SUBJECT: Parking Bay - Stone Church Road (South Side)  
(PW06099 (a)/PED06340 (a)) (Ward 8)  
Referred from City Council on August 9, 2006  

RECOMMENDATION:  
(a) That no further action be taken respecting the proposal to construct a parking bay on the South side of Stone Church Road.  
(b) That Planning and Economic Development staff be directed to continue to work with Sweet Paradise’s owners to find an alternative location with sufficient parking to relocate their business within the community.  
(c) That the item entitled “Parking Bay Stone Church Road” referred from City Council on August 9, 2006, be identified as completed and removed from the Public Works Committee Outstanding Business List.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

At the August 9, 2006 meeting of the Committee of the Whole, staff was directed to prepare a comprehensive feasibility report providing background information on constructing a parking bay on the south side of Stone Church Road, east of Upper Paradise. Staff have numerous reservations respecting the proposed bay, which are set out in the “Analysis/Rationale” Section of this report. The expenditure of public funds to accommodate a business’s customer parking needs would be precedent setting.

BACKGROUND:

At the July 12, 2006 meeting of the Committee of the Whole, it was moved that Public Works staff be directed to construct a parking bay on the south side of Stone Church Road West, east of Upper Paradise Road (See Appendix “A” attached to Report PW06099 (a)/PED06340 (a)) to address increased parking demands generated by growth in commercial business activity in the area and staff were, consequently, directed to prepare a report providing background information on the matter. At its meeting of August 9, 2006, the Committee of the Whole received Report PW06099/PED06340, which recommended that, “no further action be taken respecting the proposal to construct a parking bay at Stone Church Road (south side)”, and the Committee, subsequently, issued the following directive;

That staff be directed to prepare a comprehensive feasibility report respecting the request to construct a parking bay facility to provide “on street” parking capacity on the southern part of Stone Church Road, east of Upper Paradise Road for submission prior to the 2007 Budget Process addressing the following:

(a) Review of Available Solutions.
(b) Recommendation for a Preferred Solution.
(c) Design Details for Recommended Solution.
(d) Cost Analysis for Recommended Solution.
   (i) Construction.
   (ii) Operating Budget Impacts.
       (1) Roads Maintenance Program.
       (2) Meter Program Revenues.
(e) Capital Funding Sources.  

Having further investigated the matter, this report is in satisfaction of that directive.

ANALYSIS/RATIONALE:

The business that appears to have the greatest difficulty with customer parking is the Sweet Paradise Bakery and Deli, located at 630 Stone Church Road West. This business, at present, provides 16 customer parking spaces in the parking lot located at the front (south side) of the building and has the potential to provide up to 11 stacked parking spaces for long-term employee parking along the east side of the building. The

---

1 Item No. 39, Committee of the Whole Minutes, August 9, 2006.
requirements under Section 18, Table 1, 4(i), of the Zoning By-law, indicate that only nine parking spaces must be provided based on the 259 square metres of retail space within the premises to which the regulation applies.

Staff have been advised that customers of Sweet Paradise, when they are unable to find sufficient parking in the Sweet Paradise parking lot, tend to park in the parking lots of adjacent businesses, which adversely affects the operation of said businesses. A Traffic/Parking study was conducted on Saturday, October 21, 2006 between the hours of 11:00 a.m. and 1:00 p.m., which revealed that of the 158 vehicles transporting occupants that proved to be customers of Sweet Paradise:

- 143 vehicles utilized the Sweet Paradise parking lot;
- 2 vehicles parked in the driveway leading to the parking lot;
- 8 vehicles parked in the neighbouring commercial plaza to the west;
- 4 vehicles parked in the visitor parking lot located in the residential complex to the east; and,
- 1 vehicle stopped temporarily in the bicycle lane on the south side of Stone Church Road.

Further, correspondence from Cynthia A. Nash, L.L.B., representing Sanmount Properties Limited, being the owner of the westerly adjoining commercial plaza, indicates that Sanmount Properties has found it necessary to engage the services of a private security firm to deter Sweet Paradise customers from parking on their property.

Economic Development staff advised that efforts to date to identify a suitable new location for Sweet Paradise with adequate on-site parking have been unsuccessful.

A review of the physical layout of the property at 630 Stone Church Road West has ruled out the possibility of additional parking spaces being constructed on the allowance abutting the subject property on its south side, pursuant to a Commercial Boulevard Parking Agreement, due to there being insufficient space available for such a solution. In addition, there is also no possibility of expansion in any other direction.

**ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION:**

(A) **Construction of a Parking Facility (Bay)**

An alternative to the recommendation is the construction of a parking bay on the south side of Stone Church Road West, opposite number 630, notwithstanding that this alternative would only mitigate, but not resolve, the existing parking problem.

As illustrated within Appendix B, a bay could commence at a point approximately 85 metres east of Upper Paradise Road and extend approximately 48 metres easterly there from. Discounting the access and egress curvature of the barrier curbing defining the bay, there will be approximately 33.5 metres of usable parking space sufficient for five vehicles. The bay will displace three mature trees and will require the modification of a below grade hydro vault such that the vault’s existing rectangular access cover is
replaced with a round cover suitable for roadway use. Roadway drainage will be managed through the installation of a 0.5 metre dropped gutter running along the north side of the bay and a 0.15 metre barrier curb will be installed along the south side to prevent vehicles from encroaching on the adjacent sidewalk. (See Appendix “B” to Report PW06099 (a)/PED06340 (a)).

It should be noted that the collision statistics, compiled since 2001, for the area of Upper Paradise Road and Stone Church Road West include three mid-block collisions on Stone Church Road between Courtland Avenue and Upper Paradise Road, two of which involved cyclists and one of which involved a pedestrian. Given that the proposed bay is on the side of the street opposite to Sweet Paradise, it is probable that most customers of that establishment using the bay will cross mid-block, as opposed to walking 85 metres to cross at the nearest traffic signal. This factor will undoubtedly perpetuate, if not increase, the potential for pedestrian/vehicle conflict. Additionally, the construction of the proposed bay would likely encourage “U-turn” movement on the part of west bound traffic, further increasing the risk of vehicle/vehicle conflict and potentially inhibiting the flow of traffic in the westbound centre lane.

It is also the opinion of staff that the addition of five parking spaces will do little to alleviate the parking congestion being experienced by the customers of Sweet Paradise, particularly in view of the fact that parking in the proposed bay cannot be reserved for Sweet Paradise customers, since to do so would constitute “bonusing”, as prohibited by Section 106 of the Municipal Act, 2001. Accordingly, the customers of other area businesses and any other motorist wishing to park in the area must also be allowed to use the bay for parking and, in any case, five parking spaces would only address approximately one third of the parking overflow observed in the study carried out in October of last year.

(B) Status Quo Option

A further alternative consists of maintaining the status quo wherein Sweet Paradise’s customers will continue to have a shortage of parking spaces during peak times. Vehicles may park illegally on Stone Church Road or on private property.

As a final point, concerns have been expressed respecting the opinions that might be held by the public respecting the use of tax dollars in an effort to contribute to the success of a private sector commercial enterprise and the perception of precedent that might, rightly or wrongly, be associated with such an undertaking. Staff would point out that, from a public relations point of view, it is one thing to construct a bay to accommodate school busses and/or parents that are delivering children to school; it is, however, quite another thing to construct a bay at the tax payers’ expense to provide additional parking for use by the customers of a business operating for a profit.
FINANCIAL/STAFFING/LEGAL IMPLICATIONS:

ALTERNATIVE A

As part of the 2007 Capital Budget process, $75,000 could be allocated to finance the construction of a 33.5 metre long parking bay on the south side of Stone Church Road West, east of Upper Paradise Road. The General Manager of Public Works could be authorized and directed to proceed with the design, tender and construction of the aforesaid parking bay.

To construct the bay, there would be an expenditure of approximately $50,000 associated with the reconfiguration of the roadway to accommodate the proposed bay, which includes the removal of three existing mature trees. Said expenditure includes a 15% contingency allowance, 6% for engineering costs, the 7% associated with construction and contract supervision, the normal 10% contingency allowance and $1,500 for the removal/relocation of the existing trees.

In addition, Horizon Utilities Corporation estimates that modifying the structure of the below grade hydro vault and replacing the rectangular access cover with a round cover suitable for roadway use will cost in the order of $20,000. Horizon Utilities further advises that this estimate assumes that all work is done during regular working hours, however, said work will be done on a cost-plus-supervision basis and will be invoiced in accordance with the actual cost of the work performed.

Staff also estimates that an additional $5,000 should be budgeted to accommodate administrative costs, overtime costs (particularly those incurred by Horizon Utilities Corporation), and any increase in materials costs that might be experienced between the time that the work is approved and the time that the work actually commences.

As to Operating Budget impacts; staff would suggest that the Roads Maintenance Program may be minimally impacted and that Meter Program Revenues would be non-existent since the enforcement and maintenance costs would be greater than any revenue that might be generated from parking fees and parking fines. In view of the fact that there are only five parking spaces, and there are no other on-street meters in the general area, staff does not recommend the installation of parking meters to regulate parking in the proposed bay.

ALTERNATIVE B

None

POLICIES AFFECTING PROPOSAL:

N/A
SUBJECT: Parking Bay - Stone Church Road (South Side)  
(PW06099 (a)/PED06340 (a)) (Ward 8)  
Referred from City Council on August 9, 2006 - Page 6 of 6

RELEVANT CONSULTATION:


CITY STRATEGIC COMMITMENT:

By evaluating the “Triple Bottom Line”, (community, environment, economic implications) we can make choices that create value across all three bottom lines, moving us closer to our vision for a sustainable community, and Provincial interests.

Community Well-Being is enhanced. ☐ Yes ☑ No  
Environmental Well-Being is enhanced. ☐ Yes ☑ No  
Economic Well-Being is enhanced. ☐ Yes ☑ No  

Does the option you are recommending create value across all three bottom lines? ☐ Yes ☑ No  

Do the options you are recommending make Hamilton a City of choice for high performance public servants? ☐ Yes ☑ No
PROPOSED PARKING LAY BY ON THE SOUTH SIDE OF STONE CHURCH ROAD WEST, EAST OF UPPER PARADISE ROAD, ACROSS FROM ‘SWEET PARADISE’
CITY OF HAMILTON
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

LEGEND

NOT TO SCALE

2007-03-12

REFERENCE FILE NO: PW06099/PED06340