SUBJECT: Hamilton Beach Pumping Station Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (PW07154) - (Ward 5)

RECOMMENDATION:

(a) That the General Manager, Public Works, be authorized and directed to file the Hamilton Beach Pumping Station Municipal Class Environmental Assessment Project File Report with the Municipal Clerk for a minimum thirty (30) day public review period;

(b) That the General Manager, Public Works Department, be authorized and directed to proceed with implementation of Alternative 3A – Pumped Outlet from Grafton Avenue under the QEW to a ditch at Eastport Drive, as further detailed in report PW07154.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

A Schedule “B” Municipal Class Environmental Assessment has recently been completed for the Hamilton Beach Pumping Station (see Appendix A). The planning process has identified alternative solutions to the problem. The problem identified for this project is that the existing drainage system cannot effectively protect the Beach Community, and in particular the area from Dunraven Avenue to Arden Avenue, against frequent flooding which is known to result in inundated residential streets and driveways. It has been demonstrated that, at the most favourable downstream conditions (low lake water levels), the existing drainage system for the Beach Community could provide a 10 year level of flood protection. This level of protection is below the 25 year design standard required by the City of Hamilton.
The conclusion is that the preferred alternative is to have the new pumping station outlet from Grafton Avenue under the QEW to a ditch at Eastport Drive. The Project File Report is recommended for filing on the public record and, subject to any comments received, authorizing staff to proceed with implementing the preferred alternative.

**BACKGROUND:**

The City of Hamilton initiated a Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) in March 2007 for the addition of a stormwater pumping station in the vicinity of Grafton Avenue between Beach Boulevard and the Queen Elizabeth Way (QEW).

This project followed the approved environmental planning process for Schedule B projects under the Municipal Engineers Association’s Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (2000).

This Project File Report documents the process followed to determine the recommended undertaking and the environmentally significant aspects of the addition of the proposed stormwater pumping station in the vicinity of Grafton Avenue between Beach Boulevard and the QEW.

**Municipal Class Environmental Assessment**

The Schedule B planning process was followed for this project which requires Phases 1 and 2 of the EA Planning process to be completed:

- Phase 1 Problem Definition
- Phase 2 Identification and Evaluation of Alternative Solutions to determine a preferred solution

Public consultation is a key component of the Class Environmental Assessment process. The public were invited to provide comments for the proposed Hamilton Beach Pumping Station in the Notice of Study Commencement advertised twice in the Hamilton Spectator (At Your Service Section) on March 30 and April 5, 2007.

A Public Information Centre was not held for this Environmental Assessment due to its limited scale.

The majority of public comments received were from nearby residents and residents of the Beach Community not within the study area.

In response to the Notice of Study Commencement, members of the public, government and agencies, submitted comments to the City of Hamilton. In summary, the following general comments and concerns were received:

- Concerned about the size and appearance of the pumping station.
- Concerned about potential impacts associated with the proposed storm water pumping station.
- Concerned about standing water in the interim.
- Inquired about the proposed installation and completion dates.
- Concerned about costs. Noted that costs should not be borne by local homeowners.

All comments received from the Notice of Study Commencement were fully reviewed and responded (where appropriate) to by the City of Hamilton Project Team and were considered when determining the final alternative.
A number of alternative solutions have been considered as part of this study. The following flood protection alternatives have been identified and evaluated:

**Alternative 1**  
Do Nothing

**Alternative 2**  
Gravity Storm Sewer Outlet from Grafton Avenue under the QEW to ditch at Eastport Drive

**Alternative 3A**  
Pumped Outlet from Grafton Avenue under the QEW to a ditch at Eastport Drive

**Alternative 3B**  
Pumped Outlet from Grafton Avenue under the QEW to a ditch at Eastport Drive with a Stormwater Detention Pond

**Alternative 3C**  
Pumped Outlet from Grafton Avenue to Lake Ontario

Table 1 provides a summary of the conclusions drawn from the evaluation of the alternatives.

### Table 1 - Summary of the Evaluation of Alternatives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ALTERNATIVE</th>
<th>CONCLUSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Alternative 1 | Does not provide the required level of flood protection.  
*Not Recommended* |
| Alternative 2 | Most cost-effective alternative. Does not provide the required level of flood protection.  
*Not Recommended* |
| Alternative 3A | Similar construction cost to Alternatives 3B and 3C. Provides the required level of flood protection.  
*Recommended* |
| Alternative 3B | Similar construction cost to Alternatives 3A and 3C. Alternative not feasible due to impacts of the high water table on the stormwater detention pond.  
*Not Recommended* |
| Alternative 3C | Similar construction cost to Alternatives 3A and 3B. Alternative not feasible due to timing associated with approval requirements for the new outlet to Lake Ontario.  
*Not Recommended* |

**Preferred Solution**

Alternative 3A was selected as the preferred alternative. The pumping station will be located in a vacant lot (owned by the Ministry of Transportation) at the terminus of Grafton Street just east of the QEW. The pumping station will generally include a wet well, a superstructure, pumps and motors, standby power, controls and valves. A concrete gravity sewer will convey flows from a collection manhole at Grafton Avenue to the wet well of the pumping station. The flow from the pumping station will then be conveyed through a forcemain under the QEW to a ditch at Eastport Drive.
FINANCIAL/STAFFING/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS:

Financial – Sufficient funds for implementation of the preferred design are proposed within the 2007 Capital Budget for Public Works (Project ID No. 5180662640). The estimated cost for the pumping station is $2.2 million.

Staffing/Legal - N/A

POLICIES AFFECTING PROPOSAL:

- City of Hamilton - Public Works Strategic Plan
  The preferred alternative complies with the City of Hamilton- Public Works Strategic Plan because the goal of constant improvement is achieved. The implementation of the pumping station coincides with the vision of providing services our communities connect with and trust, while ensuring sound financial management.

- City of Hamilton - Public Works Stormwater Management Master Plan
  The preferred alternative is within the study area of the City of Hamilton - Public Works Stormwater Management Master Plan and complies with the strategies of the plan.

RELEVANT CONSULTATION:

As required under the Municipal Class EA, affected public agencies were consulted throughout the planning process. A contact list of potentially interested external participants was developed at the start-up phase of the project.

The Following City of Hamilton Departments were contacted for this project:

- Public Works
- Planning and Economic Development
- Hamilton Emergency Services
- Hamilton Police Services
- Public Health
- Community Services
- City Councillor, Ward 5

The following agencies were contacted for this project:

- Ministry of Culture
- Ministry of Natural Resources
- Ministry of Transportation
- Hamilton Conservation Authority
- Ontario Provincial Police
- Member of Provincial Parliament, Hamilton East
- Ministry of the Attorney General
- Centre for Topographical Information
- Hamilton Executive Directors’ Aboriginal Coalition
- The Chiefs of Ontario
- The Métis Nation of Ontario
- Ontario Federation of Indian Friendship
- Mississaugas of New Credit First Nation
- Ontario Secretariat of Aboriginal Affairs
The following agencies were contacted and provided comments:

- Ministry of the Environment
- Indian and Northern Affairs Canada
- Six Nations Lands And Resources

The notification letter, dated March 26, 2007, and study newsletter were forwarded to the agencies and utilities on the list to provide formal notification of the start of the project in accordance with the Municipal Class EA.

**CITY STRATEGIC COMMITMENT:**

By evaluating the “Triple Bottom Line”, (community, environment, economic implications) we can make choices that create value across all three bottom lines, moving us closer to our vision for a sustainable community, and Provincial interests.

- **Community Well-Being is enhanced.** ☑ Yes  ☐ No
  The addition of a stormwater pumping station in the vicinity of Grafton Avenue between Beach Boulevard and the QEW will pump stormwater under the QEW to a ditch at Eastport Drive, therefore providing the Beach Community with flood protection.

- **Environmental Well-Being is enhanced.** ☑ Yes  ☐ No
  Ecological function and the natural heritage system are protected.
  The preferred alternative will allow for minimal disruption to the environmental features in the area.
  Improved stormwater management reduces erosion and flooding potential.

- **Economic Well-Being is enhanced.** ☑ Yes  ☐ No
  Based on an evaluation of alternatives, the preferred alternative was selected due to the costs and the ability to provide the required level of flood protection.

- **Does the option you are recommending create value across all three bottom lines?**
  ☑ Yes  ☐ No

  The preferred alternative addresses the existing drainage system deficiencies and minimizes the impact on all three bottom lines. It addresses the existing drainage system deficiencies in a cost effective manner with little disruption to residents and the environmental area.

- **Do the options you are recommending make Hamilton a City of choice for high performance public servants?**
  ☐ Yes  ☑ No
Key Plan

Beach Boulevard Storm Water Pumping Station

- Pumping Station Study Area

Hamilton Public Works

General Manager
Scott Stewart C.E.T.

November 2007

Map Not to Scale
Site Plan

Beach Boulevard Storm Water Pumping Station

General Manager
Scott Stewart, C.E.T.

October 2007
Map Not to Scale