MINUTES
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
Thursday, June 25, 2009
12:00 noon, Room 207, 2nd Floor
Hamilton Convention Centre
1 Summers Lane

Present: A. Denham-Robinson (Vice Chair)
M. Adkins, A. Charlton, M. Kirk, R. Simpson, S. Stewart-Greene,
F. Thorp-Neufeld, K. Wakeman, and S. Wray

Absent with regrets: A. French (Chair), illness
Councillors B. Bratina, B. McHattie, and M. Pearson, City Business
G. Zajac, bereavement

Also Present: B. Khes, Acting Manager Community Planning and Design
D. Cuming, Senior Project Manager, Heritage and Urban Design
M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner
F. Thibeault, Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner
I. Bediou, City Clerk’s Office

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

(i) As Sue Davidson, the owner of 245 Garner Road West is unable to attend today’s meeting, Item 8.1 has been pulled from the agenda and will be included on the July 23 agenda.

(ii) Added memo from staff respecting Item 6.1.7. Copies have been distributed.

(iii) Added request to list and designate All Saints Church. This will be Discussion Item 8.4. Copies have been previously e-mailed and paper copies have been distributed.

(iv) Added information Item 10.3 which is an Update to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Handbook.
That the agenda be approved as amended.  

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)
There were none declared.

3. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 3)
None

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(Charlton/Thorpe-Neufeld)
That the Minutes of the May 28, 2009 meeting be approved as presented.

CARRIED

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)

(a) Central Public School, Hamilton – recognition of the beautifully maintained school property (A. Denham-Robinson – no copy)

Alissa Denham-Robinson advised that the deadline for nominations for the Beautifications Awards has passed and asked if the Committee members had any other suggestions noting that the person caring for the property does not want any recognition.

After a short discussion, the Committee agreed that it would be appropriate to send a letter.

(Thorp-Neufeld/Simpson)
That Sylvia Wray prepare a letter of acknowledgement to be sent on behalf of the Committee to the person responsible for maintaining the gardens at Central Public School.

CARRIED
(b) **71 Claremont Drive – the owner’s plans for the property (M. House – no copy) (Item 5.2)**

Meghan House advised that she contacted the owner of 71 Claremont Drive and he indicated that he does not have any intentions to demolish the house. He has been informed that the property has been included on the Municipal Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. He is currently consulting with cultural staff respecting his options which include the possibility of donating the house. However, he is not considering donating the land which would pose a problem with respect to designation.

(c) **Award Nominations for Community Heritage Recognition Awards 2009 (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 5.3)**

Alissa Denham-Robinson noted the various types of awards which are included in the agenda.

She noted that Frances Thorp-Neufeld had submitted a biography of Mr. Crozier’s contributions and asked for confirmation as to what category of award the Committee wished to nominate Mr. Crozier.

(Adkins/Kirk)

That Clare Crozier be nominated for the Lieutenant Governor’s Ontario Heritage Award for Lifetime Achievement.

**CARRIED**

(d) **Award Nominations for Young Heritage Leaders 2009 (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 5.4)**

The Committee noted the importance of recognizing youth volunteers and Frances Thorp-Neufeld suggested visiting schools and talking to teachers but due to the deadline for the current nominations, this is something to keep in mind for next time. Kathy Wakeman said she will provide some information respecting a youth volunteer at Battlefield House for the next round of nominations. It was noted that the award nominations occur twice a year.
(e) Award Nomination for Ontario Medal of Citizenship (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 5.5)

Kathy Wakeman indicated that she is currently gathering information for the Committee’s nomination of Susan Ramsay for the Ontario Medal of Citizenship.

6. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 6)

(a) Delegated Approvals (Item 6.1):

(i) Heritage Permit Application (replacement of fence), 1 Melville Street, Dundas – Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District (Ward 13) (Item 6.1.1)

(ii) Heritage Permit Application (construction of an accessory structure), 19 Victoria Street, Dundas, Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District (Ward 13) (Item 6.1.2)

(iii) Heritage Permit Application (Re-pointing), 1916 Centre Road, Flamborough – The Hall Parry Home, By-law No. 82-81 (Ward 15) (Item 6.1.3)

(iv) Heritage Permit Application (Patching or removal of damaged terracotta units, cleaning of metal spandrel panels, and the removal of windows and storefronts), 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton – Lister Block, By-law No. 96-175 (Ward 2)(Item 6.1.4)

(v) Heritage Permit Application (Cleaning of terracotta and brick, testing of metal spandrel panels, and removal of terracotta units), 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton – Lister Block, By-law No. 96-175 (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.5)

(vi) Heritage Permit Application (Window replacement), 121 Saint Clair Avenue, Hamilton – Saint Clair Avenue Heritage Conservation District, By-law 86-125 (Ward 3) (Item 6.1.6)

(Charlton/Adkins)
That Items 6(a)(i) to (vi) be received.

CARRIED
(vii) Heritage Permit Application HP2009-023 - 130 Mill Street North, Waterdown – (J. Muller – verbal/no copy) (Item 6.1.7)

Copies of a memo prepared by Joseph Muller were distributed and he provided an overview indicating that the heritage permit application was reviewed by the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee on June 4, 2009 and the Sub-Committee had expressed no objections.

Michael Adkins noted that part of the discussions at the Sub-Committee was that the tree next to the driveway not be cut down to accommodate this permit.

The Committee discussed this issue and requested that staff advise the applicant in the letter of approval that the scope of the approved permit did not include removal of the tree and that a separate permit would be required for its removal.

The recommendation was approved as follows:

(Adkins/Kirk)
That Heritage Permit HP2009-023 be approved for the alterations to the property, in accordance with the submitted application, subject to the following conditions:

(a) This approval expires June 30, 2011;

CARRIED

(b) Staff Reports/Recommendations (Item 6.2):
None

7. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS (Item 7)
None

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)
(a) Policy Design Sub-Committee Report (G. Zajac) (Item 8.1)

(This Item was deferred to the next meeting as per the changes to the agenda.)

(b) Proposal for the printing of Heritage Book Marks (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 8.2)
Alissa Denham-Robinson explained that the Education Sub-Committee is recommending that heritage book marks be used as a promotion tool rather than posters which are more time consuming. The book marks would be used for the display table and for obtaining recognition for the Committee’s new logo.

After a brief discussion, the Committee approved the following motion:

(Charlton/Adkins)
(a) That the HMHC Education and Communication Sub-Committee should proceed with the research and design of a series of Hamilton Heritage Bookmarks to be presented, reviewed and approved by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

(b) That funds from the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Publication Account, be used to print the series of Hamilton Heritage Bookmarks.

(c) That the total funds drawn from the HMHC Publication Account be limited to $300 for this project.

CARRIED

Frances Thorp-Neufeld suggested that the book marks be uploaded onto the Committee’s website.

(c) Gore Park Master Plan (Update) (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 8.3)

Alissa Denham-Robinson noted the three design concepts being considered for the Gore Park Master Plan which are included in the agenda and indicated that the Stakeholders’ Group is requesting some feedback.

She indicated that she and Michael Adkins could bring the Committee’s comments to the Stakeholders’ Group meeting which is scheduled for tonight or the Committee members could post their comments on-line.

The Committee discussed the following:

- The feasibility of including a skating area as the proposed location is adjacent to traffic;
- The plans are a little too ambitious – some of the proposed activities will not fit in well with the adjacent traffic;
The various garden spaces and walking spaces are good;

Suggestions to include the following:

- An activity that would encourage the participation of the general public rather than just sitting;
- A ribbon garden area with interactive activities to find out the history of Gore Park and other interesting pieces of information;
- Something that inspires or intrigues the public about the City in addition to the Veterans' Place
- Mounted bronze information plaques in the cement so that they cannot be stolen
- On the perimeter of the park, encased in the cement, outline historic points and provide historical information about the surroundings buildings, etc. that can be seen from the park;
- Use postcards and photos of previous years and compare them to today's streetscape;
- Include a walk of fame of Hamiltonians.

(d) Request to List and Designate All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (A. Charlton) (Added Item 8.4)

Anne Charlton addressed Committee and referred to the recent article by Paul Wilson in The Spectator about the pending demolition of All Saints Church.

She briefly outlined the Church's historical and architectural value. The Committee noted that the tower has been removed after it was damaged by an earthquake.

The Committee approved the following resolution:

(Charlton/Wray)

Whereas the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee is established under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act to advise and assist Council on matters under Parts IV and V of the Ontario Heritage Act; and

Whereas the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee has considered a preliminary cultural heritage evaluation of All Saints Church located at 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton hereto attached as “Appendix A”; and
Whereas the property is believed to be of cultural heritage value or interest according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 *Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest*; and

Whereas non-designated heritage property may be included in the Municipal Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* where it is believed that such property is of cultural heritage value or interest;

Now therefore it is recommended that Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee endorse and support the nomination and inclusion of the property known generally as All Saints Church and Rectory located at 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton in the Municipal Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest; and

Further that Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council that staff be directed to undertake a Cultural Heritage Assessment of All Saints Church and Rectory located at 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton with a view to prospective designation and that such work be placed in staff's work program for completion in 2009 or early in 2010 and that appropriate changes be made to the priorities and work program for remaining years 2009 to 2012.

**CARRIED**

9. Buildings and Landscapes

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – Councillor B. McHattie
   No updates.

(ii) Lister Block, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
   No updates

(iii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – G. Zajac
   No updates

(iv) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins
   No updates
(v) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
   No updates
(vi) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
   No updates
(vii) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton
   No updates
(viii) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins
   Michael Adkins noted that the building is looking good.
(ix) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton
   No updates
(x) 46 - 52 James Street North (D)– S. Stewart-Greene
   Susan Stewart-Greene advised that the building is looking better all the time and the work is progressing.

(Adkins/Kirk)
That All Saints Church be included on the Committee’s endangered Buildings and Landscapes list.

CARRIED

The Committee requested an update respecting All Saints Church and David Cuming responded that he believes the City has not received a site plan application as yet. Also, a heritage impact assessment is required as per the Downtown Renewal program and to date no demolition permit has been issued.

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Concern
(i) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins
   Michael Adkins advised the property is looking clean but there is no activity.
(ii) **Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton – F. Thorp-Neufeld**
No updates.

(iii) **Dundas Post Office, Dundas (L) – F. Thorp-Neufeld**
No updates

(iv) **Old Lyric Theatre, 14 Mary Street, Hamilton (D) – R. Simpson**
Richard Simpson advised that the building is looking terrible as the bricks are eroding and it is covered in graffiti. He has noted no activity.

Meghan House advised that it is staff’s understanding that the site plan for the proposed work has been approved.

(v) **795 Old Highway 8, the former Rockton Hotel Livery Stable (L) – S. Wray**
Sylvia Wray advised that there has been no change in status since her last report.

(vi) **East End (Barton) Reservoir - (M. Adkins)**
Michael Adkins indicated that he is waiting for a return call from the Curator to obtain an update on the status of the reservoir being included in the National Historic Site of Canada.

10. **GENERAL INFORMATION**

(a) **Minutes of the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee Minutes of April 7, 2009 (Item 10.1)**
No discussion.

(b) **Adaptive Reuse Case Study (Item 10.2)**
No discussion.
(c) Update to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Handbook (M. House – distributed at meeting) (Added Item).

Meghan House distributed updated inserts to be included in the members’ Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Handbooks.

(Charlton/Wakeman)
That Items 10(a) to (c) be received.

CARRIED

(d) Heritage Work Shop Update

The Committee was advised that the organizers of the Book fair are looking for a book related person to do a book related work shop. However, other ideas and venues for the heritage work shop are being explored.

Frances Thorp-Neufeld advised that the Dundas Museum may be interested in this proposal and she will check into it.

Kathy Wakeman enquired if anyone knows someone who is an expert on flags. The Committee members suggested Bishop Spence.

11. ADJOURNMENT

(Kirk/Stewart-Greene)
There being no further business, that the meeting be adjourned at 12:50 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Vice-Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Ida Bedioui
Legislative Assistant
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
June 25, 2009
Design value or physical value:
All Saints’ Anglican Church was designed by Hamilton architect, William Leith, and constructed in 1872-73. With its steeply pitched roof, sloping buttresses, pointed arch windows with simple tracery, brick masonry window details combined with stone construction, and interior open timber ceiling, it is a fine example of the late Victorian interpretation of early English Gothic country churches.

The rectory adjacent to the church on Queen St. and the Sunday School building to the rear were built in 1891. In 1909, to increase seating space, the chancel, vestry and one bay of the nave were removed and sympathetically replaced by a transept, a large chancel and a new vestry. The bell tower which stood at the northwest corner of the building was removed in 1999 after earthquake damage.

Historical values or associative values:
All Saints’ developed from the congregation of St. John’s Chapel, a mission of Christ’s Church Cathedral, and was the fourth Anglican church built in the old City of Hamilton. The cost of the land, construction and organ were all covered by Sen. Samuel Mills, a parishioner and prominent businessman, politician, president of the Gore Bank and a founding director of the Bank of Hamilton. After his death, the church and its grounds were transferred to the Anglican Diocese of Niagara for $1.00. All Saints’ was the mother church of St. Mark’s Anglican Church on Bay St. S. and St. George’s Anglican Church at Tom and Strathcona Sts., both of which are designated. The chapel in the north arm of All Saints’ transept is dedicated to the Hamilton nineteenth century businessman, Thomas Edwin Leather, and his wife, active leaders in the early years of All Saints’ Parish.

Contextual value:
The scale and construction of All Saints’ Church and its related buildings add significant visual and historical interest to this important corner location strategically sited at the intersection of King Street West and Queen Street South. The church stands as not only a prominent physical landmark but also is of significance as a marker of the later nineteenth century phase of downtown Hamilton development.