Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
Thursday, March 25, 2010
12:00 noon, Room 207, 2nd Floor
Hamilton Convention Centre
1 Summers Lane

Present:  A. French (Chair)
Councillors B. Bratina, B. McHattie and M. Pearson
M. Adkins, A. Charlton, M. Kirk, S. Nowak, R. Simpson,
S. Stewart-Greene, K. Wakeman, and S. Wray

Absent with Regrets:  A. Denham-Robinson (Vice Chair), other commitment
G. Zajac, illness

Also Present:  B. Khes, Acting Manager Community Planning and Design
M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner
J. Budinsky, Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner – Student
J. Warner, Project Manager, Facilities
S. Hunter, Project Manager, A. Tatlidil, Assistant Project Manager, Hamilton City Hall Renovations, ABE EllisDon Corporation
K. Church, Heritage Consultant, Ventin Group Limited
M. Alderson, Forest City Fire Protection
I. Bedioui, Legislative Assistant, City Clerk’s Office

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk noted the following:

(a) The delegation request which is Item 3.1 on the agenda from Ellen Kowlachuk, of the ORC respecting the addendum to the Heritage Impact Assessment for the West 5th Campus redevelopment project is for approval to attend the April 22, 2010 meeting;
(b) As Alissa Denham-Robinson is unable to attend today’s meeting, Item 5.2 respecting the Committee’s Year End Report is deferred to the April meeting;

(c) Hard copies of Items 6.2.1 and 7.1 which were e-mailed to Committee yesterday have been distributed and the inserts for the Committee Handbook (Item 10.2) have also been distributed.

(Stewart-Greene/Kirk)
That the agenda be approved as amended.  

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)
None declared.

3. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 3)
(a) Request from Ellen Kowalchuk, Cultural Heritage Specialist for the Ontario Realty Corporation and St. Joseph’s Healthcare to present the requested addendum to the Heritage Impact Assessment for the West 5th Campus redevelopment project. (Item 3.1)

(Adkins/Nowak)
That the request from Ellen Kowalchuk, Cultural Heritage Specialist for the Ontario Realty Corporation and St. Joseph’s Healthcare to present the requested addendum to the Heritage Impact Assessment for the West 5th Campus redevelopment project be approved to attend the April 22, 2010 Committee meeting.

CARRIED

(b) Letter from Ellen Kowalchuk, Cultural Heritage Specialist for the Ontario Realty Corporation with the attached Heritage Impact Assessment – Addendum (Item 3.1(a))

(Pearson/Wray)
That the Heritage Impact Assessment – Addendum respecting the West 5th Campus redevelopment project be referred to the Policy and Design Sub-Committee for review and report back.

CARRIED
4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(Adkins/Stewart-Greene)
That the Minutes of the February 25, 2010 meeting, of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented. CARRIED

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)

(a) Book Marks – feedback from the Hamilton Library Board (Councillor M. Pearson – verbal update) (Item 5.1)

Councillor Pearson advised that the Hamilton Central Library is currently being renovated and once the renovations have been completed she will investigate whether the book marks could be included in the information section of the library.

(b) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year End Report (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 5.2)

This Item was deferred to the April 22, 2010 meeting.

6. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 6)

(a) Delegated Approvals (Item 6.1):

(i) Heritage Permit Application (Pruning of trees in the public right-of-way) Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District, Dundas (Ward 13) (Item 6.1.1)

(ii) Heritage Permit Application (Installation of one window in the 1913 Pumping Station) 900 Woodward Avenue, Hamilton, Hamilton Museum of Steam and Technology – 1913 Pumping Station By-law No. 86-310 (Ward 4) (Item 6.1.2)

(iii) Heritage Permit Application (Installation of new interior signage and refurbished aluminium lettering in various locations throughout Hamilton City Hall) 71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Hamilton City Hall, By-law No. 06-011 (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.3)
(iv) Heritage Permit Application (Installation of LCD monitors in various locations, floor plan and wall elevation revisions, repair of washroom tiles, and the application of a coating on the wishbone bridge and ancillary building soffits) 71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Hamilton City Hall, By-law No. 06-011 (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.4)

(Pearson/Adkins/)
That Items 6(a)(i) to 6(a)(iv) be received.

CARRIED

(b) Staff Reports/Recommendations (Item 6.2)

(i) Heritage Permit Application (HP2010-020) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for the Installation of Sprinklers under the Central Lobby Stairs at 71 Main Street West, Hamilton (Hamilton City Hall) (Ward 2) (Item 6.2.1)

Meghan House provided a brief overview of the application. She explained that it was considered by the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee and the Sub-Committee recommended denial of the application. She indicated that the sprinkler system has already been installed without a heritage permit and provided details on the location and how it was installed. Meghan House indicated that staff is recommending approval of the heritage permit on a temporary basis subject to the conditions outlined in the recommendation. She noted that over the course of the renovations the project team has worked hard to accommodate the heritage features of the building.

The Committee expressed the following concerns:

- The sprinklers were installed before the heritage permit was issued which is in contravention of the Ontario Heritage Act;
- How long before the temporary installation is replaced?
- How to guarantee that something compatible will be installed within one year?
- The lack of a proposal of what will replace the current installation;
- The approval is for the installation of a temporary system but the application is for the installation of a permanent system;
- The copper pipes are an aesthetic eyesore in a $72 Million renovation project;
• The pipes could have at least been installed in a manner that they would be less visible.

Kevin Church, Heritage Consultant with Ventin Group Limited circulated large colour photos showing three views of the stairs, two of which were of the south elevation showing the installed sprinklers.

In response to the Committee’s enquiry on what will replace the temporary sprinklers, Scott Hunter, the Project Manager from ABE EllisDon Corporation explained that the Permit Review Sub-Committee had suggested a columnar design. However, the project team feels that this would have more impact on heritage space and fabric and he provided sketches illustrating the reasons. He noted that the columns would also impede the information desk.

In response to the Committee’s concerns that the pipes are too visible and unsightly, Scott Hunter outlined the reason why they could not be installed closer to the stairs and he produced a paint sample which closely matches the colour of the wood of the stairs which will make the pipes less noticeable.

Meghan House confirmed that staff is of the opinion that a different system should be proposed and in the meantime, the temporary system should be made to look as aesthetically pleasing as possible.

Committee noted that the workmanship of the installation looked substandard.

(McHattie/Wray)
That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council:

That Heritage Permit Application (HP2010-020) for the installation of sprinklers under the central lobby stairs of the interior of the designated property at 71 Main Street West, Hamilton (Hamilton City Hall) be referred back to staff and the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee in order to find a more acceptable alternative method of installing the sprinklers.

CARRIED
7. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS
   (a) Request to Repeal Former City of Stoney Creek By-law No. 5002-99 being a By-law to Designate 11 Manor Place, Stoney Creek under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (Ward 9) (Item 7.1)

   Meghan House provided a brief overview of the report and the history of the property.

   Councillor Pearson advised that she has never before seen a request to de-designate a property.

   Kathy Wakeman, the Committee member representing Stoney Creek advised that she has received numerous comments from Stoney Creek residents in support of refusing the request and upholding the designation of the property.

   (Pearson/Wakeman)
   That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council that the application by Ms. Kelly Delaney, owner of 11 Manor Place, Stoney Creek, City of Hamilton, to repeal the former City of Stoney Creek designating By-law 5002-99, under Section 32 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act, be refused.

   CARRIED (unanimously)

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)
   (a) Request to Designate 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Dundas Post Office) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED10006) (Ward 13) (Item 8.1)

   The Chair noted that this Report was approved by Council on March 10, 2010 and is before Committee today for information and consultation.

   (Nowak/Kirk)
   (i) That Report PED10006 respecting Request to Designate 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former Dundas Post Office) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, be received;

   (ii) That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee concurs with Council’s decision that 104 King Street West, Dundas (Former
Dundas Post Office) be added to the Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

CARRIED

9. Buildings and Landscapes

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – Councillor B. McHattie
No updates.

(ii) Lister Block, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
Meghan House advised that new windows are being installed in the building and work has commenced in the basement. Heritage permit applications have been submitted for some restoration work and temporary heat has been installed in certain locations of the building. It is anticipated that the project will be completed in 2012.

In response to a question from Committee, Meghan House confirmed that the heritage consultant is storing the heritage materials off site for restoration and repair and have been inventoried.

(iii) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – G. Zajac
Chair French advised that the property looks to be in good shape.

(iv) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) – M. Adkins
Michael Adkins advised that as of two weeks ago, the property looked the same. It has not been significantly altered.

(v) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
No changes.
(vi) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie

Councillor McHattie advised that there has been some work to the building completed through a City grant.

Councillor Bratina advised that an excavating machine used on the property has caused damage to the neighbouring building on the north side of the property. An Order to Comply has been issued to the owner of the adjacent property to repair the wall. Once the cladding of the neighbouring building is removed, the beautiful façade exposed.

(vii) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton

No updates.

(viii) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins

Michael Adkins advised that the property continues to deteriorate.

(ix) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton

No updates.

(x) 46 - 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene

Joseph Muller advised that the City’s Property Standards Division issued an Order to Comply to the building owner as the front façade is bowing. The building will be inspected by a building engineering.

(xi) All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (L) - (A. Charlton)

No updates.

(xii) Grove Hall, Hickory House, Gateview, Century Manor and surrounding landscape, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (L)(R)(D) – (K. Wakeman)

Chair French advised that he drove by the property and the Gageview building looks to be in good shape.
(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Concern

(i) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins

Michael Adkins noted that there is a fair amount of graffiti on back end of the property and there are some broken windows on ground level which should be reported to the Property Standards staff. Councillor Bratina indicated that the owner is now ready to move ahead with the project.

(ii) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton (R) – S. Nowak

Stan Nowak advised there are no updates except the neighbouring property was recently flooded and the City is clearing away the debris and taking down the green houses.

(iii) Dundas Post Office, Dundas (L) - S. Nowak

Stan Nowak advised that the new owners have submitted an application for a rezoning to central area commercial modified. They are in agreement with maintaining the property, especially the clock tower. Some former post office employees have been enquiring about the property.

10. GENERAL INFORMATION

(a) Letter from Elaine Scrivener, Executive Director of Mark Preece Family House, 40 Wellington Street North, Hamilton (Item 10.1)

The Chair referred to the letter and noted that in addition to this feedback there have been other positive outcomes of the recent heritage awards ceremony. For example, the Ancaster Old Mill will be featuring their certificate of award on their website.

(b) Updated inserts for the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Hand book (Item 10.2)

Meghan House requested that the Committee members insert the updated information into their handbooks. She will be providing a copy of the revised Ontario Heritage Act at a future date. Michael Adkins suggested that the Joint Plaques Sub-Committee information be included in the handbook.
(c) Tariff Fee - Land Registry Offices (Item 10.3)

Chair French advised the members if they make copy of letter and take it with them to the Land Registry Office, the fees will be waived.

(Pearson/Adkins)
That Items 10(a) and 10(c) be received for information.

CARRIED

11. NEW BUSINESS

Councillor Bratina distributed copies of photos and background information of the Harmony Apartments located at 245 Bay Street North. He advised that the owner is concerned that the Pan Am Games project may result in the building being demolished. Councillor Bratina suggested that the Committee may be interested in this issue due to the building's architectural and heritage character.

Kathy Wakeman noted that the recently renovated Gage Park looks phenomenal.

Sue Stewart-Greene recommended that the Committee Members take a tour of Stinson School.

12. ADJOURNMENT

(Wakeman/Adkins)
There being no further business, that the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting be adjourned at 1:05 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Art French, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Ida Bediou
Legislative Assistant,
City Clerk's Office
March 25, 2010