MINUTES
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
Thursday, November 26, 2009
12:00 noon, Room 207, 2nd Floor
Hamilton Convention Centre
1 Summers Lane

Present:
A. French (Chair)
A. Denham-Robinson (Vice Chair)
Councillors B. Bratina, B. McHattie and M. Pearson
M. Adkins, A. Charlton, M. Kirk R. Simpson, F. Thorp-Neufeld
K. Wakeman, and G. Zajac

Absent with Regrets:
S. Stewart-Greene and S. Wray

Also Present:
D. Cuming, Senior Project Manager, Heritage and Urban Design
M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner
B. Williamson, Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner – Student
A. Bradford, Director of Culture and I. Kerr-Wilson, Manager of Museums and Heritage Presentation, Community Services
I. Bedioui, Legislative Assistant, City Clerk’s Office

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised of the following additions to the agenda:

(a) Added delegation request Item 3.1 from John Ariens of IBI Group respecting 437 Wilson Street, Ancaster (Wynnstay Estate, formerly Dalley Estate, presently Mount Mary Immaculate). He has indicated that he wishes to attend the January 28, 2010 meeting. (Copies distributed.)

(b) Added motion for the Committee’s consideration with respect to Item 5.2 regarding the EA for the redevelopment of 100 West 5th Street. This is added as Item 5.2 (a). (Copies distributed.)
(c) Added hand-out from Chair French concerning Item 8.3.

(d) Added motion from Anne Charlton respecting Item 8.4, the All Saints Anglican Church. This will be Item 8.4(a) and copies have been distributed.

(e) Added correspondence Item 8.7 from Linda Muir and Peter Hyland respecting traffic problems on Mill Street, Waterdown. (Copies distributed.)

Recommendation: Be received and referred to the Public Works staff for a report to the Public Works Committee.

(f) Added correspondence Item 8.8 from Michael Chan, Minister of Citizenship and Immigration respecting Ontario’s volunteer recognition programs. The nomination closing dates vary in the month of January 2010. (Copies distributed.)

(g) Added Item 8.9 which is a letter of resignation from Francis Thorp-Neufeld.

(h) Added information Item 10.4 which is a letter from the Ontario Heritage Trust advising of a new online resource providing information about places of worship. (Copies distributed.)

(Adkins/Thorp-Neufeld)
That the agenda be approved as amended.

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

George Zajac declared a conflict with respect to added delegation request Item 3.1 as it was submitted by one of his co-workers, Item 8.2 as he is acquainted with the owner of the property and also Item 8.4 as one of the principals is his client.

Councillor Bratina declared an interest with respect to Item 8.4 respecting All Saints Church and Rectory as he has had discussions with the Parish and with the proponents and has taken a position with respect to this issue.
3. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 3)

(i) John Ariens of IBI Group respecting 437 Wilson Street Ancaster (Wynnstay Estate, formerly Dalley Estate, presently Mount Mary Immaculate. (Added Item 3.1)

(Pearson/Adkins)
That the delegation request from John Ariens of IBI group respecting 437 Wilson Street Ancaster be approved to attend at the January 28, 2009 Committee meeting.

CARRIED

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(Adkins/Denham-Robinson)
That the Minutes of the October 22, 2009 meeting, of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)

(a) Auchmar Gatehouse, status of owner’s offer to donate the building to the City (No copy - A. Bradford) (Item 5.1)

Anna Bradford addressed Committee and advised that Ian Kerr-Wilson, Manager of Museums and Heritage Presentation is also in attendance to assist Committee.

Anna Bradford indicated that the owner of the Auchmar Gatehouse had offered to donate the building to the City if the City was willing to move it and she noted that moving the building would be considered only as a last resort.

Currently, staff is investigating the condition of the structure and what options are available. Staff is hoping that the building can remain where it is and is reviewing the availability of loans to assist the owner with repairs.

Richard Simpson indicated that Paul Wilson will be reporting on the Gatehouse in his column in the Spectator.

The Committee thanked Anna Bradford and Ian Kerr-Wilson for attending the meeting and providing the update.
That the verbal update from Anna Bradford respecting the Auchmar Gate House be received.

CARRIED

(b) Correspondence respecting MEI Class Environmental Assessment (EA) West 5\textsuperscript{th} Campus, Hamilton (D. Cuming)

Added Motion respecting Item 5.2(a) – copies distributed

David Cuming briefly provided some background information and outlined his response to the Ontario Realty Corporation's (ORC's) e-mail, copies of which were included in the agenda.

(McHattie/Adkins)

Further to the Ontario Realty Corporation's (ORC) email correspondence of November 9, 2009 to the City requesting that the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee "confirm that a Heritage Impact Assessment which examines the effects of the proposed development and the mitigation of these effects would satisfy the Committee"; and

Further to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee's consideration of the matter at its meeting of December 18, 2008 wherein it considered that a complete heritage impact assessment should be submitted;

Now therefore the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advises the ORC that a complete heritage impact assessment which examines a range of alternatives to the undertaking as well as the identification and evaluation of adverse and beneficial effects to identified cultural heritage features, including examination of mitigation measures, be prepared for the consideration of the Committee.

CARRIED

6. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 6)

(a) Delegated Approvals (Item 6.1):

(i) Heritage Permit Application (Roof Replacement) 22 Veegers Drive, Hamilton (Ward 5) (Item 6.1.1)
(ii) Hamilton Permit Application (Second Storey Balcony Repairs) 33 King Street West, Dundas (Ward 13) (Item 6.1.2)

(iii) Heritage Permit Application, (Masonry test area) 25 Mill Street North, Waterdown, Waterdown Public Library, former East Flamborough Township Hall, By-law No. 78-21 (Ward 15) (Item 6.1.3)

(iv) Heritage Permit Application (Removal of vegetation and fencing) 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (Auchmar Estate) By-law No. 2000-37 (Ward 8) (Item 6.1.4)

(v) Heritage Permit Application (Roof Retrofit), 108 James Street North, Hamilton (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.5)

(vi) Heritage Permit Application (Exterior alterations and additions – revised) 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton. Lister Block, By-law No. 96-175 (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.6)

(vii) Heritage Permit Application (Cladding and Exterior Restoration), 314 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, Hammill House, Designation By-law No 78-86 (Ward 12) (Item 6.1.7)

(viii) Heritage Permit Application (Tree Removal), 81 Mill Street North, Waterdown, Mill Street Heritage Conservation District (Ward 15) (Item 6.1.8)

(ix) Heritage Permit Application (End Wall Repairs), 122 MacNab Street South, Hamilton, MacNab-Charles Heritage Conservation District (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.9)

(x) Heritage Permit Application (Replacement of cedar shingles and metal flashings on the woodshed), 900 Woodward Avenue, Hamilton, Hamilton Museum of Steam and Technology – Woodshed, By-law No. 84-30 (Ward 4) (Item 6.1.10)

(Adkins/Charlton)
That Items 6(a)(i) to 6(a)(x) be received. CARRIED

(ii) Staff Reports/Recommendations (Item 6.2)
None
7. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS

None

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)

(a) E-mail from Pat Saunders of the Hamilton Historical Board respecting Relocation of Heritage Marketplace) (Item 8.1)

The Committee discussed this issue and decided not to participate due to the timing of the event and the open air location.

(Wakeman/Kirk)
That the Chair of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee respond to the e-mail from the Hamilton Historical Board respecting the relocation of the Heritage Marketplace and advise that although the Committee has enthusiasm for the project, it is declining to participate due to the fact it will be held in the summer.

CARRIED

(b) Verbal update respecting 137 Catharine Street North, former home of Lester B. Pearson (Outstanding Business List Item B) – Councillor Bratina (Item 8.2)

Councillor Bratina advised that the Beasley Neighbourhood Association is very much interested in the building being identified as the former residence of Lester B. Pearson.

(Bratina/Kirk)
That the issue of identifying 137 Catharine Street North as the former residence of Lester B. Pearson, be referred to the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee.

CARRIED

(Wakeman/Pearson)
That the verbal update from Councillor Bratina be received and the Item be removed from the Outstanding Business List.

CARRIED

(c) 2010 Heritage Awards Night (A. French – no copy) (Item 8.3).

The Chair referred to the Heritage Awards Night hand-out with suggestions for award recipients and indicated that the location still needs to be determined and a brief discussion on the options followed.
Chair French indicated that the Committee’s approval is being requested for the proposed date.

(Denham-Robinson/Kirk)
That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee approve the proposal to hold the 2010 Heritage Awards Night on February 17, 2010 at 7:00 p.m. and the location and other details are to be determined.

CARRIED

(d) All Saints Anglican Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton

(i) Heritage Evaluation Statement, All Saints Anglican Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (Ward 5) – (D. Cuming) (Item 8.4)

David Cuming provided a brief overview of the background respecting this site and of the staff memoranda included in the agenda which outline why the Heritage Evaluation Statement received by staff does not satisfy the requirements for a heritage impact assessment.

(Pearson/Adkins)
That the staff memoranda dated November 6 and November 16 2009, and the accompanying Heritage Evaluation Statement be received by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee and that any further revisions or amendments to the Heritage Evaluation Statement be forwarded by staff to the Policy and Design Subcommittee for review and comment

CARRIED

(ii) Request to consider adaptive re-uses of All Saints Anglican Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton – (A. Charlton) (Added Item 8.4(a))

Anne Charlton presented a motion respecting All Saints Church and advised that it is one of the first four Anglican churches built in Hamilton and all of the other three churches have been designated.

A discussion followed on how the motion would fit in with the staff memoranda. The Committee amended the motion by
removing the word “all” before the word “building” in the second last paragraph and approved it as amended, as follows:

(Charlton/Adkins)
That the following resolution be forwarded to Council and the Anglican Diocese of Niagara:

Whereas the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee recognizes the architectural, cultural and contextual significance of All Saints’ Anglican Church, and

Whereas All Saints’ Anglican Church, designed by Hamilton architect, William Leith and built in 1872, is a fine example of the late Victorian interpretation of early English Gothic country churches, and

Whereas the Rectory and Sunday School of All Saints’ Anglican Church, built in 1891, were designed by Hamilton architect, James Balfour, and

Whereas the stained glass windows of All Saints’ Anglican Church were designed by the internationally acclaimed firm of Robert McCausland Company, and

Whereas All Saints’ Anglican Church was founded as a mission church of Christ’s Church Anglican Cathedral and was the mother church of two churches designated under the Ontario Heritage Act, St. Mark’s on Bay St. and St. George’s at Tom and Strathcona, and

Whereas All Saints’ Anglican Church was the site of the first Synod of the Diocese of Niagara in 1875, and

Whereas All Saints’ Anglican Church has unique historical associations with late nineteenth century community builders including Senator Samuel Mills, who financed its construction, Thomas and Helen Leather, and Senator Donald MacInnes, and

Whereas the scale and construction of All Saints’ Anglican Church and its related buildings add significant visual and historical interest to its important corner location strategically sited at the intersection of King St. W. and Queen St. S., and
Whereas the All Saints’ Anglican Church complex stands as a marker of the later nineteenth century phase of downtown Hamilton development;

Now therefore the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee respectfully advises Council and the Anglican Diocese of Niagara of the heritage value of All Saints’ Anglican Church;

Further Hamilton City Council has made a commitment to conserve and protect Hamilton’s built heritage;

Further in the last decade, a record of ecclesiastical adaptive re-use has developed in major Canadian centres such as Toronto, Brantford and Ottawa, including the Glebe Lofts, formerly Riverdale Presbyterian Church at 660 Pape Ave., Toronto, the Abbey Lofts, formerly Howard Park United Church at 384 Sunnyside Ave., Toronto, and the Church Lofts, formerly Centennial United Church at 701 Dovercourt Rd., Toronto;

Further the American organization, Partners for Sacred Places (www.sacredplaces.org), is an excellent source of practical and imaginative solutions geared towards the preservation of historic churches and the revitalization of congregations;

Further the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee would encourage the Anglican Diocese of Niagara and the congregation of All Saints’ Anglican Church to fully examine the possibility of adaptive re-use of buildings on the All Saints’ Anglican Church site;

Further the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee would welcome the opportunity to continue this dialogue with the Anglican Diocese of Niagara and the congregation of All Saints’ Anglican Church.

CARRIED

(e) Gore Park Master Plan Project (Alissa Denham-Robinson – no copy) (Item 8.5)

Alissa Denham-Robinson advised Committee that the regular meetings of the Gore Park Master Plan Project which she and Michael Adkins attended as representatives of the Committee have now ended. Le Ann Seely the Project Manager will be presenting an information report
to the Public Works Committee on January 18, 2010. Alissa Denham-Robinson and Michael Adkins have been invited to continue to participate and they have agreed and will be reporting back to Committee on a regular basis.

(Pearson/Thorp-Neufled)
That the verbal update from Alissa Denham-Robinson respecting the Gore Park Master Plan Project be received.

CARRIED

(Bratina/Wakeman)
That Le Ann Seely be invited to attend a meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee to provide an overview of the Gore Park Master Plan Project and obtain the Committee’s input.

CARRIED

(f) Education and Communication Subcommittee Items (Alissa Denham-Robinson – no copy) (Item 8.6)

(i) Year End Report

Alissa Denham-Robinson indicated that the Chairs’ submissions for the Committee Year End Report need to be completed by the next meeting date and she also requested that the Members submit their ideas and/or photos.

As there have been no designations this year, staff suggested that the number of issued heritage permits could be highlighted.

(ii) Heritage Week Celebration

See Item 8(c).

(g) General Correspondence (Added Items)

The Committee amended the recommendation by adding that the correspondence also be referred to the Ward Councillor.

(Pearson/Thorp-Neufeld)
(i) Correspondence from Linda Muir and Peter Hyland respecting traffic problems on Mill Street, Waterdown. (Added Item 8.7)
Recommendation: Be received and referred to the Ward Councillor and to Public Works staff for report to the Public Works Committee.

CARRIED

(Wakeman/Charlton)
(ii) Correspondence from Michael Chan, Minister of Citizenship and Immigration respecting Ontario’s volunteer recognition programs. The nomination closing dates vary and are in January 2010. (Added Item 8.8)

Recommendation: Be deferred to the next Committee meeting.

CARRIED

(ii) Letter of resignation from Frances Thorp-Neufeld. (Added Item 8.9)

Frances Thorp-Neufeld addressed Committee indicating that she enjoyed serving on the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee but is no longer able to fulfill her responsibilities and has tendered her resignation effective January 2010.

(Adkins/Zajac)
That the resignation from Frances Thorp-Neufeld be accepted with regrets.

CARRIED

9. Buildings and Landscapes
(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:
   (i) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – Councillor B. McHattie
       No updates
   (ii) Lister Block, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
       No updates
(iii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – G. Zajac
No updates

(iv) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) – M. Adkins
No updates

(v) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
No updates

(vi) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
Councillor McHattie read from an e-mail which he received respecting the Tivoli advising that all interior work has been completed and new foundation walls were constructed on the front and north side of concourse and other structural repairs have been undertaken. The landscaping and parking area are nearing completion. Replacing the roofing materials is scheduled for next week and the building will be heated this winter.

(vii) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton
No updates

(viii) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins
Councillor Bratina advised that there are several obstacles with respect to this project and the funds from the Province have not been confirmed.

(ix) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton
No updates

(x) 46 - 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
No further updates
(xi) All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (A. Charlton)

See Item 8(d).

(xii) Grove Hall, Hickory House, Gateview, Century Manor and surrounding landscape, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton – (K. Wakeman)

No updates

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Concern

(i) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins

Michael Adkins indicated that the graffiti is being removed on a regular basis.

(ii) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton - F. Thorp-Neufeld

David Cuming advised that a staff report respecting the designation of the Desjardins Canal will be presented to the Economic Development and Planning Committee on December 1, 2009.

(iii) Dundas Post Office, Dundas (L) – F. Thorp-Neufeld

Frances Thorp-Neufeld indicated that the post office is for sale and the community is considering options for the tower and the clock.

(iv) Old Lyric Theatre, 14 Mary Street, Hamilton (D) – R. Simpson

No updates

10. GENERAL INFORMATION

(a) E-mail from Heritage Canada Foundation respecting Heritage Day 2010: The Heritage of Sport and Recreation (Item 10.1)

For information.

(b) November Book Fair (Alissa Denham-Robinson (Item 10.2)

Alissa Denham Robinson thanked Kathy Wakeman and Art French for helping with the November Book Fair which was successful and raised $63.00. She advised that sixteen sets of book marks were sold.
(c) HMHC Book Marks (The book marks are now available for purchase – Introductory cost of $1 each or set of 3 for $2. Book marks will be available at the Meeting for anyone interested in making a purchase.) (Alissa Denham-Robinson – no copy)(Item 10.3)

Alissa Denham-Robinson distributed the book marks for the Committee members to see and purchase if they wish.

(d) Letter from Lincoln Alexander of the Ontario Heritage Trust dated November 6, 2009 respecting a new online resource regarding places of worship. (Item 10.4)

(Adkins/Charlton)
That Items 10 (a) to (d) be received for information.  

CARRIED

11. New Business

Kathy Wakeman advised that the Kenilworth Library is a gem of a building and deserves to be designated. Staff advised that they will provide some information concerning the building at the next Committee meeting.

12. ADJOURNMENT

(Charlton/Adkins)
There being no further business, that the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting be adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Art French, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Ida Bedioui
Legislative Assistant,
City Clerk's Office
November 26, 2009