



General Issues Committee

REPORT 11-030

(as amended by City Council on October 26, 2011)

9:30 a.m.

Thursday, October 13, 2011

Council Chambers

Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

Present: Deputy Mayor J. Partridge (Chair)
Mayor B. Bratina
Councillors C. Collins, S. Duvall, J. Farr, L. Ferguson,
B. McHattie, S. Merulla, B. Morelli, T. Jackson, B. Johnson,
R. Pasuta, M. Pearson, R. Powers, T. Whitehead

Absent with Regrets: Councillor B. Clark – Personal

Also Present: C. Murray, City Manager
R. Rossini, General Manager, Finance and Corporate
Services
B. Goodger, A/General Manager, Public Works
B. Jansenn, A/General Manager, Planning & Economic
Development
J. A. Priel, General Manager, Community Services
N. Everson, Director, Economic Development & Real Estate
C. Biggs, Co-ordinator, Committee Services/Council/Budgets

THE GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE PRESENTS REPORT 11-030 AND RESPECTFULLY RECOMMENDS:

1. **Conventional, Rapid and Inter-Regional Transit: Technical, Financial and Land Use Considerations (CM11016/PW11064/PED11154/FCS11072) - (City Wide) (Item 7.1)**
 - (a) That Senior Management Team be authorized and directed to complete the works itemized below for the B-Line and the A-Line (as outlined in Tables 1, 2 and 3 within this report), given that the work currently underway as part of the Contribution Agreement alone is not sufficient and understanding that, prior to making any funding recommendation on Light Rail Transit, Metrolinx requires completion of all of the following works including:

Council – October 26, 2011

- (i) All deliverables relating to the Contribution Agreement between the City of Hamilton and Metrolinx (attached as Appendix E);
 - (ii) The project benefit and cost report (*Making the Case* as described in Table 2), including the cost of not doing LRT and a triple-bottom line analysis and that if the study requires additional funding, that those funds be sought from Metrolinx;
 - (iii) Maintenance Storage Facility analysis and Environmental Assessment, B-Line Phasing Strategy, Electromagnetic Field Study at McMaster University, A-Line Terms of Reference for Planning, Design and Engineering and Infrastructure Ontario Value for Money Exercise
- (b) That Senior Management Team be authorized and directed to negotiate with Metrolinx a funding formula to complete the above works at an upset limit of \$950,000 in combined staff and consulting services, and that any resulting City portion be funded from the Quick Wins Reserve # 108047;
 - (c) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services report back to General Issues Committee with financial impacts and a funding strategy for Council consideration when a funding commitment for a Light Rail Transit project is announced by senior levels of government;
 - (d) That Staff be authorized and directed to pursue further Metrolinx funding to purchase additional 18.2 metre (60-foot) hybrid articulated buses to immediately address capacity shortfalls in the A-Line and B-Line corridor, while the longer term plan, including rapid transit, is under development;
 - (e) That the General Manager of Planning and Economic Development complete the B-Line Nodes and Corridors Land Use Planning Study and give priority to the completion of node and/or corridor plans for James Street and Centennial Parkway in recognition of the planned GO Transit stations at James Street North and Centennial Parkway, as part of a long term Nodes and Corridors Planning Work Program;
 - (f) That Senior Management Team develop an organizational structure and community engagement strategy to support, over the long term, an integrated public transportation program for the City that encompasses provincial, inter-regional, inter-city, rapid transit, public transit, active transportation and transportation demand management no later than Q1 2012. Should this exercise conclude that additional staff complement and or budget is required, SMT is directed to report back to General Issues Committee prior to implementation;
 - (g) That the City Manager be authorized and directed to correspond with Metrolinx to reaffirm the City's commitment to modernizing public transportation in the City of Hamilton including light rail and GO transit;

- (h) That in their report back, staff include firm capital costs and a recommended ask to Metrolinx for capital and net change in operating costs in LRT vs existing bus system, including cost per passenger;
- (i) That Metrolinx be requested to reimburse the City of Hamilton for the total funding of \$5.1 million which has been allocated for the transit initiative.

2. 2008-2011 Strategic Plan Annual Report (2010) (CM11014) (City Wide) (Added as Item 8.1)

That Report CM11014 respecting the 2008-2011 Strategic Plan Annual Report, be received.

The following was added as Item 3:

3. Meeting Respecting the City's Position on the LRT

That the Mayor and the Government Relations Contact Team meet with the Minister of Transportation, Official leader of the Opposition and Leader of the Third Party to bring Hamilton's current position on LRT to their attention and the City's need for 100% Capital Funding.

FOR THE INFORMATION OF COUNCIL:

Councillor Partridge welcomed and thanked John Howe from Metrolinx who was in attendance at the meeting to respond to questions of the Committee.

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

The Clerk advised of the following changes:

ADDED DISCUSSION ITEM

- (a) 2008-2011 Strategic Plan Annual Report (2010) (CM11014) (City Wide) (Added as Item 8.1) (Tabled by Committee on October 11, 2011)

On a motion, the agenda was approved, as amended.

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

None

(c) APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MINUTES (Item 3)

None

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS

On a motion, the following delegation request was approved and the rules of order were waived to allow the delegation to address the Committee at this meeting:

- (i) Delegation Request from David Adames, Hamilton Chamber of Commerce, respecting the LRT project.

(e) PUBLIC DELEGATIONS/HEARINGS

Chair Partridge called upon the following:

(i) Ian Dunlop, Rapid Transit Citizens Advisory Committee, to present a brief summary of the work of the RTCA over the past year (Item 6.1)

Ian Dunlop addressed the Committee on behalf of Rapid Transit Citizens Advisory Committee to express RTCAC'S support of the Light Rail Transit project and commended all staff for the hard work that has gone into preparing the report being presented today.

A copy of Mr. Dunlop's comments were submitted to the City Clerk for the public record and are attached as Appendix "A" to General Issues Committee Report 11-030.

On a motion, the presentation from Ian Dunlop on behalf of the Rapid Transit Citizens Advisory Committee, be received.

(ii) Kathy Drewitt, Downtown Hamilton B.I.A., in support of LRT (Item 6.2)

Not in attendance.

(iii) David Adames, CEO of the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce, respecting the LRT Project

David Adames appeared before the Committee on behalf of the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce to: reiterate the Chamber's official policy on Mass Transit; comment on the staff report; and, to encourage the City to "keep the homework going" by completing the current scope of work and submit for another round of funding to complete a full assessment for LRT in Hamilton.

To conclude, the Chamber supports the report's recommendation to complete the current scope of work under the terms agreed to with Metrolinx and prepare another funding request to complete a full assessment. The Chamber also congratulated the City on its working relationship with Metrolinx and for completing as much work as it has to date.

The Chamber is prepared to help, where appropriate, and can also help with the value for money exercise required by Metrolinx, if needed. The Chamber is ready to continue to work with the City on this important issue.

A copy of Mr. Adames' comments were submitted to the City Clerk for the public record and are attached as Appendix "B" to General Issues Committee Report 11-030.

On a motion, the presentation from David Adames, on behalf of the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce, was received.

(f) PRESENTATIONS

(i) Conventional, Rapid and Inter-Regional Transit: Technical, Financial and Land Use Considerations (CM11016/PW11064/PED11154/FCS11072) (City Wide) (Item. 7.1)

Chris Murray provided introductory comments and outlined the proceedings of how the information would be provided to the Committee. In his remarks, Mr. Murray acknowledged the report contributors, including Don Hull, Justin Readman, Carla Ippolito, Mary Devorski, Bill Janssen, Christine Lee-Morrison, Chris Phillips and Al Kirkpatrick.

Mr. Murray provided three messages to the Committee:

- 1st – finish the homework – be enthusiastic, LRT is too important to this community; given great encouragement from Metrolinx; this is about making an informed decision
- 2nd – recognize that the purpose of this meeting is not to make a billion dollar decision; need to stay on a particular path and broaden
- 3rd – while focus has been on LRT, GO Transit is important as well.

At the end of the day, this is about public transportation, building a strong link to Union Station, and should be seen as a strategic priority for this community which requires a strong staff group. Approach this project in a multi-disciplinary way.

- at the end of the day, all about public transportation, strong link to union Station; should be seen as a strategic priority for this community; need strong staff group
- approach this project in a multi-disciplinary way

With the assistance of power point, the following presenters addressed the Committee:

- Background – Don Hull
- PDE/Project Benefits Presentation – Alan Jones, Steer Davies Gleave
- Staff Presentation – Don Hull and Rob Rossini
- Summary – Don Hull

The purpose of the presentation is to:

- Update Council on the status of the Rapid Transit Initiative
- Seek Council direction to complete necessary works with Metrolinx
- Consider acceleration of HSR service development plans
- Express support of the integration of regional public transportation throughout the Golden Horseshoe.

Copies of the power point presentations were submitted to the Clerk for the public record and are available for viewing on the City of Hamilton website.

On a motion, the staff and consultant's presentation respecting Conventional, Rapid and Inter-Regional Transit: Technical, Financial and Land Use Considerations, was received.

During the period that John Howe from Metrolinx was responding to questions of the Committee, he committed to taking the City's funding request of \$950,000 to the Metrolinx Board. In his comments, Mr. Howe stated that Metrolinx wants Hamilton to get to the finish line and is very close to doing so. All of the staff reports that have been submitted clearly outline the work that needs to be done, timelines and estimated costs. Metrolinx is in sync with the contents of the staff report before the Committee today.

On a motion, the following was added as sub-section (h):

- (h) That in their report back, staff include firm capital costs and a recommended ask to Metrolinx for capital and net change in operating costs in LRT vs existing bus system, including cost per passenger.

The Amendment **CARRIED**.

On a motion, the following was added as sub-section (i)

- (i) That Metrolinx be requested to reimburse the City of Hamilton for the total funding of \$5.1 million which has been allocated for the transit initiative.

The Amendment **CARRIED** on the following recorded vote:

Yeas:	Bratina, Collins, Farr, Ferguson, Merulla, Pearson, McHattie, Jackson, Johnson, Partridge, Pasuta, Pearson
Total Yeas:	12
Nays:	Powers
Total Nays:	1
Absent:	Clark, Duvall, Morelli
Total Absent:	3

On a motion, sub-section (a)(ii) was amended by adding the following after the words, "Table 2":

"...including the cost of not doing LRT and a triple bottom line analysis and that if the study requires additional funding, that those funds be sought from Metrolinx."

The Amendment **CARRIED** and the Main Motion, as amended, **CARRIED**.

(g) MOTIONS

(i) Light Rail Transit and Go Transit (Item 9.1)

Councillor Farr withdrew the following motion as the issues in his motion have been resolved with the presentation by staff and the recommendations approved:

Whereas in approving Item 6 of Public Works Committee Report 11-016 on October 19, 2008, City Council's official position is in support of a full investigation of Light Rail Transit (LRT); (see Council motion of record attached hereto)

And Whereas Metrolinx, at both the senior staff and Board levels, have been clear that they are supportive of LRT in Hamilton and have strongly encouraged further investigation;

And Whereas it is critical that Hamilton maintain its position ahead of other GTA municipalities when it comes to being considered for LRT;

And Whereas Hamilton must prepare a strong economic benefits case, including but not limited to: tax assessment growth along the B-Line corridor, jobs during construction and those retained or brought to Hamilton because of LRT, and the costs of not doing LRT;

And Whereas achieving LRT for Hamilton is a long-term project, expected to evolve a period of 5-15 years with opportunities for incremental rapid transit improvements along the way, toward the ultimate LRT goal;

And Whereas achieving GO Transit is of the utmost importance to Hamilton in the short term, and appears to be supported by Metrolinx and the Province of Ontario, yet need not preclude the ongoing preparation of the case for LRT over the longer term.

Therefore Be It Resolved:

- (a) That Council re-affirm its position in support of pursuing a full investigation of LRT over time;
- (b) That a second phase of funding from Metrolinx be requested, ensuring that Hamilton can continue to prepare its case for LRT.
- (c) That Council provide affirmation that pursuit of all-day GO Transit service, including stations at James Street North and Centennial Parkway, be of the highest priority in the short term.

(h) DISCUSSION AGENDA

On a motion, the rules of order were waived to allow for discussion of Report CM11014 respecting 2008-2011 Strategic Plan Annual Report.

On a motion, Report CM11014 respecting 2008-2011 Strategic Plan Annual Report was lifted from the table.

See Item 2 for the disposition of this item.

There being no further business, the Committee adjourned at 3:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted

Councillor J. Partridge
Deputy Mayor

Carolyn Biggs, Co-ordinator
Committee Services/Council/Budgets
October 13, 2011