THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REPORTED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Monthly Status Report of Tenders and Requests for Proposals for September 1, 2012 to October 12, 2012 (FCS12018(g)) (City Wide) (Item 5.1)

(Pearson/Morelli)
That Report FCS12018(g), respecting the Monthly Status Report of Tenders and Requests for Proposals for September 1, 2012 to October 12, 2012, be received.
CARRIED

2. 2012 Third Quarter Non-compliance with the Procurement Policy Report (FCS12038(b)) (City Wide) (Item 5.2)

(Pearson/Morelli)
That Report FCS12038(b), respecting the 2012 Third Quarter Non-compliance with the Procurement Policy Report, be received.
CARRIED

3. Tax Appeals under Section 357 and 358 of the Municipal Act (2001) (FCS12007(g)) (City Wide) (Item 5.3)

(Pearson/Morelli)
(a) That Appendix “A” attached to Report FCS12007(g) respecting the “Tax Write-Offs processed under Section 357 of the Municipal Act, 2001”, in the amount of $82,282 be approved; and,
(b) That Appendix “B” attached to Report FCS12007(g) respecting the “Tax Appeals due to a Gross or Manifest Clerical Error, Pursuant to Section 358 of the Municipal Act, 2001”, in the amount of $25,234 be approved.

CARRIED

4. Treasurer’s Apportionment of Land Taxes for Properties in Hamilton and Stoney Creek (FCS12005(f)) (Wards 2, 9 and 11) (Item 5.4)

(Pearson/Morelli)

(a) That the 2012 land taxes in the amount of $1,853 for 105 Ferrie St. E., Hamilton (Roll #2518 020 162 05620 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the two newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to Report FCS12005(f);

(b) That the 2012 land taxes in the amount of $2,067 for 31 Warwick Rd., Stoney Creek (Roll #2518 003 290 08400 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the two newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to Report FCS12005(f);

(c) That the 2011 land taxes in the amount of $2,991 for 93 Bankfield Cres., Stoney Creek (Roll #2518 003 850 00180 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the six newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to Report FCS12005(f);

(d) That the 2011 land taxes in the amount of $5,983 for 82 Highgate Dr., Stoney Creek (Roll #2518 003 850 00310 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the eighteen newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to Report FCS12005(f);

(e) That the 2011 land taxes in the amount of $3,036 for 36 Leckie Ave., Stoney Creek (Roll #2518 003 850 19200 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the two newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to Report FCS12005(f); and,

(f) That the 2012 land taxes in the amount of $2,696 for 482 Glover Rd., Stoney Creek (Roll #2518 003 020 17200 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the two newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to Report FCS12005(f).

CARRIED

5. KPMG – Final Report – Evaluation of the City of Hamilton Accounts Payable Program (FCS11051(b)) (City Wide) (Item 5.5)

(Pearson/Morelli)

That Report FCS11051(b), respecting KPMG’s Final Report – Evaluation of the City of Hamilton Accounts Payable Program, be received.

CARRIED
6. **2012 Third Quarter Emergency and Non-competitive Procurements Report (FCS12040(b)) (City Wide) (Item 5.6)**

   (Pearson/Morelli)
   That Report FCS12040(b), respecting the 2012 Third Quarter Emergency and Non-competitive Procurements Report, be received.

   CARRIED

7. **Freedom of Information Quarterly Report (July 1 to September 30, 2012) (CL12004(b)) (City Wide) (Item 5.7)**

   (Pearson/Morelli)
   That Report CL12004(b), respecting the Freedom of Information Quarterly Report (July 1 to September 30, 2012), be received.

   CARRIED

8. **Succession Management and Leadership Development (HUR12017) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)**

   (Pearson/Morelli)
   That Report HUR12017, respecting Succession Management and Leadership Development, be received.

   CARRIED

9. **Procurement Sub-Committee Report 12-001, October 11, 2012 (Item 8.1)**

   (Pearson/Morelli)
   (a) **Appointment of Chair and Vice-Chair (Item A)**

      (i) That Councillor Lloyd Ferguson be appointed Chair of the Procurement Sub-committee for the 2010-2014 term of Council.

      (ii) That Councillor Terry Whitehead be appointed Vice-Chair of the Procurement Sub-committee for the 2010-2014 term of Council

   (b) **2012 Procurement Sub-Committee Policy Review and Proposed Amendments (FCS12085) (City Wide) (Item 6.1)**

      (i) That the City of Hamilton Procurement Policy, attached hereto as Appendix “A”, as amended, be approved;

      (ii) That a by-law to adopt and maintain a Procurement Policy for the City of Hamilton, in substantially the form set out in Appendix “A” to Report 12-001, as amended, be passed.

   AMENDMENT CARRIED
   MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED
10. HMRF/HWRF Pension Administration Committee Report 12-001, October 22, 2012 (Item 8.2)

(Pearson/Morelli)
(a) Master Trust Pension Investment Performance, December 31, 2011 (FCS11083(a)) (City Wide) (Item 4.1)

That Report FCS11083(a), respecting the Master Trust Pension Investment Performance as of December 31, 2011, be received.

(b) Master Trust Pension Investment Performance, June 30, 2012 (FCS12070) (City Wide) (Item 4.2)

That Report FCS12070, respecting the Master Trust Pension Investment Performance as of June 30, 2012, be received.

(c) 2012 Master Trust Pension Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures (FCS12084) (City Wide) (Item 5.1)


(ii) That the 2012 Master Trust Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures (attached as Appendix “A” to Report 12-001) be forwarded to the Hamilton Street Railway (HSR) Pension Advisory Committee for their information.

(d) Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund (HWRF) – December 31, 2011, Valuation (FCS12081) (City Wide) (Item 6.1)

(i) That the Treasurer be authorized to file the December 31, 2011, actuarial valuation for the Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund (HMRF) attached as Appendix “B” to Report 12-001;

(ii) That, the Hamilton Municipal Retirement Fund adopt the smoothing technique, which allows for 5 year averaging, for solvency funding purposes for both solvency assets and liability purposes.
(e) Survivor Spouse Change (Item 7.1)

(i) That correspondence, respecting a Survivor Spouse Change, be received.

(ii) That the correspondence, respecting a Survivor Spouse Change, remain confidential and restricted from public disclosure.

CARRIED

11. Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 12-004, October 30, 2012 (Item 8.3)

(Morelli/Pearson)

(a) One Year Pilot Project period – 2 GIC, 1 Af&A, 1 E&CS (Item 4.1)

(i) That regular meetings of the General Issues Committee continue to be scheduled twice per month;

(ii) That, in addition to the one regular meeting of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee each month, a second meeting be scheduled, during the second Council week, if required, to be at the call of the Chair.

(iii) That, in addition to the one regular Emergency and Community Services Committee meeting scheduled each month, a second meeting be scheduled during the second Council week, if required, and at the call of the Chair.

(b) Approval of 2013 Council/Committee Calendar

(a) That during the summer months of July and August, all Standing Committees be scheduled to convene during the Committee week;

(b) That the 2013 Council/Committee Calendar, attached as Appendix A to Report 12-004, as amended, be approved.

AMENDMENT CARRIED

MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED

12. Alternative Voting Solutions for Municipal Elections (FCS12046) (City Wide) (Item 8.4)

(Morelli/Pearson)

(a) That staff be directed to issue a Request for Proposals for the lease of vote scanners, which is to include all hardware, software and technical
support from the vendor, at a cost not to exceed $350,000 for the 2014 Municipal Election;

(b) That $100,000 from the Capitol Project Fund (3521251201) be transferred to the Election Expense Reserve (112206) for 2012;

(c) That a budget increase of $150,000 to the Election Expense Reserve (112206) be referred to the 2013 Budget deliberations for consideration.

13. Records Retention By-law (CL12007) (City Wide) (Item 8.5)

(Pearson/Morelli)
That the by-law, entitled “To Amend By-law No. 11-040 To Establish Retention Periods for Records of the City of Hamilton”, attached as Appendix “A” to Report CL12007, be passed.

CARRIED

14. Municipal Services & Property Taxation on Condominium Properties (FCS12020(a)) (City Wide) (Item 8.7)

(Pearson/Johnson)
(a) That, in adherence to the proposed Work Plan, attached as Appendix “A” to Report FCS12020(a)), respecting Municipal Services & Property Taxation on Condominium Properties, staff be directed to report back to their respective Standing Committees on the following:

(i) Potential options and costs involved with maintaining condominium catch basins, fire hydrants, larvicide within common areas of the condominium corporations’ properties and street lighting.

(b) That staff be directed to prepare a final, comprehensive Information Report to the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee, subsequent to reports of all Departments being considered by their respective Standing Committees, to provide an overview of who has done what in each category.

AMENDMENT CARRIED
MOTION AS AMENDED CARRIED

15. Updated Municipal Contribution Agreement – Ontario Lottery & Gaming Corporation (FCS12093) (City Wide) (Item 8.8)

(Pearson/Morelli)
That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized to execute the updated Municipal Contribution Agreement between the City of Hamilton and the Ontario Lottery
and Gaming Corporation (OLG), as outlined in Appendix “A” to Report FCS12093.

CARRIED

16. Legal and Arbitration Fees - Employee and Labour Relations (HUR12016) (City Wide) (Item 8.9)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the Human Resources Division, Employee and Labour Relations Section budget request for an additional $200,000 for legal fees and an additional $50,000 for mediations/arbitrations, be referred to the 2013 budget process for consideration.

CARRIED

FOR THE INFORMATION OF COMMITTEE:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

(i) Added as Item 4.2 – a delegation request from Mr. Joe Beattie, Business Manager for the Hamilton-Brantford Building Trades, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (no copy)

(ii) Added as Item 4.3 – a delegation request from Philip Besseling, Besseling Mechanical Inc., respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule

(iii) Added as Item 4.4 – a delegation request from John Gray, Municipal Solutions, on behalf of the IBEW and UA and their Private Sector Contractor Partners, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule

(Pearson/Morelli)
That the agenda for the November 12, 2012 Audit, Finance & Administration Committee meeting be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

Councillor B. Morelli declared an interest to Item 8.7 – Report FCS12020(a), respecting Municipal Services & Property Taxation on Condominium Properties, as he is a condominium owner.
(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 3)

(i) October 4, 2012 (Item 3.1)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the Minutes of the October 4, 2012 meeting of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 4)

(i) Michele Starr, Deanlee Management Inc., respecting a Request for Development Charge Demolition Credit Extension for the Chedoke Browlands, 849 Scenic Drive, Ancaster (Item 4.1)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the delegation request from Michele Starr, Deanlee Management Inc., respecting a Request for Development Charge Demolition Credit Extension for the Chedoke Browlands, 849 Scenic Drive, Ancaster, be approved to appear in the new year at the same meeting that the staff report is listed on the agenda.

CARRIED

(ii) Joe Beattie, Business Manager for the Hamilton-Brantford Building Trades, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (no copy) (Item 4.2)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the delegation request from Joe Beattie, Business Manager for the Hamilton-Brantford Building Trades, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be approved.

CARRIED

(iii) Philip Besseling, Besseling Mechanical Inc., respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (Item 4.3)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the delegation request from Philip Besseling, Besseling Mechanical Inc., respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be approved.

CARRIED
(iv) John Gray, Municipal Solutions, on behalf of the IBEW and UA and their Private Sector Contractor Partners, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (Item 4.4)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the delegation request from John Gray, Municipal Solutions, on behalf of the IBEW and UA and their Private Sector Contractor Partners, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be approved.

CARRIED

(e) Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes (Items 5.8 to 5.10)

(Pearson/Morelli)
That the following Advisory Committee Minutes, be received:

(i) Aboriginal Advisory Committee Minutes, June 7, 2012 (Item 5.8)

(ii) Aboriginal Advisory Committee Minutes, July 5, 2012 (Item 5.9)

(iii) Status of Women Committee Minutes, June 28, 2012 (Item 5.10)

CARRIED

(f) DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

(i) Joe Beattie, Business Manager for the Hamilton-Brantford Building Trades (HBBT), respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (Item 6.1)

Mr. Beattie addressed Committee, respecting Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule. Mr. Beattie’s comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Expressed concerns with respect to the Christian Labour Association of Canada (CLAC) bidding for work for the City of Hamilton.
- The HBBT has had a long partnership with the City of Hamilton; performing work under the present Fair Wage Policy.
- The HBBT and non union group bid for City projects using the HBBT base rates and now staff is recommending a labour union who are about 1/8th the size of the HBBT to bid work for the City using their bid rates, which are lower.
- This will undermine the present system that has been in place since the inception of the City’s Fair Wage Policy.
- Proposed change would allow CLAC to have a huge advantage over the building trades as well as the non union group in bidding for City work.
- The HBBT submitted their new wage packages in May/June of 2012, but HBBT was not aware that CLAC was submitting their wage package as well.
- The intent of the City’s Fair Wage Policy was to ensure that taxpayers’ taxes were never meant to drive down the wages of workers performing work on City projects.
- The HBBT would prefer the changes be taken back for more consultation, and if not, the bid trades and our contractors will challenge these recommendations.

The full presentation is available for viewing on the City’s website.

(Pearson/Morelli)

That the presentation from Joe Beattie, Business Manager for the Hamilton-Brantford Building Trades, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be received.

CARRIED

(ii) Philip Besseling, Besseling Mechanical Inc., respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (Item 6.2)

Mr. Besseling addressed Committee, respecting Report FCS12083 / HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule. Mr. Besseling’s comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- We are in support of article 3.
- Company has been in operation in Stony Creek since 1948.
- Our employees wanted to be represented by CLAC.
- Besseling Mechanical does not pay starvation wages, if we did our people would leave us.
- Our employees have chosen to split their wages up differently; they have chosen to put more of their money into their pension. If the pension amount was calculated into the total package, it would be comparable.
- Our rates our negotiated fairly and honourably.
- It is Besseling’s position that the Fair Wage Policy should dictate the total compensation to the employee, but not interfere with the structure of wages and benefits the employee and employer have agreed to, especially if that agreement is a result of a negotiated collective agreement.
Should the City decide to include a Fair Wage Policy in its construction contracts, Besseling believes that the wages and benefits of an employer's collective agreement should supersede those of the Fair Wage Policy.

The full presentation is available for viewing on the City’s website.

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the presentation from Philip Besseling, Besseling Mechanical Inc., respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be received.

CARRIED

(iii) John Gray, Municipal Solutions, on behalf of the IBEW and UA and their Private Sector Contractor Partners, respecting Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (Item 6.3)

Mr. Gray addressed Committee, respecting Report FCS12083 / HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule. Mr. Gray's comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Represents the International Brotherhood of International Workers (IBEW) and the United Association (UA) across Ontario and British Columbia.
- Here to draw attention to negatives impacts that could arise by approving certain clauses in the report.
- Find strange that clause is included as it will give precedence to one union negotiation.
- Fair wage policies are designed to level the playing field.
- Keeping track of the fast changing market would be difficult in itself and this would create administrative difficulty to both bidders and staff.
- Policy would create an increased change orders.
- The two tier system also rewards clear bias to out of town contractors and workers.
- The existing fair wage system in Hamilton has worked well for decades.

The full presentation is available for viewing on the City’s website.

(Pearson/Morelli)
That the presentation from John Gray, Municipal Solutions, on behalf of the IBEW and UA and their Private Sector Contractor Partners, respecting
Item 8.6 – Report FCS12083/HUR12015, Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be received.

CARRIED

(g) Succession Management and Leadership Development (HUR12017) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

Helen Hale Tomasik, Executive Director, Human Resources and Organizational Development, provided an overview of Report HUR12017 with the use of a PowerPoint presentation. The presentation included, but was not limited to, the following:

- A systematic approach to identifying, assessing and retaining employees for key roles within the organization in the future.

- Focus is on developing these employees so the organization has a pool of candidates who have the necessary skills and competencies to compete for key positions when vacancies and opportunities arise.

- Workforce planning involves analysis of current workforce, determining future workforce needs, identifying gaps between present and future, and implementing solutions to close the gaps.

- Succession planning focuses on leadership roles and other critical roles that have the greatest impact on business strategy.

- Improves engagement and retention of top performers.

- Improves organization’s ability to achieve long-term business objectives.

- Gives management a better understanding of competencies, capabilities and career interests of their employees.

- Protects against corporate knowledge loss;

- Prepares City to deal with sudden loss of key people; and,

- Over long term, leads to a more effective and efficient organization.

Succession Planning Progress in 2012:

- A Succession Planning Policy has been developed.

- Tools and templates developed to facilitate collection of data and talent discussions.
• 15 employees in senior management intend to retire within 3 years; only 6 of these positions have an internal candidate ready now or within 1 – 2 years.

• In some areas, two levels of management are eligible to leave within same time frame.

• Need to move succession planning to management and supervisory ranks.

• Concern expressed that high potentials not prepared to move into management.

• Critical need to transfer knowledge & experience.

• Replacement and retention strategies are required now for high risk areas.

• Program needs to have corporate wide scope.

Next Steps to Advance a Corporate Succession Management & Leadership Program:

• Corporate Succession Planning Policy.

• Corporate Leadership Pathway.

• Learning and Development Framework.

• Acting Assignments and Lateral Transfer Policy.

• Departmental leadership programs (e.g. Public Health Services, Public Works).

• Exploratory meetings with local community institutions to partner on corporate-wide leadership development.

• Develop a transparent, criteria-based succession management program to identify high potentials.

• Take succession planning to manager and supervisor level in the organization.

• Create a corporate leadership development plan to:
• accelerate the development of identified high potentials;
• develop supervisors across the organization; and,
• develop those who aspire to supervisory and management roles.

- Perform succession planning annually to ensure high potentials are identified and developed for key positions.

A full copy of the presentation is available online or through the Office of the City Clerk.

(Pearson/Morelli)
That the staff presentation, respecting Report HUR12017 – Succession Management and Leadership Development, be received.

CARRIED

(h) Procurement Sub-Committee Report 12-001, October 11, 2012 (Item 8.1)

(Pearson/Morelli)
That pages 18 and 29 of Appendix “A” to the Procurement Sub-Committee Report 12-001, be amended by deleting the dollar amount of $4,999 and replacing it with the dollar amount $10,000; and, on Page 29 by deleting the dollar amount of $5,000 and replacing it with the dollar amount $10,000, to read as follows:

(a) Approval Authorities for various Procurement Policies (Page 18 of 55)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESTIMATED PROCUREMENT VALUE ($ Canadian Funds, exclusive of applicable taxes)</th>
<th>APPROVAL AUTHORITY POLICY # 2</th>
<th>PROCUREMENT POLICY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Up to $10,000</td>
<td>General Manager or Authorized Delegate</td>
<td>Policy # 5.1 – Low Dollar Value Procurements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Pearson/Morelli)
That sub-section (b) of Item 1 of the Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 12-004 be deleted in its entirety and replaced to read as follows:
1. One Year Pilot Project period – 2 GIC, 1 AF&A, 1 E&CS (Item 4.1)

(a) That regular meetings of the General Issues Committee continue to be scheduled twice per month;

(b) That, in addition to the one regular meeting of the Audit, Finance and administration Committee each month, a second meeting be scheduled, during the second Council week, if required, to be at the call of the Chair.

(c) That, in addition to the one regular Emergency and Community Services Committee meeting scheduled each month, a second meeting be scheduled, during the second Council week, if required, to be at the call of the Chair.

(b) That Appendix “A” to sub-section (b) of Item 2 of the Governance Sub-Committee Report 12-004 be amended by deleting the calendar pages for January, February and March in their entirety and replacing them with the amended calendar pages for January, February and March 2013 (attached hereto), which include the 2013 budget dates:

2. Approval of 2013 Committee Calendar (New Business)

(a) That during the summer months of July and August, all Standing Committees be scheduled to convene during the Committee week;

(b) That the 2013 Committee Calendar, attached as Appendix “A”, as amended, be approved.

CARRIED

(j) Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule (FCS12083/HUR12015) (City Wide) (Item 8.6)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That Report FCS12083/HUR12015, respecting the Proposed Fair Wage Policy and Fair Wage Schedule, be tabled to the December 10, 2012 Audit, Finance & Administration Committee meeting.

CARRIED
(k) GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)

11.1 Amendments to the Outstanding Business List

(Morelli/Pearson)
That the following item be considered complete and removed from the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee’s Outstanding Business List:

(i) Item “J” - KPMG - Evaluation of the City of Hamilton Accounts Payable Program (FCS11051(b))

(ii) Item “E” – Incorporation of a Portion of the Commercial Advertising and Sponsorship Policy into the Procurement Policy.

CARRIED

(l) ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)

(Morelli/Pearson)
That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee be adjourned at 11:32 a.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor B. Johnson, Chair
Audit, Finance and Administration Committee

Stephanie Paparella
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk