SUBJECT: Four (4) Day Waste Collection Week (PW06033) - (City Wide)

RECOMMENDATION:

(a) That the City of Hamilton not implement a four (4) day waste collection week in 2006.

(b) That staff be directed to further investigate the implications of providing all curb side/roadside waste collection services from Tuesday to Friday each week for future consideration and report back to Council by October 2006.

Scott Stewart, C.E.T.
General Manager
Public Works

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

Committee of the Whole, at its meeting of February 13, 2006, requested additional information about the potential impacts of implementing the proposed budget reduction for collection of waste over four (4) days. The potential 2006 budget reduction, based on an implementation in May 2006, has been estimated at $234,000 to switch waste related collection services from the present five (5) day collection schedule to a four (4) day collection schedule. With the change, collection services would be provided based on a 10 hour work day over a 4-day work week. The savings are based on savings in overtime costs, fuel, vehicle maintenance, Full Time Equivalent (FTE) and fleet reductions for collection on statutory holidays. With the collection services being provided on a five (5) day schedule, staff are paid overtime for either working on the statutory holiday or having to work on a Saturday due to a shift in collection days.
In order to fully implement the proposed changes, re-alignment of all collection services and coordination with processing and disposal operations is required. The following highlights the various components that require coordination for successful implementation:

- Co-operation with CUPE 5167 for in house collection operations for the provision of services in the A Zones.
- Renegotiation of the contract with National Waste Services Inc. for waste collection services that are provided in the B Zones.
- Renegotiation of the contract with Halton Recycling Limited for recycling collection across the City.
- Discussions with Waste Management of Canada Corporation for the operation of the City’s three transfer stations and Glanbrook Landfill Site.
- Discussions with Maple Reinders for the operation of the Central Composting Facility.
- Cooperation with Canada Fibers Ltd. for operation of the Materials Recycling Facility.
- Provision of weigh scale operations at all facilities.
- Revision of collection routes, eliminating one (1) collection day, assuming all parties are in support of the change. At least 20% of the collection days would be changed, with potential of up to 90% of the days changing.
- Reissuing the Waste Collection Calendar for areas where waste collection days are changed and potentially re-issuing all calendars, if changes are implemented before April of 2007.
- Revisions to the roll-out schedule for the Green Cart Program, if changes are implemented for May 2006.

The proposed changes have been discussed with all affected parties and based on the feedback received there was interest in further discussing a change to four (4) day waste collection, however, more detailed analysis and further negotiations will be required to provide cost impacts. On this basis it is recommended that no changes in collection days take place prior to April 2007 and staff continue to work with the affected parties to confirm the potential for implementation in April 2007 and report back to Council by October 2006.

BACKGROUND:

The information provided in this report has City wide implications.

The City presently provides all curbside waste collection services over a Monday to Friday, five (5) day collection week. Service is provided by both in house and contracted service providers. Internal staff are compensated based on an eight hour day whereas contract service providers are compensated on a unit cost bases as stipulated in their respective contracts with the City. Collection services provided are as follows:
Several Ontario municipalities provide four (4) day waste collection services as identified in Table 1. All provide service from Tuesday to Friday with no collections on Mondays.

**TABLE 1 - MUNICIPAL INFORMATION ON WASTE COLLECTION SERVICES ON STATUTORY HOLIDAYS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipality</th>
<th>Collection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Town of Ajax          | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)  
Collection is one day later for Good Friday and Canada Day                                                                                     |
| Region of Peel        | Organics collection pilot areas in Brampton & Mississauga have Tuesday to Friday collection (4 day collection week)  
Collection on Labour Day for residents that are part of the established organics collection program (Caledon, North Brampton, but excluding the pilot areas in Mississauga and Brampton)  
Remainder of Peel Region  
Regular collection on Easter Monday, Boxing Day  
Collection is one day later for Victoria Day, Canada Day, Civic Holiday, Labour Day, Thanksgiving |
| Town of Pickering/Durham Region | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)  
Collection is one day later for holidays such as Good Friday, and Canada Day                                                                 |
| Town of Richmond Hill | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)  
Collection is one day later for Good Friday, Boxing Day  
Leaf & yard collection is available on Easter Monday                                                                                              |
| City of Toronto       | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)  
Collection on Good Friday is delayed to Easter Monday                                                                                           |
| City of Vaughan       | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)  
Collection is one day later for Good Friday, Canada Day, Christmas Day, New Year’s Day                                                             |
| County of Wellington  | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)  
Collection is one day later for Good Friday, Canada Day, Remembrance Day, Christmas Day                                                              |
| City of Thunder Bay   | Four Day Collection Week (No collection on Mondays)                                                                                           |

**ANALYSIS/RATIONALE:**

Provision of waste collection services during a four (4) day week provides opportunities for efficiencies, cost savings and positive environmental impacts. This is primarily achieved by several of the following factors:
Reduction of overtime costs.
Reduction of non productive travel time (one (1) day less travel time to and from collection route, processing facilities and yard).
Fleet reductions.
Fuel reductions.
FTE reductions.
Reduction in greenhouse gas emissions (reduction in deadhead travel).

In order to fully implement the proposed changes, re-alignment of all collection services and coordination with processing and disposal operations is required. In order to minimize potential costs, the financial impact of this re-alignment needs to be further reviewed in depth with all stakeholders identified in Table 2.

Following direction from Committee of the Whole, staff discussed the proposed changes with the affected stakeholders. Preliminary comments for each program component are provided in Table 2. More detailed planning and discussions will be required to fully determine the potential for implementing four (4) day waste collection and for that reason, staff are recommending that no change to collection days be implemented in 2006 and that staff report back to Council prior to October 2006.

**TABLE 2 - IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATIONS & COMMENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Component</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>2006 Cost/ (Savings) May to December</th>
<th>2007 Cost/ (Savings) April to December</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organics/Garbage, Leaf &amp; Yard Waste and Bulk Collection in the A Zones</td>
<td>Discussions with CUPE 5167 to confirm the Union will agree to the proposed changes.</td>
<td>The Union has indicated a willingness to enter into detailed discussions on the proposed change and have indicated the decision will rest with their members.</td>
<td>Approx. ($267,000)</td>
<td>Approx. ($400,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organics/Garbage, Leaf &amp; Yard Waste and Bulk Collection in the B Zones</td>
<td>Renegotiation of contract with National Waste Services Inc.</td>
<td>Contractor is interested in entering into detailed discussions and possible savings for implementation in 2007.</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>Possible savings to be negotiated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recycling Collection Services across the City</td>
<td>Renegotiation of contract with Halton Recycling Ltd.</td>
<td>Contractor has indicated that there will be additional capital costs due to a requirement to purchase additional vehicles. No savings are expected as compensation is based on units and tonnes collected.</td>
<td>To be negotiated - Potential for cost increases</td>
<td>To be negotiated - Potential for cost increases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Component</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>2006 Cost/ (Savings) May to December</td>
<td>2007 Cost/ (Savings) April to December</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Goods Collection across the City</td>
<td>Renegotiation of contract with Waste Management of Canada Inc.</td>
<td>Contractor has requested more detailed discussions before providing comments. There may be a requirement for additional resources, which could impact costs.</td>
<td>To be negotiated - Potential for cost increases</td>
<td>To be negotiated - Potential for cost increases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer Station and Glanbrook Landfill Site Operations</td>
<td>Renegotiation of contract with Waste Management of Canada Inc. to receive waste over 4 days.</td>
<td>Contractor has requested more detailed information and discussions before providing comments.</td>
<td>To be negotiated</td>
<td>To be negotiated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Composting Facility Operations</td>
<td>Potential renegotiation of contract with Maple Reinders to receive organic waste over 4 days.</td>
<td>Contractor has confirmed that there would be no additional costs and would be willing to negotiate potential cost savings.</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials Recycling Facility Operations</td>
<td>Potential renegotiation with Canada Fibers Limited to receive recyclables for processing over 4 days.</td>
<td>Contractor has indicated that costs are dependent on delivery times due to the extended collection day, however, does not expect cost increases at this time.</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operation of Weigh Scales</td>
<td>Potential extension of operating hours for scale operations.</td>
<td>Current contract makes provision for extended operating hours at all facilities as required. If receiving hours need to be extended past 6:00 p.m, the cost is approx $20/hr/scale.</td>
<td>$0 - $10,000</td>
<td>$0 - $15,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection Routes</td>
<td>Revision of waste collection routes to accommodate collection over 4 days.</td>
<td>A Zones - range from 20% to 60% change in collection days. B Zones – not confirmed by contractor however expect similar to possible A Zone impact – 20 to 60%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE 2 - IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATIONS & COMMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Component</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Comments</th>
<th>2006 Cost/ (Savings) May to December</th>
<th>2007 Cost/ (Savings) April to December</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waste Collection</td>
<td>The annual calendar runs from April of the current year to March of the following year and is distributed annually during early March to ensure residents are aware of any program changes.</td>
<td>Costs for 2006 assume that all calendars will need to be re-issued, however, could be reduced based on the number of calendars that need to be re-issued. Additional advertising costs have not been reflected in the cost estimates. There will be no additional costs if the changes are made in April 2007 as this coincides with the timing for the next calendar.</td>
<td>$150,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL** |                                                                                                                                  | ($117,000)- ($107,000)                                                                 | To be determined                                                                        |

**ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION:**

This report has provided details on the four (4) day waste collection service which is the primary alternative for waste collection service beyond the present five (5) day service which the city presently provides. Discussions with the affected stakeholders indicated that changes only in the A zones would be feasible in 2006, if a Letter of Understanding can be negotiated with the union. Should Council wish to proceed with a change to four (4) day collection only in the A zones, recycling collection would not be provided on the same day as the other collection services for areas affected by a collection day change to accommodate the four (4) day collection. On this basis, it is not recommended that changes be implemented at this time.

**FINANCIAL/STAFFING/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS:**

**Financial**
Implementing a four (4) day waste collection week service has the potential to result in substantial savings to the City, however, such a change in service needs to be planned in advance to realize the full benefits of potential cost savings. A number of the collection services are provided by contractors and will require negotiation of costs. Based on the discussions with service providers, no savings in contracted costs can be expected for 2006, leaving a savings of $117,000 of the projected $234,000 as outlined as part of Report FCS06003(b), which identified potential cost savings. It is recommended that further planning be undertaken and staff report back on the potential implementation for 2007, including cost implications.

**Staffing**
Implementing a four (4) day collection system is expected to reduce the City’s public sector operation by three (3) rear packer collection trucks, one of which would be a
spare vehicle. This fleet reduction would result in a reduction of four (4) full time equivalent (FTE) positions. Although six (6) additional positions are being added for the Green Cart Program in April 2006, staff will work with the Union to minimize staffing impacts if the four (4) day collection system is implemented.

Legal
Letters of Understanding under both CUPE 5167 and 1041 Collective Agreements would need to be negotiated for the city’s waste collection operation. Initial discussions have taken place and CUPE have indicated their willingness to discuss this issue further, however, the final decision rests with its membership impacted by the proposed service change.

Collection contracts with National Waste Services Inc., Halton Recycling Limited, and Waste Management of Canada and potentially processing contracts with Maple Reinders and Waste Management of Canada are affected by the proposed collection changes. Negotiations will be required to fully determine cost savings/impacts. All contractors have indicated a willingness to enter into discussions for this purpose.

**POLICIES AFFECTING PROPOSAL:**

The Solid Waste Management Master Plan (SWMMP) directly affects this proposal through the implementation of several of the SWMMP recommendations, including:

Recommendation #10 - the City of Hamilton must implement, sustain and support a comprehensive public education, awareness and marketing program in all areas of the city outlining the benefits and encouraging participation in waste reduction, re-use, and recycling programs.

Recommendation #13 - The City of Hamilton is committed to continually improving its waste management system and will support annual investment in research and development.

**RELEVANT CONSULTATION:**

Staff has conducted preliminary discussions with all contractors impacted by this proposed service change as well as CUPE executive from both 5167 and 1041.

**CITY STRATEGIC COMMITMENT:**

By evaluating the “Triple Bottom Line”, (community, environment, economic implications) we can make choices that create value across all three bottom lines, moving us closer to our vision for a sustainable community, and Provincial interests.

Community Well-Being is enhanced. ☑ Yes ☐ No
Public services and programs are delivered in an equitable manner, coordinated, efficient, effective and easily accessible to all citizens.

Environmental Well-Being is enhanced. ☑ Yes ☐ No
Consumption of energy is reduced; alternative energy and co-generation are supported.

Economic Well-Being is enhanced. ☑ Yes ☐ No
Hamilton’s high-quality environment amenities are maintained and enhanced by provision of effective, efficient and safe waste collection services.
Does the option you are recommending create value across all three bottom lines?  
☑ Yes  □ No  
This report supports the City of Hamilton’s strategic plan ....

Do the options you are recommending make Hamilton a City of choice for high performance public servants?  
☑ Yes  □ No  
The creation of a respectful, desirable and supportive workplace.  
The recommendations proposed in this report reflects the long term objective of continuous improvement within the Waste Management Division.