Chair French welcomed Stan Nowak, the newly appointed member to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee.

1. **CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

   The Clerk advised of the following changes:

   (a) Added Item 8.1 which is a request from the Joint Plaquing Subcommittee for suggestions on properties which should be presented with a plaque;

   (b) Added Item 10.4 respecting the heritage Property Recognition Awards, copies have been distributed

   Also copies of Items 3.2, 5.1, 5.3, 6.2.3, 6.2.4 and 6.2.5 have been distributed.
(Adkins/Wakeman)
That the agenda be approved as amended.

CARRIED

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)
None declared.

3. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 3)

(i) John Ariens of IBI Group respecting 437 Wilson Street Ancaster (Wynnstay Estate, formerly Dalley Estate, presently Mount Mary Immaculate). (Approved November 26, 2009) (Item 3.1)

John Ariens of IBI Group and Sister Pat Lacey, Superior Administrator of Mount Mary Immaculate addressed Committee expressing concerns with the recommended easement on the property. They explained that the Sisters have taken great pride and care of the property which they have owned for 64 years. The heritage components which are situated on the easterly side of the property are not at risk as the proposed development is on the westerly portion of the property.

John Ariens noted that when the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee considered a petition requesting that the site be designated the Committee endorsed the petition without inviting or consulting the Sisters. The concern is that if the Sisters wish to sell, then potential uses may require renovations which an easement may impede. He requested that the easement not be placed on the entire property but on blocks of land as development is being proposed.

Sister Pat Lacey advised that she is before Committee on behalf of the congregation of Mount Mary Immaculate to express concerns with the heritage designation as the property is expensive to maintain. She explained that they are an aging congregation and they had hoped that the property would provide for their future. In response to questions posed by the Committee, Sister Lacey indicated that no one had every approached them to explain how designation would affect their future plans for the property.

Chair French advised that the easement has never been a matter brought forward before the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee. It was before the Committee of Adjustment. John Ariens confirmed that the purchaser, Landmark, which is to take title of the development portion of the property had applied for a severance. He had
understood that the easement was endorsed by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee. Chair French explained that the Heritage Committee only endorsed the petition requesting designation. The Committee can only advise on these matters. This is a planning issue.

David Cuming advised that the development of the subject lands was initiated in 2003 when the proponent submitted a draft plan of subdivision for the entire property and was required to retain Nina Chapple to prepare a Cultural Heritage Assessment. Staff assumed that the consultant would have explained the findings of their subconsultant to the Sisters, as their client, explaining the findings of heritage significance and the advice regarding designation. The planning consultants later submitted a severance application and heritage staff appeared before Committee of Adjustment to provide input and recommended a conservation easement as a condition of severance approval. This is a matter now under the Planning Act which identifies the preservation of heritage as a matter of provincial interest. Staff does not bring development applications or severance applications before the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee for comment.

(Pearson/Bratina)
That the delegation from John Ariens of IBI Group and Sister Pat Lacey be received.

CARRIED

(Adkins/Charlton)
That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee reaffirm its previous position with respect to 437 Wilson Street Ancaster (Wynnstay Estate, formerly Dalley Estate, presently Mount Mary Immaculate) in that it is supportive of the property being designated under the Ontario Heritage Act, as outlined in Item 7.1 of the September 24, 2009 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Minutes.

CARRIED

(ii) Gage Park MasterPlan (S. Barnhart, Supervisor, Landscape Architectural Services – PowerPoint hand-outs to be distributed). (Item 3.2)

Steve Barnhart made a PowerPoint presentation and distributed a hand-out. His presentation outlined the proposed changes to Gage Park and he responded to questions posed by the Committee, as follows:
Will the Gage House be reused? (Yes.)
Will the hard surfaces (pathways, etc.) be plowed? (Yes to ensure accessibility.)
How will this impact on large festivals? (Protective measures will be required to balance the landscape with the events.)
Will the band shell be retained? (Yes.)

(Pearson/Adkins)
That the PowerPoint presentation by Steve Barnhart respecting the Gage Park Master Plan be received.

CARRIED

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(Charlton/McHattie)
That the Minutes of the January 28, 2010 meeting, of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)

(a) Policy & Design Sub-Committee Report respecting updated Heritage Impact Assessment, ORC Class Environmental Assessment Category B, West 5th Campus, Hamilton (Item 5.1)

(i) Responses received from the Ontario Realty Corporation with respect to the comments submitted by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on October 28, 2009 (Item 5.1(a))

(ii) Comments/Motion approved by the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee on October 22, 2009 (Item 5.1(b))

Chair French relinquished the Chair and Vice Chair Denham-Robinson assumed the Chair.

Chair French provided a brief overview of the Report from the Policy and Design Sub-Committee. A short discussion followed on how this might impact the timelines of St. Joseph’s HealthCare.
(Wakeman/Denham Robinson)
That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee endorse the Report of the Policy and Design Sub-Committee as follows:

After review of the September 2008 Heritage Impact Assessment ("HIA"), the Municipal Heritage Committee’s Resolution of October 22nd, 2009, Ms. Ellen Kowalchuk’s (Ontario Realty Corporation) e-mail to Ms. Ida Bediou (City Staff), dated November 9th, 2009, Mr. David Cuming’s (City Staff) response e-mail, dated November 11th, 2009 and the updated HIA, dated January 27th, 2010, the sub-committee advises as follows:

(i) The formatting of the addendum is confusing, specifically, Table 1, entitled, Degree of Heritage Impact, discusses Options 1 – 6, however, the attachments are demarcated A – E, E-1, F and G. There also appears to be a different option attached at the end of the addendum that is not demarcated nor discussed. Therefore, it is unclear as to what the preferred option is for the proponent.

(ii) The full impact of the development is not discussed. It is unclear if a Conservation Plan or Vegetation Management Plan will be undertaken.

(iii) The addendum does not discuss the rationale for the loss of Hickory House. If Hickory House is proposed to be demolished, the sub-committee would at the very least like to see Gateview and Grove Hall retained and incorporated into the proposal.

(iv) As per the City of Hamilton’s Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment Guidelines, the addendum does not provide sufficient description of the effects upon the cultural heritage resources by the proposed development and/or site alteration and its alternative forms and has not provided a sufficient description of the measures necessary to mitigate the adverse effects of the development and/or site alteration and its alternatives upon the cultural heritage resources.

(v) Per the aforementioned parent committee resolution of October 22nd, 2009, the Ontario Realty Corporation made a commitment to conserve and protect certain features of the property in 2003 and that new development should be sympathetic to the character of the Cultural Heritage Landscape.
Therefore, the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee requests that the proponent submit an additional addendum that provides more coherent options, clearly states the preferred option of the proponent and provides more detailed mitigation measures with respect to the loss of any cultural heritage resources.

CARRIED

Vice-Chair Denham-Robinson relinquished the Chair and Chair French assumed the Chair.

(b) Book Marks – feedback from the Hamilton Library Board (Councillor M. Pearson – verbal update) (Item 5.2)

Councillor Pearson advised that she has no updates from the Library Board respecting the bookmarks.

The Chair indicated that Tourism Hamilton has the book marks for distribution.

(b) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year End Report (A. Denham-Robinson) (Item 5.3)

Alissa Denham-Robinson advised that the Year End Report is currently under final revision by Meghan House who is on vacation. This item was deferred to the next meeting.

6. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 6)

(a) Delegated Approvals (Item 6.1):

(i) Heritage Permit Application (Installation of new exterior signage in various locations throughout the City Hall site) 71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Hamilton City Hall, By-law No. 06-011 (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.1)

(ii) Heritage Permit Application (Door and Frame Restoration/Replacement) 600 York Boulevard, Hamilton, Dundurn Castle (Ward 1) (Item 6.1.2)

(iii) Heritage Permit Application (Wallpaper Removal) 600 York Boulevard, Hamilton, Dundurn Castle (Ward 1) (Item 6.1.3)
(iv) Heritage Permit Application (Cannon and Gate Restoration) 70 King Street West, Stoney Creek, Battlefield Cemetery – Smith’s Knoll (Ward 9) (Item 6.1.4)

(Adkins/Pearson)
That Items 6(a)(i) to 6(a)(iv) be received.

CARRIED

(b) Staff Reports/Recommendations (Item 6.2)
(i) Heritage Permit Application (HP2010-011) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for Alterations to 71 Main Street West, Hamilton (Hamilton City Hall) (Ward 2) (Item 6.2.1)

David Cuming provided a brief overview and explained that with respect to this application, the City is the owner/applicant and the approval authority. Staff’s recommendation is in disagreement with the recommendation of the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee.

The application is for the insertion of interactive information kiosks on the ground floor lobby of the Hamilton City Hall. The monitor pedal bases will be fastened to the terrazzo flooring. The Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee recommends denial of this application due to adverse impacts to the designated terrazzo flooring and to the overall character of the lobby space.

Anne Charlton added that further reasons why the Sub-Committee recommended denial is that the positioning interrupted the flow of the stair case and the advantages are limited as the kiosks are not wheel chair accessible, will probably only access the Hamilton website, and are very expensive.

(McHattie/Wakeman)
That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council that it supports the recommendation of the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee to deny Heritage Permit Application (HP2010-011).

CARRIED
(ii) Heritage Permit Application (HP2010-012) Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act for Alterations to 71 Main Street West, Hamilton (Hamilton City Hall) (Ward 2) (Item 6.2.2)

David Cuming explained that this application involves the City as the owner/applicant and as the approval authority and is for the installation of four exterior speakers on the stilts that support the Council Chambers of the Hamilton City Hall. The proposal affects a designated attribute but not displacement of the heritage materials as the marble cladding has been replaced with concrete panels.

The Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee and Heritage staff recommend denial due to the disruptive effects on the International Style of the building. Heritage staff suggests the speakers may be accommodated behind the railing on the balcony of the Council Chambers.

David Cuming advised that senior management staff has provided direction that seeks to maintain the speakers as a required feature for public events and agree with the location of the speakers proposed on the permit application.

The Committee agreed with the recommendation of the Sub-Committee as the proposed location of the speakers would make them very noticeable and the proposed method of installing them is permanent when the use will only be occasional. Also, the Committee noted that with the new technology available, the speakers do not need to be so large and there may be options available to disguise them.

(Charlton/Adkins)
That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council that it supports the recommendations of the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee to deny the Heritage Permit Application (HP2010-012) as there are other options to the installation of permanent speakers and suggests further investigation in the style of the speakers and their placement.

CARRIED
David Cuming indicated that these two reports will be included on the March 2, 2010 Economic Development and Planning Committee agenda and staff will include the Committee’s comments in the reports.

(iii) Heritage Permit Application (HP2009-042) Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act for Erection of Structure at 63 Mills Street South, Waterdown (Ward 15) (Item 6.2.3)

Joseph Muller provided a brief review of the report and advised that the application was recommended for approval by the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee.

(Adkins/Nowak)
That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council:

That Heritage Permit (HP2009-042) be approved for the erection of a new gazebo, installation of an in-ground swimming pool, new rear patio bar and barbeque, new fencing, new address plaque, partial paving of the driveway, new driveway gate, and grading and landscaping on the designated property at 63 Mill Street South (Mill Street Heritage Conservation District), Waterdown, subject to the following conditions:

(a) That the applicant shall provide City Planning staff with a grading plan for the portion of the property south of the driveway, to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning staff;

(b) That the applicant shall conduct an archaeological assessment in the portion of the property south of the driveway subject to grading, and in the portion of the property subject to the construction of the pool, hot-tub, and related infrastructure;

(c) That the applicant shall advise City Planning staff on the proposed sign and plaquing for the driveway gate, to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning staff;

(d) That the applicant shall advise City Planning staff on the proposed plantings and replacement tree(s), to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning staff;
(e) That the applicant shall advise City Planning staff on the style and extent of the driveway paver pattern proposed, to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning staff;

(f) That the applicant shall advise City Planning staff on the final design, materials and details for the rear patio, barbeque and bar, to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning staff;

(g) That the applicant shall advise City Planning staff of the final design, materials and details of the pool and hot-tub to be used, to the approval and satisfaction of City Planning staff; and,

(h) That this approval expires March 31, 2012.

CARRIED

(iv) Heritage Permit Application (HP2009-076) Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act for Erection of a Structure at 1026 Beach Boulevard, Hamilton (Ward 5) (Item 6.2.4)

Joseph Muller provided a brief review of the report and advised that the application was recommended for approval by the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee.

(Charlton/Adkins)
That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council:

That Heritage Permit (HP2009-076) be approved for the erection of a new single detached residence and attached garage, on the designated property at 1026 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton Beach Heritage Conservation District), Hamilton, subject to the following conditions:

(a) That previously approved Heritage Permit Application HP2003-010 shall be rescinded;

(b) That final plans and elevations showing materials and colours for roofing, siding, trim, windows, doors, and garage doors be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Heritage staff prior to construction; and,
(c) That this approval expires on March 31, 2012.  

CARRIED

(v) Heritage Permit Application (HP2009-005) Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act for Erection of Structures at 978 Beach Boulevard, Hamilton (Ward 5) (Item 6.2.5)

Joseph Muller provided a brief review of the report and advised that the application was recommended for approval by the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee.

(Adkins/Wakeman)

That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advise Council:

That Heritage Permit Application HP2010-005 be approved for the erection of a new single detached residence, and detached garage, on the designated property at 978 Beach Boulevard (Hamilton Beach Heritage Conservation District), Hamilton, subject to the following conditions:

(a) That final scaled and dimensioned plans and elevations, showing materials and colours for roofing, siding, trim, eaves, downspouts, vents, rails, pickets, columns, hardware, windows, doors, and garage doors be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Heritage staff prior to construction; and,

(b) That this approval expires on March 31, 2012.  

CARRIED

7. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS

None

8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)

(a) Request from the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee for suggestions for properties to receive plaques (Added Item 8.1) (M. Adkins-no copy)

Michael Adkins asked that anyone who has suggestions for properties to receive designation plaques to advise him or Kathy Wakeman and they will relay the suggestions to the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee.
A brief discussion followed respecting why there were no designations last year, the number of designated properties that have not as yet received plaques, and the cost of the plaques.

9. Buildings and Landscapes

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) **Treble Hall**, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – Councillor B. McHattie
    No updates.

(ii) **Lister Block**, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
    No updates.

(iii) **Auchmar**, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – G. Zajac
     No updates.

(iv) **Auchmar Gate House**, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) – M. Adkins
     No updates.

(v) **St. Marks**, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
     No updates.

(vi) **Tivoli**, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie
     No updates.

(vii) **Book House**, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton
     No updates.

(viii) **The Royal Connaught Hotel**, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins
     Michael Adkins advised that the Royal Connaught Hotel is looking more run down than before and its future looks less hopeful.
(ix) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton
No updates.

(x) 46 - 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene
No updates.

(xi) All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (L) - (A. Charlton)
No updates.

(xii) Grove Hall, Hickory House, Gateview, Century Manor and surrounding landscape, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (L)(R)(D)– (K. Wakeman)
No updates.

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Concern

(i) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins
No updates.

(ii) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton (R) – S. Nowak
No updates

(iii) Dundas Post Office, Dundas (L) - S. Nowak
Stan Nowak advised that the new owner of the Post Office, Heather Medeiros, has submitted an application for a rezoning to central commercial modified. She will be attending an upcoming community meeting in Dundas.

Stan Nowak agreed to monitor the Desjardins Canal and the Dundas Post Office on behalf of the Committee.

10. GENERAL INFORMATION

(a) Letter from Tim Fraser of T.A. Fraser & Associates Inc, Historic and Contemporary Building Rehabilitation and General Contracting. (Item 10.1)
(b) Hamilton Community Heritage Fund Loan Program Application (HCHF2009-003) for 108 James Street North, Hamilton (Tivoli Theatre) (PED09298) (Ward 2)) (Approved by Council December 9, 2009) (Item 10.2)

(c) Updated Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Contact List (distributed separately) (Item 10.3)

The Chair noted that Item 10.3 is to replace the outdated list in the Committee handbooks.

(d) 2009 Heritage Property Recognition Awards (Added Item 10.3) (A. French)

(Pearson/Adkins)
That Items 10(a) to 10(d) be received for information.

CARRIED

11. ADJOURNMENT

(Pearson/Charlton)
There being no further business, that the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting be adjourned at 1:55 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Art French, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Ida Bedioui
Legislative Assistant,
City Clerk’s Office
February 25, 2010