Committee of the Whole
REPORT 09-011

9:30 a.m.
April 1, 2009
Albion Room
Hamilton Convention Centre

Present: Mayor F. Eisenberger

Absent with regrets: Councillor R. Powers – City Business

Also Present: C. Murray, City Manager
T. Tollis, Acting General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services
G. Davis, Acting General Manager, Public Works
J. Kay, General Manager/Chief, Hamilton Emergency Services
T. McCabe, General Manager, Planning and Economic Development
J.A. Priel, General Manager, Community Services
P. Barkwell, City Solicitor
M. Gallagher, Co-ordinator, Council and Committee of the Whole/Budgets

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE PRESENTS REPORT 09-011 AND RESPECTFULLY RECOMMENDS:
A. Board of Health

1. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget (FCS09007) (City Wide)**

   That Report FCS09007 respecting the 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget, be received.

2. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Public Health Services (FCS09007e) (City Wide)**

   (a) That the 2009 net operating levy for Public Health Services be approved at $9,195,588;

   (b) That the Medical Officer of Health be authorized and directed to execute all statutory 2009 Federal and Provincial Program Service Level Funding Agreements and Contracts for Public Health Services including the submission of budgets and quarterly/year end reporting.

B. Emergency & Community Services Committee

3. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Budget Summary Report (FCS09007) (City Wide)**

   That Report FCS09007 - 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Budget Summary Report, be received.

4. **Contingency Plan to Offset Potential Increase in Demand for Subsidized Housing**

   That Council lobby the Province of Ontario to request the establishment of a Provincial contingency plan to support the potential, extreme increase in the demand for subsidized housing created by the recent economic downturn.

5. **Strategy to Reduce the Ontario Works Case Worker to Client Ratio**

   That, notwithstanding that staff have found over $800,000 in savings to the benefit of the 2009 budget, staff be directed to consider a strategy to reinvest those funds in employment related programs, given the current economic decline, in order to maintain an appropriate case worker to client ratio for Ontario Works.

Council – April 1, 2009
6. **Community Heat Response Plan Improvements (CS09001) (City Wide)**

That the improvements to the City of Hamilton’s Community Heat Response Plan, attached as Appendix A to Report 09-001, at a cost of $14,330, be approved.


   (a) That a program service level change to provide for 46 recreational public skates, at various City-operated arenas on local School Board Professional Activity days, in the amount of $3,970, be approved.

   (b) That a program service level change to provide recreational public (family) skates at Parkdale Arena, Valley Park Arena, Mountain Arena, Chedoke Arena, Carlisle Arena, Scott Park Arena, Coronation Arena and Eastwood Arena on annual Family Day (statutory holiday) with a net budget requirement of $2,760, be approved.

   (c) That item “V” Open Skate Sessions on P.A. Days at one or more City arenas on scheduled School Board Professional Activity days”, be considered complete and removed from the Emergency and Community Services Committee’s Outstanding Business List.

8. **Investigation of Costs Associated with the Proposed Revised dates of Operation for City Owned, Outdoor Pools (CS09003) (City Wide)**

That a one week extension to the dates of operation for the ten (10) City owned outdoor pools, at a net cost of $36,000, be approved.

9. **Hamilton Historical Board’s 2009 Volunteer Budget Submission (CS09005) (City Wide)**

   (a) That the Hamilton Historical Board’s 2009 Volunteer Committee Budget Submission in the amount of $16,840, attached as Appendix A to Report CS09005, be approved.
(b) That the use of $2,500, from the Hamilton Historical Board’s Volunteer Committee Reserve to offset the Hamilton Historical Board’s 2009 budget request, be approved.

10. Hamilton Veterans’ Committee’s 2009 Volunteer Budget Submission (CS09006) (City Wide)

(a) That the Hamilton Veterans Committee’s 2009 Volunteer Committee Budget Submission in the amount of $10,000, attached as Appendix A to Report CS09006, be approved.

(b) That the use of $110, from the Hamilton Veterans’ Committee Volunteer Committee Reserve, be used to offset the Hamilton Veterans Committees 2009 budget request, be approved.

11. Arts Advisory Commission 2009 Volunteer Budget Submission (CS09007) (City Wide)

(a) That the Arts Advisory Commission’s 2009 Volunteer Committee’s Budget Submission in the amount of $39,000, attached as Appendix A to Report CS09007, be approved.

(b) That one-time funding from corporate contingency of $30,000, for the development and manufacture of the new Hamilton Arts Awards medallions, be approved.

12. Hamilton Youth Advisory Committee’s 2009 Budget Submission (CS09008) (City Wide)

(a) That the Hamilton Youth Advisory Committee 2009 Budget Submission in the amount of $3,890, attached as Appendix A to Report CS09008, be approved.

(b) That one-time funding from the Volunteer Committee Reserve to be utilized the Youth Leadership Conference/Event, in the amount of $5,000, be approved.

13. 2009 Tenant Advisory Committee Budget Submission (CS09009) (City Wide)

That the Tenant Advisory Committee’s 2009 Volunteer Committee Budget submission in the amount of $500, attached as Appendix A to Report CS09009, be approved.
14. **2009 Food, Shelter and Housing Advisory Committee Budget Submission (CS09010) (City Wide)**

That the Food, Shelter and Housing Advisory Committee’s 2009 Volunteer Committee Budget Submission in the amount of $500, attached as Appendix A to Report CS09010, be approved.

15. **2009 Budget Request - Seniors Advisory Committee (FCS09005) (City Wide)**

That the 2009 base budget submission from the Seniors Advisory Committee in the amount of $1,500 be approved.

16. **Hamilton Emergency Services Departmental Budget Overview (FCS09007(g)) (City Wide)**

That the 2009 net operating levy for Hamilton Emergency Services be approved at $83,891,738.

17. **Ontario Works Caseload Contingency Plan (CS09021) (City Wide)**

(a) That recommendation (a) of Report CS09021 – Ontario Works Caseload Contingency Plan, as shown below, be referred to the Budget Steering Committee for discussion at the end of the budget process, pending additional information from staff respecting the potential additional Ontario Works caseload:

(i) That funds in the amount of $1,128,000 be transferred to the Ontario Works Stabilization Reserve Fund #110044 to cover additional costs incurred in 2009 resulting from an increase to the Ontario Works caseload.

(b) That the Mayor correspond with the Minister of Community and Social Services to request that the gross approved amount for Ontario Works Cost of Administration, in the 2009 Ontario Works Service Contract, be equal to the City of Hamilton’s budget for the same costs.

(c) That copies of the letter be forwarded to all local MPPs, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario and the Ontario Municipal Social Services Association.
18. **2009 Program Change Options – Community Services (FCS09011(d)) (City Wide)**

(a) That the 2009 Program Change Options for Community Services, attached as Appendix “A” to Report FCS09011(d), be approved.

(b) That staff be directed to bring forward, to the 2010 Budget process, a recommendation that reinstates the $116,650, which was removed from the Housing - Capital Reserve Allocation for 2009, into that Capital Reserve Fund for 2010.

19. **Community Services Departmental Budget Overview (FCS09007(f)) (City Wide)**

(a) That the 2009 Community Services Council referred items, attached as Appendix “A” to Report FCS09007(f), be approved.

(b) That the 2009 net operating levy for Community Services, inclusive of Council referred items, be approved at $160,867,228.

(c) That the General Manager of Community Services be authorized and directed to execute all statutory 2009 Federal and Provincial Program Service Level Funding Agreements and Contracts for Community Services. This also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly/year end reporting.

20. **Affordable Housing Threshold**

That staff be directed to provide various scenarios in terms of demand for affordable housing, what impacts this will place on other City services, and what kinds of funding may be required from other levels of government in order to address the shortfalls, and report back to the Emergency & Community Services Committee.
C. Audit and Administration Committee

21. Follow up - Customer Contact Centre (FCS09023)
   
   (a) That Report FCS09023 respecting Follow up - Customer Contact Centre, be received;
   
   (b) That staff be directed to report back in three months or less with a Terms of Reference for identifying efficiencies and revenue opportunities in the Customer Contact Centre for the 2010 Budget;
   
   (c) That the mandate of the Budget Steering Committee be expanded to review service levels and efficiencies and cost savings measures in the Corporation.

22. Follow up - Municipal Service Centres (FCS09024)
   
   (a) That Report FCS09024 respecting Follow up - Municipal Service Centres, be received.
   
   (b) That staff be directed to report back on alternative service delivery models; efficiencies in delivering service, which would not exclude the incorporation of library services; and additional revenue-generating opportunities for Municipal Service Centres.

23. Potential for HR Service Level Reductions (HUR09004)
   
   That Report HUR09004 respecting Potential for HR Service Level Reductions be received.

24. City Shutdown - Employee and Labour Relations Implications (HUR09003)
   
   That Report HUR09003 respecting City Shutdown - Employee and Labour Relations Implications be received.

25. Intergovernmental Affairs Allocation (CM09005) (City Wide)
   
   That the transfer of the 2008 unused funds totaling $150,000 from the Economic Development Investment Fund Reserve be redirected to the City Manager’s Office for Intergovernmental Affairs.
26. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget (FCS09007) (City Wide)**

That Report FCS09007 respecting the 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget be received.

27. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Other Programs (FCS09007c) (City Wide)**

(a) That the 2009 net operating levy for the Legislative budget be approved at $4,241,570 as amended by the following:

   (i) That increases to “Ward Budgets” be tabled;

(b) That the 2009 Corporate Financials budget be approved at ($74,031,667) as amended by the following:

   (i) That the labour contractual contingency fund be reduced by 10%; and

(c) That the 2009 Capital financing charges be approved at $77,106,708.

28. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – City Manager (FCS09007a) (City Wide)**

(a) That the 2009 net operating levy for City Manager, exclusive of Council referred items, be approved at $6,681,852

   (i) Communications Staff Reductions (CM09004) (City Wide)

      That the staff reduction of 1FTE as outlined in Report CM09004 be approved.

(b) That the 2009 City Manager Council referred items per Appendix Two to report FCS09007a be received.

29. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Corporate Services (FCS09007b) (City Wide)**

That the 2009 net operating levy for Corporate Services be approved at $25,554,621.
30. **2009 Budget Request - Corporate Services Volunteer Advisory Committees (FCS09004) (City Wide)**

(a) That the 2009 base budget submissions be approved as follows:
   (i) Advisory Committee on Immigrants & Refugees in the amount of $3,500.00;
   (ii) Gay, Lesbian, Bi-sexual, Transgender Advisory Committee in the amount of $3,890.00;
   (iii) Hamilton Aboriginal Advisory Council in the amount of $3,500;
   (iv) Hamilton Mundialization Committee in the amount of $5,890
   (v) Status of Women Committee in the amount of $3,500.00;
   (vi) Committee Against Racism in the amount of $3,890.00

(b) That, in addition to the base funding requests, that one-time funding from the Volunteer Committee Reserve be approved as follows:
   (i) Status of Women Committee in the amount of $2,000.00.

31. **Human Resources Budget Status Report (HUR08008)**

That Report HUR08008 respecting the Human Resources Budget Status Report be received.

32. **2009 Program Change Options – City Manager (FCS09011a) (City Wide)**

That the 2009 Program Change Options for City Manager, as per Appendix One to report FCS09011a, be approved.

D. **Public Works Committee**

33. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Budget Summary Report (FCS09007) (City Wide)**

That Report FCS09007 respecting the 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Budget Summary Report, be received.
34. Corporate Energy Report - January 2009

That the presentation provided by staff respecting the Corporate Energy Report – January, 2009, be received.

35. 2009 Budget Request – Public Works Volunteer Committees (PW09008) (City Wide)

(a) That the Clean City Liaison Committee’s 2009 Volunteer Committee Budget Submission, in the amount of $18,250, be approved;

(b) That in addition to the base funding request for the Clean City Liaison Committee, one time-funding from the Volunteer Committee Reserve in the amount of $13,400 be approved;

(c) That the Hamilton Cycling Committee’s 2009 Volunteer Committee Budget Submission in the amount of $6,250, be approved;

(d) That in addition to the base funding request for the Hamilton Cycling Committee, one time-funding from the Volunteer Committee Reserve in the amount of $3,750 be approved.

36. 2009 Public Works Department Operating Budget – Reductions

That the following reductions to the 2009 Operating Budget, be approved:

(a) Fuel – Operating Departments ($1,000,000)
   (Diesel – 1.05 to 0.95; Unleaded - 0.97 to 0.87)
(b) Fuel – External/Contractual Impact ($  100,000)
(c) Natural Gas ($  120,000)
(d) Reduce Contribution to Vehicle Reserve ($  100,000)
(e) Support Services Efficiencies ($  100,000)
(f) Technology to Delivery Security ($ 200,000)
(g) Road Side Litter $  200,000
(h) Street Sweeping Program $  138,000
(i) Bulk Collection Fee $  360,000
(j) Tipping Fee (3% increase) $  60,000
(k) Parking Fees at Major Municipal Park Sites $  310,000
37. 2009 Program Change Options – Public Works (FCS09011(e)) (City Wide)

(a) That the following 2009 Program Change Options be included in the 2009 Public Works Operating Budget:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i) Street Tree Trimming Program Deferral of Phase 4 of 10 Implementation</td>
<td>($530,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Trail Maintenance Program Reduction - Budget Mitigation Option</td>
<td>($22,600)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Open Space Maintenance – Program Reduction (Budget Mitigation Option)</td>
<td>($42,000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(b) That the following 2009 Program Change Option be added to the 2009 Public Works Operating Budget:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i) Parks Operating Impacts from Inventory Growth (Development)</td>
<td>$320,530</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

38. Transit Fares

That there be no increase in transit fares in 2009.

39. Transit Service Enhancements

That Council direct staff to include consideration of the following Transit service enhancements in the 2010 budget submission, taking into consideration the outcome of the HSR operational review, as follows:

- Harmonization of DARTS fare structure with HSR fare structure;
- Additional annual DARTS service hours to address latent demand;
- Additional HSR Route 5C West Hamilton trips to Meadowlands;
- Increase in the Taxi Scrip Program coupon purchase cap and subsidy;
- Extension of Waterfront Shuttle to provide increased route coverage;
- Fare-optional transit service on Smog days;
- Expansion of transit service to special events programs;
- Additional HSR service coverage to Dundas;
- Expansion of B Line service duration;
- Extension of Route #2 Barton east of Grays Road;

Council – April 1, 2009
Committee of the Whole 12 Report 09-011
Final Budget

- Realignment of HSR Routes 11 Parkdale and Route 43 Stone Church.

40. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Public Works (FCS09007(h))**

(a) That the following Council-referred items be approved for inclusion in the 2009 Public Works Operating Budget:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i) Green Cart Program, Leaf &amp; Yard Waste and Grass Recycling</td>
<td>($5,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) (Large) Multi-Residential Organic Collection Program</td>
<td>($10,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) CP Rail Trail</td>
<td>$40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Street Tree Trimming Program Enhancement</td>
<td>$171,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) Splash Pad Operations</td>
<td>$3,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vi) Recycling Collection in Parks</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vii) Ground Litter Control in the Downtown</td>
<td>$172,630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(viii) Cigarette Receptacle Program</td>
<td>$5,600</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(b) That the Council-referred item respecting Waste Management Services for Festivals and Special Events in the amount of $40,000 not be included in the 2009 Public Works Operating Budget;

(c) That the Solid Waste Management Master Plan Subcommittee be requested to review the Waste Management Services for Festivals and Special Events.

(d) That the 2009 net operating levy for Public Works in the amount of $172,400,872, be approved.

E. **Economic Development and Planning Committee**

41. **2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget (FCS09007) (City Wide)**

That Report FCS09007 respecting the 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget, be received for information.

Council – April 1, 2009
42. **2009 Tariff of Fees and 2009 Tariff of Fees Increase (PED09032/PED09032(a)/PED09032(b)(City Wide)**

That the Schedule of Fees, attached hereto as Appendix “A” be approved and incorporated into the 2009 User Fees and Charges By-law.

(a) That the fee for Minor Variance applications be reduced from $1,210.00 to $1,000.00.

(b) That a new fee of $1,210.00 be applied to applications for “After the Fact Variances” being where development has proceeded prior to resubmission of the application for relief of by-law requirements.

(c) That the fee of $40,000.00 for Pit or Quarry Expansion be referenced as a new fee not a revised fee.

(d) That cost recovery respecting Ontario Municipal Board (OMB) appeals include all fees associated with supporting an applicant at a hearing where the application was approved by City Council including City legal fees, City staff fees, outside legal counsel and consultant / witness fees where required, but excluding the cost of the Planning and Economic Development Department staff.

(e) That a new fee of $2,795.00 be applied to applications for Zoning Amendment - Severance of Surplus Farm Dwelling.

(f) That new fees equivalent to one-half (½) of the applicable Site Plan Application fee be applied to Site Plan Applications for Agricultural Uses.

43. **2009 Program Change Options – Planning and Economic Development (FCS09011(c)) (City Wide)**

That the 2009 Program Change Options for Planning and Economic Development, as outlined in Appendix A to Report FCS09011(c), be approved.

44. **Project expenditures from Economic Investment Fund**

That the Project expenditures from the Economic Investment Fund be approved, and that the payment to the Jobs Prosperity Collaborative be held, pending the receipt of their 2008 financial statements.

---

Council – April 1, 2009
45. Downtown Ambassador Program

That the Downtown Ambassador Program, to extend program for 16 weeks from September to December in the amount of $30,000.

46. 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Planning and Economic Development (FCS09007(d)) (City Wide)

That the 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Planning and Economic Development be approved in the amount of $17,114,227.

F. Boards and Agencies

47. Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion (CS09016)

(a) That report CS09016 respecting Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion be received.

(b) That one-time funding in the amount of $260,000 ($130,000 for 2009 and $130,000 in 2010) for Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion be approved from the Tax Stabilization Reserve.

48. 2009 Tax Supported Operating Budget – Boards & Agencies (FCS09007i) (City Wide)

a) That the 2009 net operating levy for Police Services be approved at $119,955,480;

b) That the 2009 net operating levy for Other Boards and Agencies be approved as amended at $43,553,260;

c) That the Community Partnership net operating budget be approved at $3,221,262.

G. Other

49. 2009 Reassessment Impacts (FCS09025)

That report FCS09025 “2009 Reassessment Impacts” be received for information.
50. 2009 Tax Policies (FCS09032) (City Wide)

(a) That the following optional property classes be continued for the 2009 taxation year:

(i) New Multi-Residential;
(ii) Parking Lot and Vacant Land;
(iii) Large Industrial;

(b) That staff report back on the final tax ratios to be established for the 2009 taxation year, pending final approval of the 2009 budget, and that these final tax ratios ensure:

(i) That, subject to the Provincial Levy Restriction, the maximum allowable (50%) of the 2009 budgetary increase be passed onto the Commercial and Industrial property classes;

(ii) That, the Farm tax ratio be reduced such that the final average total tax impact for the Farm property classes equals that of the final average total tax impact for the Residential property class;

(c) That the following tax reductions be established for the 2009 taxation year:

(i) Vacant units and excess land subclass (residual commercial) 30%
(ii) Vacant units and excess land subclass (residual industrial) 30%
(iii) Vacant units and excess land subclass (large industrial) 30%
(iv) Farmland awaiting development (1st subclass) 25%
(v) Farmland awaiting development (2nd subclass) 0%

(d) That the existing property tax relief deferral program for low-income seniors and disabled persons be continued for the 2009 taxation year;

(e) That the existing 40% tax rebate for eligible charities and similar organizations be continued for the 2009 taxation year;
(f) That the existing provincially mandated vacancy rebate for eligible commercial and industrial properties be continued for the 2009 taxation year;

(g) That the existing 100% tax rebate for Veteran’s Clubhouses and Legion Halls be continued for an additional three years (2009-2011 taxation years), and that the definition of an “eligible property” be expanded to include all property classes;

(h) That staff be directed to further review the Heritage Tax Rebate Program after the 2009 budget process;

(i) That the existing Senior’s (65+) Tax Rebate Program be continued, with the following criteria updated for the 2009 taxation year:

   (i) Income threshold (150% of GIS couple) increased to $31,030 ($30,170 in 2008);

   (ii) Assessment cap (120% of city-wide average) increased to $283,300 ($266,300 in 2008);

   (iii) Rebate increased by the CPI index to $160 ($156 in 2008);

(j) That the City Solicitor & Corporate Counsel be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary by-laws, for Council approval, for the purposes of establishing the tax policies for the 2009 taxation year.

51. Multi-Residential Property Taxation Sub-Committee Report 09-001

That Item 1 of the Multi-Residential Property Taxation Sub-Committee Report be received and that Item 2 be approved as follows:

1. Multi-Residential Property Taxation

Whereas other municipalities have reduced the Multi-Residential Tax Rate to the Commercial Tax Ratio (i.e. Windsor, Halton, Niagara, Durham, Toronto and others);

Whereas the ability to pay for tenants in Hamilton is lower than any other City in Ontario;
Whereas, notwithstanding the recommendation to target the multi-residential tax rate to the commercial tax rate, the Multi-Residential Property Taxation Sub-Committee continues to believe that the multi-residential and residential tax rates be at 1.00;

Therefore, be it resolved.

That the Multi-Residential Tax Ratio be reduced to 1.99 (Hamilton’s 2009 Commercial Tax Ratio) and that the reduction be phased in.

2. Information for Tenants respecting Services and Taxes

(a) That correspondence continue to be forwarded to tenants on an annual basis, to educate tenants on average taxes paid per unit, ratio percentages, and municipal services provided by the City of Hamilton;

(b) That a draft of the correspondence be reviewed by the Sub-Committee prior to its release;

(c) That the Sub-Committee re-affirm its request for the commissioning of a report which reviews municipal services for tenants in Hamilton in comparison to services received by home owners (i.e. Property standards, garbage collection etc)

(d) That an appropriate budget allocation be provided to execute the directions noted in recommendations (a) and (c);

(e) That a meeting of the Multi-Residential Property Taxation Sub-committee be convened to review the commissioned report when received.

52. Multi-Residential Property Taxation: Staff Response to the Multi-Residential Sub-Committee Recommendations (FCS09031) (City Wide)

(a) That, for the 2009 taxation year, the Multi-Residential tax ratio be maintained at the Provincial Threshold of 2.74 and thus allowing the Multi-Residential property class to receive the full benefit of the 2009 assessment-related tax reduction;
(b) That Item F “Multi-Residential Tax Ratio - Options” be removed from the Committee of the Whole Outstanding Business List.

53. **Non Union Compensation Increase**

(a) That due to the tough economic times the cost of living increase for the non-union Management and Professional Exempt employees be 0% in 2009, 1.5% in 2010, and 1.5% in 2011, which is also intended to set the tone for upcoming labour negotiations;

(b) That Council is committed to no reductions among the non-union Management and Professional Exempt employees complement in 2009;

(c) That the non-union Management and Professional Exempt group of employees’ salaries be moved to the 50th percentile over a 4 year period commencing January 1, 2010, consistent with Council’s Non-Union Compensation Policy;

(d) That the revised Salary Progression Policy for non-union staff, attached as Appendix “A” be approved;

(e) That staff continue to review and report back on the balance of recommendations contained in the Gazda, Houlne & Associates report and propose any necessary changes to the Non-Union Compensation policies.

54. **Approval of the 2009 Tax Supported Budget**

(a) That the 2009 Tax Supported Levy, as presented in FCS09007 and amended by Schedule A, in the amount of $649,106,300 be approved;

(b) That the Medical Officer of Health be authorized and directed to execute all statutory 2009 Federal and Provincial Program Service Level Funding Agreements and Contracts for Public Health Services. This also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly/year end reporting;
(c) That the General Manager of Community Services be authorized and directed to execute all statutory 2009 Federal and Provincial Program Service Level Funding Agreements and Contracts for Community Services. This also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly/year end reporting;

(d) That, for the 2009 taxation year, the Area Rated Levies be approved as identified in Schedule B attached hereto;

(e) That, for the 2009 taxation year, the transit area be expanded to include the additional areas in wards 9, 11 and 12 as identified in Schedule C attached hereto to take into account the 2009 approved enhanced transit service in these areas; and

(f) That the City Solicitor & Corporate Counsel be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary by-laws, for Council approval, for the purposes of establishing the tax levy and related tax policies for the 2009 taxation year.

55. Service Delivery Review and Analysis

(a) That a service delivery review and analysis be commenced immediately and that staff report back to council in 2009 prior to the 2010 budget deliberations;

(b) That the report include cost efficiencies and that the 2010 budget not be increased as a result of any reviews.

FOR THE INFORMATION OF COUNCIL:

(a) ADOPTION OF MINUTES

The following minutes were approved:

(i) December 5, 2008
(ii) December 9, 2008
(iii) January 22, 2009
(iv) January 23, 2009
(v) February 24, 2009

(b) The following motions were defeated:

(i) That Conservation Halton be requested to revisit its 2009 budget submission and reduce it to 2%.
(ii) **Ontario Works Caseload Contingency Plan (CS09021) (City Wide)**

That subsection (a) of this item be amended as follows:

Delete strike over and insert word “approve” after word “below”:

(a) That recommendation (a) of Report CS09021 – Ontario Works Caseload Contingency Plan, as shown below, be approved:

referred to the Budget Steering Committee for discussion at the end of the budget process, pending additional information from staff respecting the potential additional Ontario Works caseload.

The Amendment Lost on a Recorded vote:

Yeas: Councillors Clark, Duvall, Merulla
Total: 3

Nays: Bratina, Collins, Ferguson, Duvall, Mitchell, Pasuta, Pearson, Powers, Whitehead, Eisenberger
Total: 10

Councillors Clark and Merulla recorded Opposed to the Main motion.

(iii) **Employer Commuter Pass Program**

Recorded vote: DEFEATED

Yeas: Eisenberger, Merulla, McHattie
Total: 3

Total: 12
Absent: Powers
Total: 1
The following motions CARRIED on a Standing Recorded vote:

(i) Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion – Funding

That one-time funding in the amount of $260,000 ($130,000 for 2009 and $130,000 in 2010) for Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion be approved from the Tax Stabilization Reserve.

Yeas: Eisenberger, Bratina, Clark, Collins, Duvall, Ferguson, Jackson, McHattie, Merulla, Morelli, Pearson, Whitehead,

Total: 12

Opposed: McCarthy

Total: 1

Absent: Powers, Pasuta, Mitchell

Total: 3

(ii) Approval of Levy Recommendations

Yeas: Eisenberger, Clark, Collins, Duvall, Ferguson, Jackson, McCarthy, McHattie, Merulla, Morelli, Pastua, Pearson, Whitehead

Total: 13

Nays: Mitchell

Total: 1

Absent: Powers, Bratina

Total: 2

(d) Private and Confidential

Contractual relations with a supplier, potential litigation, the receiving of solicitor-client advice (City Wide) (LS09007) – NON BUDGET RELATED ITEM

Staff were provided direction in closed session.

(e) The following Notice of Motion was presented by Councillor Whitehead:

That staff be directed to prepare the following report for Committee of the Whole when it meets to discuss the issue of area rating:

Council – April 1, 2009
Suggested options for area rated variances being covered by the benefiting community.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayor F. Eisenberger

M. Gallagher, Co-ordinator
Committee of the Whole
SALARY PROGRESSION POLICY

Progressive step increases within salary bands are awarded to recognize:
- progressive attainment of the competencies required to achieve job mastery; job mastering occurs at the final salary step (i.e. the job rate)
- employee contributions, both as individuals and as members of teams, to the mission, vision, and strategic directions of the City of Hamilton
- achievement of annual performance objectives and expectations
- behaviours that reflect the corporate values

Progressive step increases are:
- based on performance documented through the appropriate performance assessment which serves as the basis for supervisors recommending an increase
- applied to the base salary effective on the anniversary date of the employee’s placement in, or promotion to the position

To ensure a consistent and accountable approach to the awarding of progressive step increases:
- Performance appraisals must be signed off by the employee’s second-removed supervisor and submitted to Human Resources before a progressive step increase is awarded
- Employees must have an overall rating of equal to or higher than effective performance to progress through the steps in the salary range
- Employees must achieve their performance objectives to receive an effective performance rating
### 2009 Tax Operating Budget Adjustments - FINAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CMTEE APPROVED AMENDMENTS:</th>
<th>FTE</th>
<th>Requested Budget</th>
<th>Levy Increase</th>
<th>Residential Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Net Levy</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>Muni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Adjustment</td>
<td>$</td>
<td>$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A&amp;A Corporate Financials - 10% compensation contingency reduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>(574,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Strategic Services - Heat Response Plan</td>
<td></td>
<td>14,330</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - Enhancement of recreational public skate on PA days</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,970</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - Enhancement of recreational public skate on Family Day</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>2,760</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - Extension of dates of operation for city owned pools</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>36,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS VC - Arts Advisory Committee ($30,000 from corporate contingency)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A&amp;A City Manager - HR - Human Rights Specialist</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>110,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P Planning - Increase in revenue based on revised activity levels (annualized)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(419,240)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P Development Engineering - increase in revenue</td>
<td></td>
<td>(60,255)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P Development Fee Stabilization Reserve - Offset</td>
<td></td>
<td>399,315</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoW Downtown Ambassador Program Extension for 16 weeks</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoW Adjustment for MPAC payment</td>
<td></td>
<td>10,745</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A&amp;A City Manager - Adjust budget for Intergovernmental Affairs</td>
<td></td>
<td>(150,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P Building Services - Grow Op Inspector Reduction (Gross $134,160)</td>
<td>-1.00</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P Building Services - Building Permit Admin (vacant) (Gross $59,600)</td>
<td>-1.00</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P GM's Office - Staffing Specialist (Gross $104,750)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED&amp;P 2009 Tariff of Fees -Adjustment</td>
<td></td>
<td>52,500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Benefit Eligibility - Ontario Works Trainer reduction</td>
<td>-1.00</td>
<td>(80,560)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Culture - Capital Projects Coordinator</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Culture - Registrar - Heritage and Cultural Collections</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Culture - Nash Jackson/Battlefield - staffing for new site</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>72,530</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Culture - Historical Gardener</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Housing - Capital reserve allocation 0% increase</td>
<td></td>
<td>(116,650)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Macassa - Building repairs reduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>(15,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Macassa - Wentworth - E-records repayment</td>
<td></td>
<td>(100,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Macassa - Wentworth - CMI increased revenue</td>
<td></td>
<td>(135,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - PT reduction to 49 weeks</td>
<td>-3.80</td>
<td>(80,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - Dundas Driving Park</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>81,340</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - Waterdown day camp</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;CS CS - Recreation - Public use recreation facility study</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW WM - Leaf and Yard program</td>
<td></td>
<td>(5,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW WM - Multires organic collection</td>
<td></td>
<td>(10,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - CP Rail Trail</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>40,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - Street Tree Trimming (year 3)</td>
<td></td>
<td>171,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - Spray pad operations</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,360</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - Recycling collection in parks (funded from recycling reserve)</td>
<td></td>
<td>$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - Downtown litter</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>172,630</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - Street Tree Trimming (year 4)</td>
<td>-3.00</td>
<td>(530,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW O&amp;M - Operating impacts from capital - parks inventory growth</td>
<td>8.18</td>
<td>320,530</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW EFF - Fuel operating departments</td>
<td></td>
<td>(1,000,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW EFF - Fuel external/contractual impact</td>
<td></td>
<td>(100,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW EFF - Natural gas reduction</td>
<td></td>
<td>(120,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW EFF - Reduction to contribution to reserve</td>
<td></td>
<td>(100,000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 2009 Tax Operating Budget Adjustments - FINAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FTE</th>
<th>Requested Budget</th>
<th>Levy Increase</th>
<th>Residential Impact Muni</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6,895.19</td>
<td>$ 669,297,600</td>
<td>$ 39,232,270</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CMTEE APPROVED AMENDMENTS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FTE</th>
<th>Levy Adjustment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PW</td>
<td>EFF - Technology to deliver security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW</td>
<td>Support Services Efficiencies Reduction of 1 FTE - Comm Staff - CMO9004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW</td>
<td>HES - Fuel Adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW</td>
<td>Police - Fuel Adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW</td>
<td>O&amp;M - Cigarette Receptacle Program (referred Jan 28 Council PW09013) (capital $28,200)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>Hamilton Cycling Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>Ancaster Village Core Advisory Committee dissolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Provincial Special Funding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Levy Adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CS - Housing - property tax estimate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Legislative - pay freeze</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-Union 0% compensation increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion ($130,000 gross for 2009)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL APPROVED AMENDMENTS TO DATE**

| 12.09 | $ (20,808,298) | -3.3% | -3.7% | -3.1% |

### Total Levy / Residential Impact

| $ 6,907.28 | $ 648,489,302 | $ 18,423,972 | 2.9% | 2.4% | 2.1% |

- Special Levy: Parkland (area rated to Hamilton) | $ 572,768
- Special Levy: Parkland (area rated to Dundas) | $ 44,230

**Total Levy / Residential Impact**

| $ 6,907.28 | $ 649,106,300 | $ 19,040,970 | 3.0% | 2.4% | 2.1% |

Final Reassessment/Tax Policy

-0.5% | -0.4%

**Total Levy / Residential Impact**

| $ 6,907.28 | $ 649,106,300 | $ 19,040,970 | 3.0% | 1.9% | 1.7% |
### Schedule B

#### 2009/2008 Area Rating Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEPARTMENT</th>
<th>BUDGET</th>
<th>HAMILTON</th>
<th>ANCASTER</th>
<th>DUNDS</th>
<th>FLAMBOROUGH</th>
<th>GLANBROOK</th>
<th>STONEY CREEK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Recreation 2009</td>
<td>32,580,337</td>
<td>25,286,457</td>
<td>77.6%</td>
<td>2,217,008</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>1,030,851</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan repayment parkland 2009</td>
<td>740,914</td>
<td>572,768</td>
<td>77.3%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>168,146</td>
<td>22.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Culture &amp; Recreation 2009</td>
<td>33,321,251</td>
<td>25,859,225</td>
<td>77.6%</td>
<td>2,217,008</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
<td>1,198,997</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Recreation 2008</td>
<td>28,884,590</td>
<td>22,579,905</td>
<td>78.2%</td>
<td>1,865,788</td>
<td>6.5%</td>
<td>880,662</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan repayment parkland 2008</td>
<td>123,916</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>123,916</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Culture &amp; Recreation 2008</td>
<td>29,008,506</td>
<td>22,579,905</td>
<td>77.8%</td>
<td>1,865,788</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>1,004,578</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change</td>
<td>4,312,745</td>
<td>3,279,320 (0.2%)</td>
<td>351,220</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>194,419</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>129,114 (0.1%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Fire 2009                           | 69,004,737 | 48,920,131 | 70.9%    | 5,858,546 | 8.5%        | 2,794,522 | 4.0%         | 4,352,891 | 6.3%        | 630,765 | 0.9%        | 6,447,881 | 9.3%        |
| Fire 2008                           | 64,674,762 | 46,726,827 | 72.2%    | 4,675,183 | 7.2%        | 2,644,173 | 4.1%         | 3,950,152 | 6.1%        | 576,379 | 0.9%        | 6,102,049 | 9.4%        |
| Change                              | 4,329,975  | 2,193,305 (1.4%) | 1,183,364 | 1.3%     | 150,349 (0.0%) | 402,738 | 0.2%         | 54,386 | 0.0%        | 345,833 | (0.1%)     |

| Transit 2009                        | 30,524,846 | 26,424,432 | 86.6%    | 839,524 | 2.8%        | 538,315 | 1.8%         | 387,059 | 1.3%        | 371,910 | 1.2%        | 1,983,606 | 6.4%        |
| Transit 2008                        | 29,188,904 | 25,856,407 | 88.6%    | 626,244 | 2.1%        | 512,930 | 1.8%         | 263,672 | 0.9%        | 220,100 | 0.6%        | 1,709,551 | 5.9%        |
| Change                              | 1,335,942  | 568,025 (2.0%) | 213,280 | 0.6%     | 25,385 0.0% | 123,387 | 0.4%         | 151,810 | 0.5%        | 254,055 | 0.6%        |

| Sidewalk Snow Removal 2009 *        | 85,830     | 0      | 0.0%    | 85,830 | 100.0%      | 0      | 0.0%         | 0      | 0.0%        | 0      | 0.0%        | 0         | 0.0%        |
| Sidewalk Snow Removal 2008 *        | 57,800     | 0      | 0.0%    | 57,800 | 100.0%      | 0      | 0.0%         | 0      | 0.0%        | 0      | 0.0%        | 0         | 0.0%        |
| Change                              | 28,030     | 0      | 0.0%    | 28,030 | 100.0%      | 0      | 0.0%         | 0      | 0.0%        | 0      | 0.0%        | 0         | 0.0%        |

| Total Area Rating - 2009            | 132,936,664 | 101,203,789 | 76.1%    | 9,000,908 | 6.8%        | 4,531,834 | 3.4%         | 6,013,260 | 4.5%        | 1,340,038 | 1.0%        | 10,846,835 | 8.2%        |
| Total Area Rating - 2008            | 122,929,972 | 95,163,139 | 77.4%    | 7,225,014 | 5.9%        | 4,161,681 | 3.4%         | 5,358,020 | 4.4%        | 1,108,861 | 0.9%        | 9,913,256 | 8.1%        |

| TOTAL CHANGE                        | 10,006,692 | 6,040,651 (1.3%) | 1,775,894 | 0.9% | 370,153 | 0.0%         | 655,240 | 0.1%         | 231,176 | 0.1%         | 933,579 | 0.1%        |

* charged to the transit area in ward 12
## 2009 Final Average Residential Tax Impacts by Ward

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ward</th>
<th>Reassessment</th>
<th>General Levy</th>
<th>Area Rating</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ward 1</td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 2</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 3</td>
<td>-0.6%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 4</td>
<td>-0.5%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 5</td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 6</td>
<td>-0.3%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 7</td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 8</td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 9</td>
<td>-0.4%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 10</td>
<td>-0.1%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 11 - SC</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 11 - GL</td>
<td>-0.6%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 11 - TOTAL</td>
<td>-0.3%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 12</td>
<td>-0.3%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 13</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 14 - AN</td>
<td>-0.5%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 14 - FL</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 14 - TOTAL</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ward 15</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>City-wide Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>-0.1%</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.9%</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.9%</strong></td>
<td><strong>1.7%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: reflects blended impacts (both with and without transit); anomalies may occur due to rounding