots as grants to United Empire Loyalist settlers, with most of these properties disposed of between 1796 and 1802. The subject property at 140 Erie Avenue is located on a small portion of what was originally Concession 3, Lot 11—land between Emerald and Wentworth Streets and from Main Street to Concession Road, on top of the escarpment. The Crown Patent for this lot was one of many awarded to Robert Land, Jr.

The Land family was one of Hamilton’s foremost families, headed by Robert Land Sr. who was one of the earliest settlers in the Hamilton area. By 1802 Robert Land Jr. owned all of the property between Wentworth and Emerald Streets, from the escarpment to the bay-front, a total of over 300 acres. By the 1850s, Robert Jr. and his two brothers, Abel and Ephraim, had come to own most of the land in this eastern portion of the city, and Land family farms stretched from Barton Street to the Bay, east of Wellington Street. Land’s Wharf, at the foot of Wellington Street, was the site of Abel Land’s shipping business.

---


The area between Wentworth and Emerald, south of Main Street, became the location of the homestead for Ephram Land. (Appendix C-1, Figure 2 – Map of 1850-51) The home and outbuildings were located off Main Street, near where the future Erie Avenue would run. An orchard was planted to the east of the house, up to the property boundary at Wentworth, and a creek ran through the property to the west of the house.

In the third-quarter of the nineteenth century, Land opened his property to development, and by 1875 Stinson Street was continued east across the property and Erie Avenue had been laid out, running south from Main Street. (Appendix C-1, Figures 3 and 4 - Bird’s Eye View 1876 and County Atlas 1875) Some early residential development is recorded on Erie Avenue, south of Stinson Street—these buildings are still extant today. The street ended at the junction with Alanson Street, which, by 1876, also had a number of houses.

Traversing the most southerly portion of Land’s property, and running near the location of the subject property, was the Hamilton and Lake Erie Railway. Established in 1872, this railway line came down the escarpment from the south east and then proceeded northwards down Ferguson Avenue, eventually linking with the Great Western Railway, which ran north of and parallel to Barton Street. (See Figure 3)

By the 1890s, this area had become a well-populated residential neighbourhood. Comprised of a mixture of one-storey frame cottages and two-storey brick dwellings, the neighbourhood would soon be served by Stinson Public School, built 1894-95 at Stinson and Ontario Streets, just to the east of the subject property. (Appendix C-1, Figure 5 – Bird’s Eye View, 1893)

140 Erie Avenue Site

The subject property at 140 Erie Avenue stood vacant until 1900 at which time the existing residential dwelling was erected. It was the last building to be erected on the west side of the street, filling in an unoccupied lot.

The earliest buildings on the street were those at 134, 135 and 136 Erie Avenue. These one-storey frame workers’ cottages are still extant. These were followed by a pair of one and one-half storey frame houses at 130 and 132 Erie Avenue. (Appendix C-1, Figure 6) After the 1890s, two-storey and two and one-half storey brick buildings appeared—such as the ones at 138 Erie Avenue and 144 Erie Avenue, neighbouring the subject property (Appendix C-1, Figure 7 and 8) All of these buildings are currently listed on the City of Hamilton’s Inventory of Buildings of Architectural and/or Historical Significance.

Filling in the vacant lot between 138 and 144 Erie Avenue, 140 Erie Avenue was built in 1900 for R. Mark Hill, whose occupation was recorded in the 1900 City of
Contemporary Context

The subject property at 140 Erie Avenue remains today in the same context as when first built. The area has continued in its residential use and there has been little change to the streetscape over the past 106 years since the building was constructed. (Appendix C-1, Figure 9)

5.0 PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

The property located at 140 Erie Avenue comprises a two and one-half storey brick building dating to 1900. (Appendix C-1, Figure 10) This building is characteristic of the Queen Anne style of architecture, popular in Ontario between 1880 and 1910. The designer of the building is not known at this time.

In the late Victorian period, Queen Anne architecture became a popular style for residential buildings. Typical of the Queen Anne style is the irregular outline or silhouette, projecting multi-storey bays, and multi-sloped roofs.\textsuperscript{14} While the Queen Anne style was one that exploited a variety of materials, including brick, wood, shingles and terracotta, in some of the more modest and vernacular examples, such as this one, materials could be limited to only brick. To add texture and interest to the facades, patterned brick might be used in panels, belt courses and window heads or lintels, and this is the case with 140 Erie Avenue, which includes shouldered window hood-mouldings on all of the openings of the main façade. Another decorative brick detail is found above the ground floor window of the two and one-half storey bay. (Appendix C-1, Figure 11) Also typical of the Queen Anne style were verandas and porches, again often in very ornate materials and forms, but here in a simple, wood form with classical detailing. Windows on Queen Anne buildings varied in size and shape, the glazing of the sash consisting of very large single panes, often with a transom of coloured glass above, as in the example on Erie Avenue.

Building Evolution

There have been only minor changes to the original building design. Pot lighting has been added to the underside of the front porch; aluminium storm windows and doors have been added to the front elevation openings; and new vinyl windows have been inserted in the rear elevation.

Building Description

The building is straightforward in form and plan. On a rectangular footprint, the red-brick residence with stone foundation is finished with a hipped, asphalt-shingled roof with two chimney stacks. There is a prominent overhanging eaves of wood. The asymmetrically placed two and one-half storey bay extends beyond the roofline forming a cross gable peak. This projecting bay is offset by the entrance door, covered by the wood porch. While the porch may not have been original, as is suggested by the partially obstructed hood-moulding detail over the door, it was certainly added soon after construction, as evidenced in the 1911 Fire Insurance Plan. (Appendix C-1, Figure 12 and 13)

East/Front Elevation

The main façade of the building, facing Erie Avenue, is defined by the asymmetrical composition with a two and one-half storey projecting bay on the left and covered entrance on the right. The flat-roofed, wood porch is supported by three Tuscan, fluted columns elevated on panelled plinths. The entablature is detailed with dentils and the railing below has turned balusters. (Appendix C-1, Figure 14) New pot lighting has been discreetly installed in the overhang of the veranda roof.

The entrance doors are most likely original, matching those on the neighbouring house at 144 Erie Avenue. The relatively wide opening with stone threshold accommodates double wooden doors, now behind screen doors. The arched transom above the door is filled with a decorative stained-glass panel which includes the house number. (Appendix C-1, Figure 15)

As is characteristic of the Queen Anne style of architecture, the window openings are of varying sizes. The second storey window directly above the entrance is a typically dimensioned double-hung window with slightly arched head. The stone sill is paired with a shouldered hood-moulding defined by decorative brick work. The two windows in the bay on the first and second storeys are substantially larger. On the first floor the glazing of the sash consists of a very large single pane, with a transom of stained glass. The arched window also has a shouldered hood-moulding. The second storey window is of a similar size but with a slightly different arched head—a reflection of the variety in Queen Anne architecture. A soldier course of brick also defines the hood-moulding of this window. Both windows have a stone sill which continues across the entire bay as a stringcourse. In the peak of the gable is a smaller round-arched double hung window with brick hood-moulding and stone sill.

Other than the brick window mouldings, the only other decorative details on the front façade are the stone stringcourses, the decorative brick panel on the bay between the first and second stories, and the wood vergeboard in the gable.

North and South/Side Elevations
Due to the proximity of the neighbouring buildings on the north and south, the side elevations are little visible and were not afforded any architectural details. The brick walls are defined only by irregularly placed window openings and chimney flues. There is a roof dormer on the north side of the building and a chimney stack on the south.

West/Rear Elevation

An asymmetrically placed brick chimney stack divides the rear façade into two: on the left, a rear entrance door and a second storey window of narrow proportions, and on the right, a first and second storey window. All of the rear windows comprise modern vinyl windows. A roof dormer is situated just off centre by the chimney stack. (Appendix C-1, Figure 16)

6.0 CULTURAL HERITAGE EVALUATION

Since amendment in 2002, the Ontario Heritage Act now enables municipalities to designate property of cultural heritage value or merit that is real property including buildings and structures.

On June 19, 2003, the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee endorsed a set of evaluation criteria for use in assessing cultural heritage resources. The application of these criteria assists in determining the cultural heritage value of a property and its prospective merit for designation under the Ontario Heritage Act. The subject property has been evaluated against these criteria (Archaeology, Built Heritage, and Cultural Heritage Landscapes) as follows:

6.1 ARCHAEOLOGY

Identified or potential archaeological resources can be considered as values meriting inclusion into the reasons for designation of a property. A set of twelve criteria is used to evaluate an archaeological site or measure archaeological potential to determine what attributes, if any, warrant designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The first eleven criteria for designation of an archaeological site are predicated on the presence of an archaeological site. In the case of 140 Erie Avenue, there are no registered or reported archaeological sites located on the subject property.

As a result, only the archaeological potential criterion applies in this assessment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural Definition: N/A</th>
<th>Site Setting: N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Temporal Integrity: N/A</td>
<td>Site Socio-political Value: N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Size: N/A</td>
<td>Site Uniqueness: N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Type: N/A</td>
<td>Site Rarity: N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Integrity: N/A</td>
<td>Site Human Remains: N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Archaeological Potential**

The subject property comprises a two and one-half storey brick residential building, situated in an urban context first developed in the late nineteenth century.

Based on the history and intensity of development and redevelopment activities, both on the subject property and in the area overall, the lot has experienced significant disturbance and therefore has minimal archaeological potential. This criterion is not satisfied.

### 6.2 BUILT HERITAGE

A set of twelve criteria is used to identify and assess the built heritage values of property. All twelve of the criteria were applicable in the case of 140 Erie Avenue and nine were satisfied.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Associations</th>
<th>Integrity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thematic: Applicable</td>
<td>Location Integrity: Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event: Applicable</td>
<td>Built Integrity: Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person and/or Group: Applicable</td>
<td><strong>Environmental Context</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture and Design</td>
<td>Landmark: Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architectural Merit: Applicable</td>
<td>Character: Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functional Merit: Applicable</td>
<td>Setting: Applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Designer: Applicable</td>
<td><strong>Social Value</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public Perception: Applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**HISTORICAL ASSOCIATIONS**

**Thematic**

The subject property is associated with the suburban developments of the City of Hamilton that were a direct result of the economic and industrial prosperity at the end of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

**Event**

Research to date reveals that there are no significant events associated with the subject property.

**Person and/or Group**

The property is not associated with a significant person or group. However, the house was built for R.Mark Hill, a traveller and remained within the ownership of this family for 104 years. This continuous family ownership is significant and has ensured the building’s integrity over time.
ARCHITECTURE AND DESIGN

Architectural Merit
The subject building, in its composition, design and materials, is a good example of Queen Anne style residential architecture with modestly decorative brick work, roof eaves, window openings, stained glass and covered porch. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

Functional Merit
This building continues today to serve the residential function for which it was built. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

Designer
Research has not been able to determine the architect/builder/designer.

Integrity

Location Integrity
The subject building remains in its original location on Erie Avenue. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

Built Integrity
The subject building retains its original architectural configuration of the two and one-half storey brick building with hipped roof and virtually all of the original architectural features and materials are intact, including the brick detailing, the stained glass transoms, the wood porch and the wood doors. Changes to the original fabric have been minimal and have not altered the overall composition or architectural quality. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.

Environmental Context

Landmark
The residential building is part of the streetscape but does not stand as a landmark in the neighbourhood.

Character
The subject property is located in an area that retains its historic character. The building thus contributes to the overall character of the streetscape. It is integrated well with its surroundings, especially with the buildings immediately neighbouring as they are of similar materials, forms and scales. Accordingly this criterion has been satisfied.

Setting
The setting of the subject property has been little altered from the original. Accordingly, this criterion has been satisfied.
SOCIAL VALUE

Public Perception

The subject property was included in the former City of Hamilton’s *Inventory of Buildings of Historical and/or Architectural Interest*, and has been a matter of public record since 1983. Indeed all of the houses on Erie Avenue are listed on the City’s inventory. Therefore, this criterion has been satisfied.

6.3 CULTURAL HERITAGE LANDSCAPES

Cultural Heritage Landscapes can be considered as values meriting inclusion into the reasons for designation of property. A set of nine criteria is used to determine which cultural heritage landscape values and attributes, warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as a Cultural Heritage Landscape.

The application of criteria for designation of a property as a Cultural Heritage Landscape depends upon the property’s characteristics. Types of cultural heritage landscapes that have been identified for prospective inventory and evaluation work are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Farm complex</th>
<th>Waterscape</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hamlet</td>
<td>Railway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial core/streetscape</td>
<td>Abandoned road r.o.w.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial complex</td>
<td>Public park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cemetery/church/rectory or other religious complex</td>
<td>Private garden/estate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roadscape</td>
<td>Agricultural fairground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The subject property at 140 Erie Avenue is currently, and was historically, surrounded by residential buildings of similar age and style. However, in the assessment, only the subject building and its immediate lot are being evaluated for its cultural heritage value. Accordingly, the subject property is not considered to be a cultural heritage landscape for the purposes of this assessment and evaluation.

7.0 CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Conclusions

The subject property satisfies nine of the 12 criteria pertaining to built heritage:

**Thematic:** The subject property is associated with the residential/suburban developments of the City of Hamilton which were a direct result of the
economic/industrial prosperity at the end of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

**Person and/or Group:** The house was built for R. Mark Hill, a traveller and remained within the ownership of this family for 104 years. This continuous family ownership is significant and has ensured the building’s integrity over time.

**Architectural Merit:** The subject building, in its composition, design and materials, is a good example of Queen Anne style residential architecture with interesting brick work, roof eaves, window openings, stained glass and covered porch.

**Functional Merit:** This building continues today to serve the residential function for which it was built.

**Location Integrity:** The subject building remains in its original location Erie Avenue.

**Built Integrity:** The subject building retains its original architectural configuration of the two and one-half storey brick building with hipped roof and virtually all of the original architectural features and materials are intact, including the brick detailing, the stained glass transoms, the wood porch and the wood doors. Changes to the original fabric have been minimal and have not altered the overall composition or architectural quality.

**Character:** The subject property is located in an area that retains its historic character. The building thus contributes to the overall character of the streetscape. It is integrated well with its surroundings, especially with the buildings immediately neighbouring as they are of similar materials, forms and scales.

**Setting:** The setting of the subject property has been little altered from the original.

**Public Perception:** The subject property was included in the former City of Hamilton’s *Inventory of Buildings of Historical and/or Architectural Interest*, and has been a matter of public record since 1983. Indeed all of the houses on Erie Avenue are listed on the City’s inventory.

### 7.2 Compliance with Ontario Heritage Act, Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

According to Subsection 1 (2) of Ontario Regulation 9/06, Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest, a property may be designated under section 29 of the Act if it meets one or more of the following criteria:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it,
   1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,
   i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
   ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture, or
   iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.

3. The property has contextual value because it,
   i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,
   ii. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings, or
   iii. is a landmark.

The subject property has design value because it is a representative example of an architectural style; it has historical value because it has direct associations with a theme; and, it has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area.

7.3 Recommendation

The building located at 140 Erie Avenue, Hamilton, is concluded to be a property of cultural heritage value for the purposes of the Ontario Heritage Act and is recommended for designation under Part IV.

8.0 Bibliography

Publications


**Maps**

Augustus Jones, Barton Township Survey, 1791

Plan of the Town of Hamilton, District of Gore, 1842

Marcus Smith, Map of the City of Hamilton in the County of Wentworth, 1850

*Illustrated Historical Atlas of the County of Wentworth* Ontario, 1875

Bird’s Eye View of the City of Hamilton, 1876

Toronto Lithographing Co., Bird’s Eye View of Hamilton, 1893

Fire Insurance Plan of Hamilton, Ontario, 1911

**Miscellaneous**

City of Hamilton GISNet, Municipal property assessment rolls (as assessed June 2005).

City of Hamilton, Assessment Rolls, Ward 1.

Vernon’s City of Hamilton Directory

*Conserving a Future for our Past: Archaeology, Land Use Planning and Development in Ontario*. An Educational Primer and Comprehensive Guide for

Ontario Ministry of Culture. Ontario Archaeological Sites Database.
Figure 1: Location Map for 140 Erie Avenue, Hamilton
Figure 2 – Map of the City of Hamilton in the County of Wentworth, 1850-51 (Detail showing the property of Ephram Land, with approximate location of subject property marked)
Figure 3 – Bird’s Eye View of the City of Hamilton, 1876 (Detail showing future location of subject property)

Figure 4 – Illustrated Historical Atlas of Wentworth County Atlas, 1875 (Detail of Ward 1, showing future location of subject property)
Figure 5 – Bird's Eye View of the City of Hamilton, 1893 (Detail showing location of subject property. The large open block immediately to the east is the future location of Stinson Street School)

Figure 6: Streetscape view of west side of Erie Avenue, showing 136, 134, 132 and 130 (left to right/south to north). (2006)
Figure 7 – 133 Erie Avenue (subject property partially visible on the left) (2006)

Figure 8 – 144 Erie Avenue (neighbouring the subject property on the south)
Figure 9 – East side of Erie Avenue, looking north from subject property (2006)
Figure 10 – 140 Erie Avenue, east facade (2005)
Figure 11 – 140 Erie Avenue, east facade (2006)

Figure 12 – 140 Erie Avenue, east façade – note partially obscured hood-moulding over the door (2006)
Figure 13 - Goad’s Fire Insurance Plan of Hamilton Ontario, 1911 (Detail of the property at 140 Erie Avenue, dotted line at front defines wood porch)
Figure 14 – 140 Erie Avenue, east façade (2006)

Figure 15 – 140 Erie Avenue, east façade (2006)